1 **Magnesium isotope evidence that accretional vapour loss shapes planetary**

2 **compositions**

- 3 Remco C. Hin¹, Christopher D. Coath¹, Philip J. Carter^{2,4}, Francis Nimmo³, Yi-Jen Lai^{1,5}, Philip A.E.
- 4 Pogge von Strandmann^{1,6}, Matthias Willbold^{1,7}, Zoë M. Leinhardt², Michael J. Walter¹, Tim Elliott¹
- *¹* 5 *School of Earth Sciences, University of Bristol, Wills Memorial Building, Queen's Road, Bristol BS8 1RJ, UK;* 6 *remco.hin@bristol.ac.uk*
- *²* 7 *School of Physics, University of Bristol, H. H. Wills Physics Laboratory, Tyndall Avenue, Bristol BS8 1TL, UK*
- *³* 8 *Department of Earth and Planetary Sciences, University of California Santa Cruz, Santa Cruz CA 95064, USA*
- *⁴* 9 *Now at: Department of Earth and Planetary Sciences, University of California Davis, One Shields Avenue, Davis CA 95616,* 10 *USA*
- *⁵* 11 *Now at: Macquarie University GeoAnalytical, Department of Earth and Planetary Sciences, Macquarie University, 12*
- 12 *Wally's Walk, Sydney NSW 2109, Australia*
- *⁶* 13 *Now at: London Geochemistry and Isotope Centre, Department of Earth Sciences, University College London, and*
- 14 *Department of Earth and Planetary Sciences, Birkbeck, University of London, Gower Street, London WC1E 6BT, UK*
- *⁷* 15 *Now at: Geowissenschaftliches Zentrum Göttingen (GZG), University of Göttingen, Goldschmidtstr. 1, 37077 Göttingen,* 16 *Germany*
- 17

18 **Introductory paragraph**

19 It has long been recognised that Earth and other differentiated planetary bodies are chemically 20 fractionated compared to primitive, chondritic meteorites and by inference the primordial disk from 21 which they formed. An important question has been whether the notable volatile depletions of 22 planetary bodies are a consequence of accretion¹, or inherited from prior nebular fractionation². The 23 isotopic compositions of the main constituents of planetary bodies can contribute to this debate³⁻⁶. 24 Using a new analytical approach to address key issues of accuracy inherent in conventional methods, 25 we show that all differentiated bodies have isotopically heavier magnesium compositions than 26 chondritic meteorites. We argue that possible magnesium isotope fractionation during condensation of 27 the solar nebula, core formation and silicate differentiation cannot explain these observations. 28 However, isotopic fractionation between liquid and vapour followed by vapour escape during 29 accretionary growth of planetesimals generates appropriate residual compositions. Our modelling 30 implies that the isotopic compositions of Mg, Si and Fe and the relative abundances of the major

31 elements of Earth, and other planetary bodies, are a natural consequence of substantial (~40% by 32 mass) vapour loss from growing planetesimals by this mechanism.

33

34 **Main text**

35 Magnesium is a fundamental building block of the terrestrial planets, constituting ~15% of Earth's 36 mass. Compared to the 'solar' composition of the primordial disk, it is well established that the Earth 37 is depleted in Mg by ~20% relative to more cosmochemically refractory elements (e.g. Al), consistent 38 with increasing terrestrial depletions of elements with higher volatility (e.g. ref [7]). Mass-dependent 39 isotopic fractionations of other major elements, Si and Fe, have been used to argue for compositional 40 modification by accretional vapour $loss^{3,6}$. Yet contrasting conclusions have been derived from similar 41 observations in studies that point to fractionations occurring for these elements during planetary 42 differentiation^{8,9}. In this respect, the isotopic composition of Mg may be better suited to interrogate 43 chemical fractionation in the Solar System⁵. However, detecting mass-dependent isotopic differences 44 between primitive chondrites and differentiated bodies poses significant analytical challenges because 45 only small (<<1‰/amu) fractionations typically occur during the high temperature processes (>1300 46 K) that shape planetary evolution. Indeed, various comparisons of terrestrial and chondritic Mg 47 isotope ratios have reached opposing conclusions as to whether or not the Earth is chondritic^{5,10-17}. 48 Much of the divergent opinion appears to stem from difficulties in achieving sufficiently accurate 49 measurements¹⁸.

50 In Figure 1a we illustrate that a number of different studies report chondritic ²⁵Mg^{/24}Mg ~0.03-51 0.05‰ lower than the Earth^{5,10-12}, but in only one case do the authors actually argue that the Earth is 52 . non-chondritic⁵. Reliable resolution of such small isotopic differences requires tight control on 53 analytical artefacts. Of particular concern is that samples and standards behave slightly differently 54 during analysis, despite prior purification. Unlike the traditional sample-standard bracketing approach, 55 the method of double-spiking explicitly corrects such behaviour, but it is not standard for elements 56 with only three stable isotopes, like magnesium. We have, therefore, developed a new approach of 57 "critical mixture double spiking" to overcome this problem¹⁹ (see Methods for details). Based on 58 propagation of conservative estimates of systematic error, this method has a limiting accuracy $59 \leq 0.005\%$ α mu¹⁹. Repeat measurements of solution standards and geological reference materials 60 indicate that we can achieve reproducibilities of $\pm 0.010\%$ (2se) for octuple measurements.

61 We have measured the Mg isotope compositions of a range of terrestrial rocks and primitive and 62 differentiated meteorites using critical mixture double spiking (Table 1). As shown in Figure 1b,c, our 63 new data substantiate that chondrites have $^{25}Mg^{24}Mg \sim 0.02\%$ lower than the differentiated Earth, 64 Mars, eucrite and angrite parent bodies.

65 Visual (Figure 1b) and statistical (see Methods) inspection shows some data scatter. For terrestrial 66 samples this is mostly due to two ocean island basalts (OIB), whose sources likely contain recycled 67 components, originally fractionated at Earth's surface. However, we focus on analyses of mantle 68 peridotites to estimate the composition of bulk Earth more robustly. Mg isotope variability among 69 chondrites is foremost within the carbonaceous group. This scatter is readily explained by variable 70 parent body aqueous alteration, as their $^{25}Mg^{24}Mg$ vary systematically with oxygen isotope 71 compositions²⁰ and petrographic class (Extended Data Figure 1) in the sense anticipated from 72 terrestrial weathering²¹. Removing these anomalous samples, we document a statistically significant 73 difference in Mg isotope compositions between chondrites and the variably-sized, differentiated 74 bodies of Earth, Mars and the eucrite parent body $(p_{AVOVA} 1.5 \times 10^{-6})$. If enstatite chondrites are 75 considered separately from other chondrites (p_{t-test} 0.017), their mean ²⁵Mg/²⁴Mg is also significantly 16 lighter than differentiated bodies (~0.013‰; p_{ANOVA} 7.8×10⁻⁴). In contrast, the differentiated bodies are 77 statistically indistinguishable from each other $(p_{ANOVA} 0.16)$.

78 The lack of systematic differences in $^{25}Mg^{24}Mg$ between melt-depleted harzburgites, fertile 19 lherzolites and mid-ocean ridge basalts reaffirm, at higher precision, previous observations¹² that Mg 80 isotopes do not fractionate discernibly during (ultra)mafic silicate differentiation (Figure 1, Table 1 81 and Extended Data Figure 2). Silicate differentiation is, therefore, not responsible for the relatively 82 heavy Mg isotope compositions of our samples of differentiated planetary bodies.

83 Although the difference in $^{25}Mg^{24}Mg$ between Earth and primitive meteorites is small, bulk 84 perturbation of such an abundant element requires the operation of planetary scale processes. Core 85 formation cannot account for this observation, because unlike Fe and Si, Mg only becomes siderophile 86 at temperatures too high for significant isotopic fractionation²². Vapour fractionation typically

87 produces larger isotopic differences than magmatic processes. Such fractionation may have occurred 88 during initial condensation of solids from the cooling proto-solar nebula, as has been invoked to 89 explain variability between meteoritic and planetary silicon isotope compositions⁴. Yet, such a model 90 predicts the low Mg/Si enstatite chondrites should have the lowest ²⁵Mg/²⁴Mg of the primitive 91 meteorites. This is inconsistent with our observations, in which enstatite chondrites have the 92 isotopically heaviest Mg of the anhydrous chondrites and the Earth, moreover, is distinct from 93 chondrites.

94 Instead, we propose that differentiated planetary bodies obtained their relatively heavy Mg isotope 95 compositions by vapour-melt fractionation following impacts during accretionary growth of 96 planetesimals. Loss of vapour, which was subsequently swept into the Sun or blown beyond the zone 97 of accretion, would leave residual planetary bodies isotopically heavy. Vapour loss is most effective 98 for bodies ≤ 0.1 Earth masses (M $_{\oplus}$) as escape velocities of larger bodies are mostly too high to be 99 exceeded by silicate vapour molecules (see Supplementary Information). We posit that vapour loss 100 signatures were abundantly imparted to small bodies in the inner Solar System, as evidenced by our 101 analyses of silicate achondrites (Figure 1b). Larger bodies like Earth dominantly accreted from such 102 vapour depleted planetesimals, thereby inheriting their signatures.

103 Although small bodies can readily lose vapour, low mutual impact velocities limit the amount of 104 vapour produced directly during these early stages of accretion. To investigate this quantitatively, we have post-processed the results of previously published, high-resolution N-body simulations²³ (see 106 Methods for details) using a parameterisation of impact-induced vaporisation⁴. In this model, 107 cumulative vapour produced increases from <1 to ~20% of a body's final mass for bodies from 10^{-4} to 108 10⁻¹ M $_{\oplus}$ (Figure 2a). As an alternative approach we have calculated vapour mass loss by direct 109 outflow of silicate vapour from the surface of impact-generated magma ponds/oceans (see 110 Supplementary Information for details). Although magma oceans may have been produced by 111 radiogenic heating (e.g. 26 Al decay), we conservatively focussed on converting impact velocities of the 112 same N-body simulations to energy available for melting/vapour outflow. We obtain cumulative

113 vapour mass losses of ~4-36% for bodies with 10^{-4} to 10^{-1} M $_{\oplus}$ final masses (Figure 2b). Given the 114 higher mass losses from smaller bodies in the second, magmatic scenario we focus on this process.

115 The outflow velocities of vapour above the magma ponds/oceans are sufficiently high that this 116 mechanism is not mass discriminative. This implies that isotopic fractionation only occurs during 117 production of vapour at the surface of the magma pond/ocean. We treat this as an equilibrium process 118 between a molten surface and transient atmosphere, as vapour-liquid chemical equilibrium is attained 119 rapidly²⁴. Furthermore, kinetic isotope fractionation in this scenario can be ruled out empirically from 120 consideration of marked effects on K isotope ratios that are unobserved in nature²⁵ (see Methods).

121 We have modelled Mg, Si and Fe equilibrium isotope fractionation between a liquid and vapour 122 with compositions calculated using thermodynamic data for a nine-component system of major and 123 minor elements of variable volatility (see Methods for details). To obtain a residual planetesimal with 124 a Mg isotope composition ~0.02‰ higher than our average chondritic value, our model predicts 125 ~0.30‰ and ~0.013‰ super-chondritic ${}^{30}Si/{}^{28}Si$ and ${}^{56}Fe/{}^{54}Fe$ (Figure 3a). These values are largely 126 compatible with the Earth (Figure 3) and several other bodies (Extended Data Figure 3), despite some 127 currently rather poorly constrained input parameters (see Methods); refinement of these values may 128 resolve these minor mismatches. Starting more specifically with an enstatite chondrite composition, as 129 thought most isotopically appropriate for Earth (e.g. ref [26]), ~47% of the body is vaporised and lost, 130 which removes ~14% of the initial Mg mass together with ~65% Si, ~48% Fe and >99.9% of Na and 131 K (Figure 3c). Similar total mass losses were deduced previously for Earth²⁷ from the volatilities of 132 major constituents based on a comparison to vaporisation experiments. The total mass losses inferred 133 from these chemical constraints (Figure 3) are reassuringly similar to those calculated from our 134 physical model of vapour loss (Figure 2b).

135 The predicted elemental losses modify the composition of enstatite chondrites into one similar to 136 the Earth's (Figure 3c,d), without requiring substantial, preferential collisional erosion of a putative 137 crust formed by small degrees melts of an undifferentiated body²⁸. Our modelled vapour-loss 138 modification resolves the conundrum that Earth's isotopic anomalies suggest a close genetic link to 139 enstatite chondrites despite vastly different elemental compositions²⁶. Close matches to Earth's 140 composition are also obtained, however, when starting with e.g. a CI chondrite composition (Extended

141 Data Figure 4). While potassium depletion relative to chondrites in eucrite (>94%) and angrite (>99%) 142 parent bodies²⁵ is comparable to our vapour depletion model results, it requires re-accretion of \sim 20% 143 chondritic material to match terrestrial alkali abundances. This material can be derived from the 144 distribution tail of bodies that escape melting and vapour loss.

145 Our vapour loss model quantitatively accounts for non-chondritic abundances and isotopic 146 compositions of major elements as a natural consequence of planetary accretion and provides a viable 147 mechanism for previous suggestions of the importance of evaporative losses in planetary

- 148 . evolution^{3,6,27,29}. This process inevitably results in dramatic loss of elements more volatile than Mg.
- 149 Planetary compositions thus intrinsically reflect their history of collisional formation.
- 150

151 **Main references**

152 1 Ringwood, A. E. Chemical Evolution of the Terrestrial Planets. *Geochim. Cosmochim. Acta* 153 **30**, 41-104, doi:10.1016/0016-7037(66)90090-1 (1966).

154 2 Anders, E. Chemical Processes in the Early Solar System, as Inferred from Meteorites. 155 *Accounts Chem Res* **1**, 289-298, doi:10.1021/ar50010a001 (1968).

- 156 3 Pringle, E. A., Moynier, F., Savage, P. S., Badro, J. & Barrat, J. A. Silicon isotopes in angrites 157 and volatile loss in planetesimals. *Proc. Natl. Acad. Sci., USA* **111**, 17029-17032, 158 doi:10.1073/pnas.1418889111 (2014).
- 159 4 Dauphas, N., Poitrasson, F., Burkhardt, C., Kobayashi, H. & Kurosawa, K. Planetary and 160 meteoritic Mg/Si and δ^{30} Si variations inherited from solar nebula chemistry. *Earth Planet. Sci.* 161 *Lett.* **427**, 236-248, doi:10.1016/j.epsl.2015.07.008 (2015).
- 162 5 Young, E. D., Tonui, E., Manning, C. E., Schauble, E. & Macris, C. A. Spinel-olivine 163 magnesium isotope thermometry in the mantle and implications for the Mg isotopic 164 composition of Earth. *Earth Planet. Sci. Lett.* **288**, 524-533, doi:10.1016/j.epsl.2009.10.014 165 (2009).
- 166 6 Poitrasson, F., Halliday, A. N., Lee, D. C., Levasseur, S. & Teutsch, N. Iron isotope 167 differences between Earth, Moon, Mars and Vesta as possible records of contrasted accretion 168 mechanisms. *Earth Planet. Sci. Lett.* **223**, 253-266, doi:10.1016/j.epsl.2004.04.032 (2004).
- 169 7 Palme, H. & O'Neill, H. S. C. in *The Mantle and Core* Vol. 2 *Treatise on Geochemistry* (ed R. 170 W. Carlson) (Elsevier-Pergamon, 2003).
- 171 8 Weyer, S. & Ionov, D. A. Partial melting and melt percolation in the mantle: The message 172 from Fe isotopes. *Earth Planet. Sci. Lett.* **259**, 119-133, doi:10.1016/j.epsl.2007.04.033 173 (2007).
- 174 9 Georg, R. B., Halliday, A. N., Schauble, E. A. & Reynolds, B. C. Silicon in the Earth's core. 175 *Nature* **447**, 1102-1106, doi:10.1038/Nature05927 (2007).
- 176 10 Bourdon, B., Tipper, E. T., Fitoussi, C. & Stracke, A. Chondritic Mg isotope composition of 177 the Earth. *Geochim. Cosmochim. Acta* **74**, 5069-5083, doi:10.1016/j.gca.2010.06.008 (2010).
- 178 11 Pogge von Strandmann, P. A. E. *et al.* Variations of Li and Mg isotope ratios in bulk 179 chondrites and mantle xenoliths. *Geochim. Cosmochim. Acta* **75**, 5247-5268, 180 doi:10.1016/j.gca.2011.06.026 (2011).
- 181 12 Teng, F. Z. *et al.* Magnesium isotopic composition of the Earth and chondrites. *Geochim.* 182 *Cosmochim. Acta* **74**, 4150-4166, doi:10.1016/j.gca.2010.04.019 (2010).
- 183 13 Wiechert, U. & Halliday, A. N. Non-chondritic magnesium and the origins of the inner 184 terrestrial planets. *Earth Planet. Sci. Lett.* **256**, 360-371, doi:10.1016/j.epsl.2007.01.007 185 (2007).
- 186 14 Bizzarro, M. *et al.* High-precision Mg-isotope measurements of terrestrial and extraterrestrial 187 material by HR-MC-ICPMS–implications for the relative and absolute Mg-isotope 188 composition of the bulk silicate Earth. *J. Anal. At. Spectrom.* **26**, 565-577, 189 doi:10.1039/C0ja00190b (2011).
- 190 15 Handler, M. R., Baker, J. A., Schiller, M., Bennett, V. C. & Yaxley, G. M. Magnesium stable 191 isotope composition of Earth's upper mantle. *Earth Planet. Sci. Lett.* **282**, 306-313, 192 doi:10.1016/j.epsl.2009.03.031 (2009).
- 193 16 Chakrabarti, R. & Jacobsen, S. B. The isotopic composition of magnesium in the inner Solar 194 System. *Earth Planet. Sci. Lett.* **293**, 349-358, doi:10.1016/j.epsl.2010.03.001 (2010).
- 195 17 Yang, W., Teng, F. Z. & Zhang, H. F. Chondritic magnesium isotopic composition of the 196 terrestrial mantle: A case study of peridotite xenoliths from the North China craton. *Earth* 197 *Planet. Sci. Lett.* **288**, 475-482, doi:10.1016/j.epsl.2009.10.009 (2009).
- 198 18 Teng, F. Z. *et al.* Interlaboratory comparison of magnesium isotopic compositions of 12 felsic 199 to ultramafic igneous rock standards analyzed by MC-ICPMS. *Geochem. Geophy. Geosy.* **16**, 200 3197-3209, doi:10.1002/2015gc005939 (2015).
- 201 19 Coath, C. D., Elliott, T. & Hin, R. C. Double-spike inversion for three-isotope systems. *Chem.* 202 *Geol.* **451**, 78-89, doi:10.1016/j.chemgeo.2016.12.025 (2017).
- 203 20 Clayton, R. N. & Mayeda, T. K. The oxygen isotope record in Murchison and other 204 carbonaceous chondrites. *Earth Planet. Sci. Lett.* **67**, 151-161, doi:10.1016/0012- 205 821x(84)90110-9 (1984).
- 206 21 Tipper, E. T. *et al.* The magnesium isotope budget of the modern ocean: Constraints from 207 riverine magnesium isotope ratios. *Earth Planet. Sci. Lett.* **250**, 241-253, 208 doi:10.1016/j.epsl.2006.07.037 (2006).
- 209 22 O'Rourke, J. G. & Stevenson, D. J. Powering Earth's dynamo with magnesium precipitation 210 from the core. *Nature* **529**, 387-389, doi:10.1038/nature16495 (2016).
- 211 23 Carter, P. J., Leinhardt, Z. M., Elliott, T., Walter, M. J. & Stewart, S. T. Compositional 212 Evolution during Rocky Protoplanet Accretion. *Astrophys. J.* **813**, doi:10.1088/0004- 213 637x/813/1/72 (2015).
- 214 24 Fegley, B. & Schaefer, L. in *The atmosphere History* Vol. 6 *Treatise on Geochemistry* (ed J. 215 Farquhar) Ch. 6.3, 406 (Elsevier, 2013).
- 216 25 Humayun, M. & Clayton, R. N. Potassium isotope cosmochemistry: Genetic implications of 217 volatile element depletion. *Geochim. Cosmochim. Acta* **59**, 2131-2148, doi:10.1016/0016- 218 7037(95)00132-8 (1995).
- 219 26 Javoy, M. *et al.* The chemical composition of the Earth: Enstatite chondrite models. *Earth* 220 *Planet. Sci. Lett.* **293**, 259-268, doi:10.1016/j.epsl.2010.02.033 (2010).
- 221 27 Young, E. D. Assessing the implications of K isotope cosmochemistry for evaporation in the 222 preplanetary solar nebula. *Earth Planet. Sci. Lett.* **183**, 321-333, doi:10.1016/S0012- 223 821x(00)00276-4 (2000).
- 224 28 Boujibar, A., Andrault, D., Bolfan-Casanova, N., Bouhifd, M. A. & Monteux, J. 225 Cosmochemical fractionation by collisional erosion during the Earth's accretion. *Nature* 226 *Communications* **6**, doi:10.1038/ncomms9295 (2015).
- 227 29 Pringle, E. A. & Moynier, F. Rubidium isotopic composition of the Earth, meteorites, and the 228 Moon: Evidence for the origin of volatile loss during planetary accretion. *Earth Planet. Sci.* 229 *Lett.* **473**, 62-70, doi:10.1016/j.epsl.2017.05.033 (2017).
- 230 30 Walsh, K. J., Morbidelli, A., Raymond, S. N., O'Brien, D. P. & Mandell, A. M. Populating the 231 asteroid belt from two parent source regions due to the migration of giant planets–"The Grand 232 Tack". *Meteorit. Planet. Sci* **47**, 1941-1947, doi:10.1111/j.1945-5100.2012.01418.x (2012).
- 233 31 Wasson, J. T. & Kallemeyn, G. W. Compositions of Chondrites. *Philos T Roy Soc A* **325**, 535- 234 544 (1988).
- 235
- 236
- 237 **Acknowledgements**

238 We thank the Natural History Museum in London, NASA, Oliver Nebel, Dmitri Ionov, Sune 239 Nielsen, Eiichi Takazawa, Ken Sims, Yaoling Niu, Richard Brooker, Cynthia Robinson for supplying 240 us with a variety of samples. We acknowledge Carver Bierson for his help with direct outflow vapour 241 loss modelling. This study was funded by NERC grant NE/L007428/1 to TE, CDC and MJW, which 242 was motivated by NE/C0983/1. ERC Adv Grant 321209 ISONEB further supported the work of TE 243 and CDC. NERC grant NE/K004778/1 to ZL funded PC.

244

245 **Author contributions**

246 All data presented were measured by RH. RH and CDC performed vapour-liquid modelling. PC 247 was responsible for calculations relating to N-body simulations, FN modelled the direct outflow 248 vapour loss mechanism. RH and TE wrote the manuscript. CDC, YJL, PPvS and MW were involved 249 in measurements in the initial stages of this study. All authors read and commented on the manuscript. 250

251 **Author Information**

252 Reprints and permissions information is available at www.nature.com/reprints. The authors declare 253 no competing financial interests. Correspondence and requests for materials should be addressed to 254 remco.hin@bristol.ac.uk.

255

256 *Figure captions*

257 Figure 1. Magnesium isotope compositions. a) Probability density plots of Mg isotope 258 compositions from previous standard-sample bracketing work, highlighting the results of individual 259 studies^{5,10-12} that presented numerous analyses of both terrestrial and chondritic samples using the 260 same methodology. These data show systematic subtle differences (0.02-0.05‰) between the Earth 261 and primitive meteorites. Typically authors refrained from interpreting such small differences. b) 262 Samples from this study (measured by critical mixture double spiking) ordered according to sample-263 type. Lines and shaded bars indicate means and 2se. Samples displayed with pale symbols are 264 excluded from means (see main text). c) Earth and chondrite analyses from b) shown as probability 265 plot to compare with a).

266

267 Figure 2. Median cumulative vapour fractions produced as a function of final planetary mass (in 268 Earth masses M_{\oplus}) determined from high-resolution N-body simulations of planetary accretion²³. The 269 N-body simulations encompassed two scenarios: a calm disk without gas drag ("calm") and a disk that 270 is disturbed by a Grand Tack motion of Jupiter³⁰ ("GT"). a) Vapour loss fractions calculated for 271 impact vaporisation parameterised to impact velocity⁴. b) Vapour loss fractions produced by direct 272 outflow above exposed magma ponds/oceans. In a Grand Tack scenario, Jupiter's motions cause 273 higher eccentricities and hence higher impact velocities for such small bodies, which explains their 274 high vapour fractions.

275

276 Figure 3. Comparison between modelled compositions of a vapour depleted liquid and observed 277 terrestrial compositions. a) Changes in isotope compositions (‰/amu) against total relative vapour 278 loss (*F_{Total*}, in mole fractions) calculated in our model. b) Observed terrestrial Mg (this study), and Si 279 (from [4] and references therein) isotope compositions relative to enstatite chondrites (EH). Errors are 280 2se. c) Loss (mole fraction) of a given element (X) , f_X , versus F_{Total} . d) Molar element/Ca of the 281 terrestrial mantle⁷, normalised to EH^{31} . Shaded bands give error bounds for F_{Total} inferred from Mg 282 isotope data and the intersection of different curves with this field indicates the range of terrestrial 283 depletions predicted for our vapour loss model. Comparison of these values to those calculated for the 284 Earth relative to an enstatite chondrite starting composition (b and d) is generally good, despite 285 uncertainties in model input parameters (see Methods) and additional influences on observed values 286 from nebular and core formation processes^{4,9}. Left pointing arrows show the effect of post-volatile loss 287 accretion of 20% chondrite (EH).

288

289

290 **Methods**

291 *Chemical and analytical protocols, and data statistics*

292 Powdered samples were digested in cleaned Savillex PFA beakers with 3:1 ultra-pure ~15.5M 293 HNO₃ and \sim 28M HF. Prior to drying, \sim 0.5 ml 7M HClO₄ was added to prevent precipitation of 294 insoluble fluorides. At this stage, insoluble chromites were visible in some peridotites. They were 295 separated from the supernatant and further digested in high-pressure acid digestion vessels (Anton 296 Paar Asher) before being re-combined with the rest of the digested sample. Similarly, graphite 297 precipitates were removed from enstatite chondrites by transferring the samples into pre-cleaned BN 298 crucibles that were placed in a muffle furnace at 600 °C, making use of the phase transition of graphite 299 to CO2 under these conditions. Following complete digestion, any remaining organic components were 300 attacked with \sim 15.5M HNO₃ and 30% H₂O₂. Terrestrial samples generally weighed 2-15 mg, while 301 larger meteorite samples were dissolved (~7-150 mg, majority 60-100 mg; see Extended Data Table 1) 302 to obtain representative samples.

303 Magnesium was separated from the sample matrix with a Biorad AG50W-X12 cationic exchange 304 resin and 2M HNO₃ eluent as described previously¹¹. Yields were monitored and were >99.85% for all 305 analysed samples. Following separation, samples were dissolved in 0.3M HNO₃ and critically double 306 spiked (see below) for analyses on a Thermo Finnigan Neptune (s/n 1020) multi-collector inductively 307 coupled plasma mass spectrometer (MC-ICPMS). A Savillex PFA nebuliser (30-40 μl min⁻¹ uptake) 308 aspirated the sample solution into an Elemental Scientific Inc. Apex HF introduction system prior to 309 ionisation in the plasma. A combination of Jet sampler and H skimmer cones was used and Mg masses 310 24, 25 and 26 were collected in cups L4, centre and H4, respectively. The Neptune was further 311 operated in medium resolution mode ($M/\Delta M \ge 4000$, 5-95% peak height definition) with an off-peak 312 centre mass $(^{25}Mg$ mass 24.979 instead of 24.986) to resolve any minor possible $^{12}C^{14}N^+$ interferences 313 on ²⁶Mg⁺. However, these interferences should be insignificant as they were observed to be only ~15 314 ppm of the $26Mg^{+}$ signal. This medium resolution mode also improved signal-to-noise ratios, reducing 315 total background signals to $\langle 2 \times 10^{-13}$ A. A 10^{11} Ω feedback resistor was used in the amplifier 316 connected to the centre cup, while 10^{10} Ω resistors were used on L4 and H4. Total Mg intensities of 317 \sim 2×10⁻⁹ A were measured at total Mg concentrations of ~2.5 µg ml⁻¹ for 168 s integration (20 cycles of 318 8.4 s), consuming \sim 185 ng sample Mg per analysis in double-spiked samples.

319 A measurement sequence typically consisted of analysis of a mixture of double spike and DSM-3 320 reference standard followed by three sample – double-spike mixtures, repeating until all samples were 321 measured before starting this series again to make duplicate analyses of samples. Normally, double-322 spike – sample mixture measurements were repeated four times per sequence, in which a total of 9-17 323 samples were measured. Sequences were repeated in different analysis sessions over the course of the 324 study to yield at least 8 repeated analyses of each double-spike – sample mixture. All sample and 325 standard analyses were preceded by a 240 s wash-out and an on-peak background measurement (168 s 326 integration). The mean intensities of the latter were subtracted from the intensities of the sample or

327 standard analysis that followed it. Additionally, three analyses of unspiked DSM-3 (the concentration 328 matched to the double-spike – sample mixtures) were performed before, after and in the middle of the 329 sequence of double-spike – sample (or standard) mixtures. A 15 minute wash-out was performed 330 between these unspiked and spiked analyses because the Mg isotope composition of the background 331 greatly changes as a consequence of switching between spiked and unspiked analyses, which makes 332 critical mixture double spiking more prone to added variability due to background corrections. In our 333 analyses, background corrections usually affected the reported isotope compositions by <0.0005‰, 334 which is well below the uncertainties of 0.008-0.010‰. Sequences typically took ~10-20 hours.

335 Interferences by hydrides (i.e. ²⁴MgH⁺ on ²⁵Mg⁺ and ²⁵MgH⁺ on ²⁶Mg⁺), which are difficult to fully 336 resolve, as well background Mg intensities were reduced by using a -1 kV extraction voltage instead 337 of the default -2 kV. We observed that such a change in the extraction voltage reduces background 338 ²⁴MgH⁺ and ²⁵MgH⁺ intensities by ~10 times, i.e. ~500 cps ²⁴MgH⁺ in medium resolution. 339 Simultaneously, the change in extraction voltage lowers background Mg intensities by ~4-5 times, 340 while sample sensitivity is only reduced by <20%. Applying an extraction weaker than -1 kV further 341 decreases backgrounds, but increasingly lowers sensitivity. We interpret these effects as evidence that 342 the background signals are dominantly produced by liberation (with/without hydride) of Mg deposited 343 at the back of the skimmer cone. This hypothesis is substantiated by the fact that progressively 344 increasing Mg background intensities can be lowered by brief cleaning of the back of the skimmer 345 cone with a droplet of dilute $HNO₃$. Moreover, background Mg isotope compositions are extremely 346 light after mass bias correction with the same instrumental fractionation factor as for sample Mg, 347 suggesting additional mass fractionation. Finally, we observed that hydride intensities increase over 348 background only ~75 fold when Mg intensities are increased ~25'000 fold by introducing sample Mg. 349 We thus estimate that the largest relative hydride intensity contribution to Mg (24 MgH⁺/ 25 Mg⁺) is ~13 350 ppm. Since we externally normalise samples to intensity matched DSM-3 standards (see *Critical* 351 *mixture double spiking* below), these hydride contributions are reduced to such small levels that they 352 do not affect our reported isotope compositions.

353 Data in Table 1 are reported as relative differences of isotope ratios to the reference solution 354 standard $DSM-3^{32}$ in delta notation following IUPAC recommendations³³: 355 $\delta^{25/24}Mg = \left(\left(\frac{25}{Mg} \right)^{24}Mg \right)_{Sample} \left/ \left(\frac{25}{Mg} \right)^{24}Mg \right)_{DSM-3} - 1$. The data are presented in per mil and 356 represent means of repeated analyses. Reported uncertainties are standard error of the mean (*2se*) 357 calculated as $2s/\sqrt{n}$ in which *n* is the number of repeated analyses for the corresponding sample. 358 Instead of using the standard deviation (*s*) of a geological reference material (e.g. BHVO-2, *2s* = 359 0.029‰, *n* = 60 from 3 digestions), we determined *s* by a homoscedastic approach, pooling over all 360 standards and samples³⁴. That is, after determining the sums of the squared deviations of *n* repeated 361 measurements from their *m* sample (and standard) means, these sums were themselves summed before

dividing by the degrees of freedom (*k*): $s^2 = \frac{1}{l} \sum \sum (x_{ij} - \overline{x}_i)$ 2 2 $-1 \quad j=1$ $1 \sum_{i=1}^m \sum_{i=1}^n$ $\mu_{ij} - \lambda_{ij}$ $i=1$ *j* $s^2 = \frac{1}{l} \sum_i \sum_i (x_{ii} - \overline{x})$ $=\frac{1}{k}\sum_{i=1}^{k}\sum_{j=1}^{k} (x_{ij}-\overline{x}_i)$ with $k=\bigg(\sum_{i=1}^{k}$ *m i i* $k = \sum_{i=1}^n n_i$ | $-m$ 362 dividing by the degrees of freedom (k): $s^2 = \frac{1}{k} \sum_{i=1}^{m} \sum_{j=1}^{n_i} (x_{ij} - \overline{x}_i)^2$ with $k = \left(\sum_{i=1}^{m} n_i\right) - m$. We obtained

363 $2s = 0.029\%$ $(k = 693)$ and have found justification in using this scheme because the *n* repeats of *m* 364 samples and standards passed the null hypothesis of a Bartlett's test, i.e. the *m* samples and standards 365 come from normal distributions with the same variance.

366 Group means (e.g. Earth) and their *2se* uncertainties are calculated directly from the relevant 367 sample data in Table 1. Significances of group mean differences were determined with a one-way 368 Analysis of Variance (one-way ANOVA) or a two sample Student's t-test, again using the relevant 369 data in Table 1. Within group differences were investigated with one-way ANOVA using sample 370 repeat measurements.

371

372 *Critical mixture double spiking*

373 The analysis routine described above is broadly similar to previous studies performed by standard-374 sample bracketing. Our contribution to addressing previously observed inter-laboratory 375 inconsistencies¹⁸ resides in the novelty of adding a double-spike prior to mass-spectrometric analysis. 376 As detailed elsewhere¹⁹, this technique of "critical mixture double spiking" corrects for mass bias 377 effects of residual matrix, eliminating the most plausible cause for the inter-laboratory inconsistencies. 378 It helps ensure that analyses are not only precise, but also accurate to within the quoted precision. In 379 practice, we dissolved ²⁵MgO and ²⁶MgO spikes (purchased from Oak Ridge National Laboratory, 380 batch numbers 217201 and 158690, respectively) and mixed them to produce a double spike with $2^{4,25,26}$ Mg abundances of 0.30%, 6.27%, 93.43%, approximating those for an accuracy optimised 382 scenario $(0\%, 8.4\%, 91.6\%, respectively^{19})$. We calibrated this double-spike to reference solution 383 standard DSM-3 following our suggested protocol¹⁹.

384 After ion exchange chemistry, we aliquoted a weight of separated Mg sufficient for at least 10 runs 385 and mixed this with a weighed amount of double-spike estimated to yield a molar spike proportion of 386 0.5908 in the mixture. This is the critical mixing proportion for our double-spike composition. Prior to 387 analysis, double-spike – sample mixtures were equilibrated at 100 °C for 2-3 h in closed Savillex PFA 388 autosampler vials. Subsequently, all samples were analysed once by MC-ICPMS in a short sequence 389 to determine their deviation from the critical spike proportion. At this stage, the mixtures were rarely 390 within our acceptable bound of ±0.5% molar proportion from critical. Based on the documented 391 sample and double-spike weights and the observed double-spike proportion, either sample or double-392 spike was added to the mixtures, followed by another short analysis sequence. At this stage most 393 mixtures were found to be within 0.5% from critical.

An estimate of the instrumental mass bias is required for critical mixture double spiking¹⁹. We 395 obtained this estimate from the unspiked DSM-3 analyses in the analysis sequence by dividing the 396 measured ^{25/24}Mg by the reference ^{25/24}Mg of 0.12663³⁵. Although this can also be done on ^{26/24}Mg, we 397 find that $25/24$ Mg is a more reproducible indicator of mass bias because it is less affected by incomplete

398 wash-out due to the smaller contrast between the unspiked and spiked ratios. These instrumental mass 399 bias factors were linearly or quadratically interpolated based on the evolution of DSM-3 – double-400 spike mixtures to obtain a close mass bias approximation for the sample – double-spike mixtures. 401 Once the mass bias estimate was obtained, the analyses were run through a double-spike inversion 402 routine, followed by a normalisation of sample isotope compositions to DSM-3 isotope compositions 403 (obtained from double-spike – DSM-3 mixtures) to correct for residual non-exponential mass 404 fractionation in the instrument.

405 Our observations are that the mass bias rarely varies by >0.5‰/amu during a 20 h sequence and 406 that this variation tends to be characterized by a smooth evolution. Therefore, we conservatively 407 estimate that the interpolated mass bias is accurate to ≤0.25‰/amu. Combined with our criterion of 408 double-spike proportions being ≤0.5% from critical, we calculate that our Mg isotope compositions 409 should be accurate to better than 0.005‰ on $25\text{Mg}/24\text{Mg}^{19}$. Note that this accuracy estimate is distinct 410 from the reported uncertainty, which is determined from the scatter of replicates.

411 We have also analysed USGS geological reference material BHVO-2 with a deviation from a 412 critical spike proportion of -1% (overspiked) and +1% (underspiked). The means of these samples 413 are -0.092±0.007‰ and -0.090±0.007‰, respectively. They are hence not significantly different at 414 this level of precision, giving further confidence that our $\pm 0.5\%$ mixing bound is sufficiently tight for 415 accurate results.

416 Previously published data measured on key reference samples scatter beyond their *2se* 417 uncertainties¹⁸. Assuming sample homogeneity, this scatter highlights the distinction between 418 accuracy and precision, which cannot be assessed separately in the traditional standard-sample 419 bracketing procedure used by those studies. Whilst some of the data may thus appear precise, they can 420 still be inaccurate. In contrast, we have assessed that our new critical double spiking technique should 421 be accurate within our quoted precision. Hence, application of our technique should reduce the scatter 422 in potential future studies from that observed in Extended Data Figure 5 to within the error bounds of 423 the isotope ratios found in this study, assuming sample homogeneity. Nonetheless, much of the 424 literature data has $\delta^{25/24}$ *Mg* consistent with our critically double spiked measurements at a ±0.25‰ 425 level (Extended Data Figure 5).

426

427 *N-body collisional accretion simulations*

428 Our N-body collisional accretion simulations have previously been published²³ and the reader is 429 referred to the original publication for model details. These simulations were ideally suited for our 430 investigations because they included growth of planetary bodies from ~10⁻⁴ to ~10⁻¹ M $_{\oplus}$ with 431 imperfect accretion. We used two different modes of the high resolution simulations²³, which include 432 i) a calm disk, and ii) the Grand Tack³⁰. Whilst we did not modify the simulations in any manner, we 433 extracted additional information (notably impact parameters) to compute accretional vapour loss by 434 two different mechanisms.

435 *1. Impact vaporisation*

436 This information was obtained following published vapour fraction equations (assuming molten 437 basalt)⁴. The equations enabled determining vapour mass (M_{vap}) as a fraction of the impactor mass 438 *(* M_{imp} *)* in each collision. The vapour mass fraction in each collision (f_{vap}) was calculated from the 439 impact velocity and angle (*vimp* and *θ*), which we have obtained from the N-body simulations 440 (correcting for the expanded radii that were used in these simulations to increase the collision rate): $f_{vap} = M_{vap} (v_{imp} \sin \theta) / M_{imp}$. The vapour fraction in each collision was subsequently integrated 442 over all collisions a body experienced, taking into account that each planetesimal has its own 443 collisional history, to obtain the fraction of material that experienced impact induced volatilisation relative to the total mass of a body: $F = (1/M) \int_{v_{\alpha D}} (v_{\mu\nu}) \sin \theta$ 0 $1/M$) $\int_{\mathcal{V}^{an}} (v_{\text{imp}} \sin$ *M F =* $(1/M) \int f_{vap} (v_{imp} \sin \theta) dm$. This equation is modified from

445 the original⁴ by replacing the $v_{esc}(m)$ term, which was a proxy for impact velocity, by the impact 446 velocities (*vimp*) obtained in our N-body simulations. This replacement resulted in higher volatilisation 447 fractions in our study compared to Dauphas et al.⁴, particularly for the Grand Tack simulation in which 448 higher impact velocities occur due to dynamical excitation by Jupiter's migration. We obtained Figure 2 by binning the results for *F* in groups of masses (relative to Earth's mass M_{\oplus}) in each of the two 450 simulation modes.

451

452 *2. Vapour mass loss by direct outflow above exposed magma ponds*

453 *Summary:* The overall picture is as follows. We use the impact information from the N-body 454 collisional accretion simulations and let each impact generate a hemispheric pool of melt. Vapour 455 forms above the melt pool, with a pressure determined by the melt pool temperature. The melt vapour 456 escapes at a rate determined by its temperature and the gravity of the body. The melt pool is assumed 457 to be convecting vigorously, keeping it isothermal, and it cools from the surface due to evaporation 458 and radiative heat transfer. As the melt cools, the vapour pressure drops and the vapour mass loss rate 459 decreases until it effectively stops.

460 This overall behaviour is described by an energy equation as follows:

461
$$
mC_p \dot{T} = \dot{m} \left(\frac{GM}{R_s} + L_v \right) + A\sigma T_{\text{eff}}^4 \tag{1}
$$

462 where the left-hand side denotes the energy source (secular cooling of the melt pool) and the right-463 hand side denotes the energy sinks (evaporative cooling, gravitational potential energy and radiative heat transfer). Here *m* is the mass of the melt pool, C_p is its specific heat capacity, \dot{T} is the cooling 465 rate of the melt pool, \dot{m} is the vapour mass loss rate, M is the mass of the body, R_s is its radius, G is the gravitational coefficient, L_v is the latent heat of vaporization, σ is Stefan's constant, T_{eff} is the effective radiating temperature of the melt pool and *A* is its surface area. We take $C_p = 1200 \text{ Jkg}^{-1}\text{K}^{-1}$, 468 $L_v = 5$ MJ kg⁻¹ and the magma density and body bulk density to both be 3000 kgm⁻³.

469 Below we describe the different energy sources and sinks, and our calculation methods, in more 470 detail. We have deliberately tried to keep our approach relatively simple, but even so there are a large 471 number of parameters, some of which are highly uncertain. That being the case, a more complicated 472 model seems premature; our main aim is to demonstrate that vapour loss from melt ponds is a 473 plausible mechanism for generating vapour mass loss, and thereby isotopic fractionation.

474 *Mass loss rate:* Atmospheres which have a gas thermal velocity comparable to the escape velocity of 475 the body are vulnerable to loss by direct outflow³⁶. For Earth-mass bodies the thermal velocity 476 required is implausibly high (except perhaps for close-in "roaster" planets that may occur in 477 exoplanetary systems³⁷) but for small bodies this requirement is less restrictive. The resulting outflow 478 can be described by the equations of mass and momentum conservation:

479
$$
\frac{1}{\rho} \frac{d\rho}{dr} + \frac{1}{v} \frac{dv}{dr} + \frac{2}{r} = 0
$$
 (2)

$$
480 \qquad \frac{1}{\rho} \frac{dP}{dr} + v \frac{dv}{dr} = -\frac{GM}{r^2} \tag{3}
$$

481 where *r* is the radial coordinate, *P(T)*, *ρ(T)* and *v* are the pressure, density and radial velocity of the 482 gas and we are assuming spherical geometry. For an ideal gas we have $R' T = P / \rho = v^2$ where R' is 483 the gas constant divided by the molar mass, T is the gas temperature and v_s is the sound speed. To 484 close the system, we also need an energy equation. The simplest, which we will adopt here, is to 485 assume an isothermal atmosphere with the temperature set by the melt pool surface temperature *T*. A 486 more realistic description would be to assume a vapour-saturated atmosphere; Lehmer et al.³⁸ have 487 shown that this latter system is actually well-approximated by the isothermal description.

488

489 Under these assumptions, the gas will accelerate outwards until it reaches the "sonic point" at 490 which $v=v_s$. At this critical radius r_c the sonic velocity is half the local escape velocity, with

$$
r_c = \frac{GM}{2R'T} = R_s \left(\frac{v_{esc}}{2v_s}\right)^2
$$

492 and v_{esc} is the escape velocity at the body surface $(r=R_s)$. The atmospheric mass loss rate is then 493 given by $4\pi r_c^2 \rho(r_c) v_s$. Given the surface density, equations (2) and (3) may then be integrated 494 outwards to calculate $\rho(r_c)$ and thus the mass loss rate. For small bodies, r_c may be equal to or less than 495 R_s , in which case the mass loss rate is $4\pi R_s^2 \rho(R_s) v_s$. In our case the gas density at the surface $\rho(r_s)$ 496 is set by the vapour pressure of the melt pool. Because only the melt pool is losing vapour, we replace 497 *4πR_s*² with *A*, the melt pool area, in our mass loss calculations. We assume a molar mass of 0.04 498 kg/mol, appropriate for MgO or SiO.

499 Driving mass loss requires energy because of two effects (equation 1): conversion of liquid to 500 vapour takes latent heat, and removal of mass from the surface to large distances involves potential 501 energy changes. We consider both these effects in more detail below.

502 *Secular cooling and radiative heat transfer:* Secular cooling of the melt pool provides the energy to 503 drive mass loss. The melt pool is assumed isothermal (temperature *T*) due to vigorous convection. This 504 temperature sets the gas vapour pressure at the surface. Here we take the vapour pressure to be given 505 by the following empirical expression obtained from our thermodynamic liquid-vapour model (see 506 below):

507
$$
\ln P = -4.0041 \left(\ln T \right)^3 + 88.788 \left(\ln T \right)^2 - 639.3 \ln T + 1480.23
$$

508 where *P* is in bars.

An important aspect of our model is that the effective radiating temperature of the melt pool T_{eff} is 510 lower than the temperature *T* which sets the gas vapour pressure and defines the internal temperature 511 of the melt. This effect is observed at terrestrial lava lakes, where the surface temperature is typically 512 many hundreds of K cooler³⁹ than the measured subsurface magma temperature and that inferred from 513 the gas equilibrium chemistry⁴⁰. A similar effect is found at Io, where the majority of a lava lake's 514 surface is at much lower temperature than the expected magma temperature⁴¹.

515 The reason for this effect is that there is a thin conductive skin on top of the convecting magma, 516 which is at a lower temperature than the material beneath. To approximately describe this 517 phenomenon, we set the heat flux conducted across this layer equal to the heat flux radiated from the 518 top surface:

$$
F = \frac{k(T - T_{\text{eff}})}{\delta} = \sigma T_{\text{eff}}^4
$$

520 where *k* is the thermal conductivity and δ is the skin thickness. This allows us to solve for T_{eff} given 521 *T* and δ . To calculate δ we assume the convecting melt pool can be described by isoviscous 522 convection⁴²

523
$$
\delta \approx 2 \left(\frac{\kappa \eta}{\rho g \alpha [T - T_{\text{eff}}]} \right)^{1/3}
$$

524 At high temperatures, the dominant energy sink in equation (1) is evaporative cooling, because 525 radiative heat loss increases as T^4 , while mass loss (which depends on the vapour pressure) increases 526 exponentially with *T*. Thus, the overall mass loss calculations are not particularly sensitive to the 527 details of the radiative cooling calculations.

Here we take $\alpha = 3x10^{-5} \text{ K}^{-1}$, $\eta = 10^{3} \text{ Pa s}$. The thermal conductivity *k* is taken to be 3 Wm⁻¹ K⁻¹ which 529 then specifies *κ*. For *T*=1400 K and a 1000 km radius body we find T_{eff} =853 K, which is roughly 530 consistent with terrestrial lava lake measurements³⁹.

531 *Melt pool volume and temperature:* To calculate the melt pool volume and temperature we assume 532 that the volume of material shocked to the maximum temperature (the isobaric core) is hemispherical 533 and has a radius linearly proportional to the impactor radius: $R_{ic} = f R_i$, with $f=3$ following 534 literature^{4,43}. Assuming that some fraction of the kinetic energy of the impactor is consumed within 535 this volume, the temperature change associated with impact is then given by

$$
536 \qquad \Delta T = \frac{1}{C_p} \left[\left(\frac{R_i}{R_{ic}} \right)^3 \beta v_{imp}^2 - L_m \right] \tag{4}
$$

537 where L_m is the latent heat of fusion, v_{imn} is the impact velocity (given by the N-body simulations) 538 and *β* is a factor to account for energy delivered beyond the isobaric core. Here we take *β*=0.5 to 539 provide a conservative estimate of the initial melt temperature. Inspection of this equation shows that 540 a minimum velocity of about 4.6 km/s is required to initiate significant mass loss.

541 We assume that the pre-impact target material is at the solidus, here taken to be 1400 K. The $\frac{1}{2}$ justification for doing so is that heating by ²⁶Al will melt bodies that formed early enough (to be 543 conservative, we ignore at this stage that such melting induced by 26 Al heating could have led to 544 vapour mass loss). Melt advection will rapidly cool the target to 1400 K, but subsequent cooling (by 545 conduction or solid-state convection) will be much slower. We also impose a maximum melt 546 temperature of 3500 K. This is approximately the temperature at which total silicate vaporization is 547 achieved and the physics of mass loss will change. Imposing this cut-off will underestimate the total 548 amount of mass loss.

549 Although the radius of the isobaric core is somewhat uncertain, varying *f* does not have a very large 550 effect on our results, because of the trade-offs involved. A smaller isobaric core reduces the surface 551 area and cooling timescale, but it increases the melt temperature (and thus the vapour pressure and the 552 initial mass loss rate). By contrast, the difference between regular and Grand Tack accretion is 553 dramatic. This is because the Grand Tack results in more dynamical excitation, and thus more 554 energetic collisions.

555 Extended Data Figure 6 plots the median impact velocity normalized to the escape velocity as a 556 function of body radius. The biggest difference between a calm disk (without gas drag) and Grand 557 Tack accretion is that the normalized impact velocities for large bodies are much bigger in the latter. 558 Since no vapour loss happens below a particular cut-off velocity (equation 4), it is clear that Grand 559 Tack simulations will generate much more vapour loss. Increasing *β* to 1 causes only modest increases 560 in the predicted mass loss for conventional accretion, because impact velocities are still general below 561 the cut-off value.

562 *Implementation:* Each body undergoes mass growth by collision; each collision may also lead to some 563 mass loss via vapour outflow. For each impact, we calculate the initial melt pool mass and 564 temperature as outlined in the section *Melt pool volume and temperature*. The instantaneous mass loss 565 rate is calculated using as described in the section *Mass loss rate*. Given the mass loss rate, the change 566 in melt pool temperature is calculated according to equation (1). The temperature is updated 567 accordingly and the cycle then repeats. The total mass lost is tracked.

568 A disadvantage of our approach is that the pre-history of impactors striking a target body is not 569 recorded. Since these impactors have likely undergone mass loss of their own, our approach may 570 therefore underestimate the total fractional mass loss of the final body. To mitigate this problem, for 571 the Grand Tack results we perform a two-step calculation. In the first step we calculate the total mass

572 loss for each body neglecting inheritance effects. We use these results to determine the median mass 573 loss over all bodies within a particular final mass range. The median prior fractional mass loss *ϕ* 574 determined in this manner for the GT bodies is given by the following empirical formula:

575
$$
\phi = 0.4 \times 10^{-5} R_s^{1.65} e^{-0.65 \times 10^{-5} R_s^{1.65}}
$$

576 where R_s is in km. We then re-run the calculations, this time assuming that each impactor has 577 experienced prior mass loss based on this median value. The results of both calculations are shown in 578 Extended Data Figure 7.

579 For the conventional accretion simulations without gas present in the disk ("calm disk") vapour 580 loss is sufficiently small that we neglected this inheritance effect. Extended Data Figure 7 plots the 581 median fractional mass loss for all bodies in the Grand Tack accretion simulations. The simulations for 582 a calm disk result in very limited mass loss, and only for the largest (see Figure 2b in main text). By 583 contrast, mass loss in the Grand Tack scenario is much more extensive.

584

585 *Vapour-liquid Mg isotope fractionation models*

586 We first consider a kinetic isotope fractionation scenario. For this, we modelled the elemental loss 587 of Mg required to obtain ~0.02‰ heavier Mg isotope compositions by a Rayleigh distillation process 588 with an experimentally determined kinetic isotope fractionation factor⁴⁴ (referred to as $\alpha^{25/24} Mg_{g/liq}^{kin}$) 589 of 0.9860. We obtained a relative mass loss of Mg by vaporization (f_{Mg}^{vap}) of 0.14% from

 $f_{Mg}^{vap} = 1 - e^{\delta^{25/24} Mg/(\alpha^{25/24} Mg \sin^{10} - 1)}$. This is a very small mass loss, but we can expect much larger 591 concomitant K mass losses, owing to its higher volatility. Although it is hard to quantify such K loss, 592 we can estimate it from an equilibrium liquid-vapour model (see below), given that kinetic evaporative 593 fluxes (J) from a molten surface are proportional to their saturation vapour pressures as well as the 594 elemental mass⁴⁴. In the simplest scenario, i.e. assuming a single vaporisation event, we find 0.14% of 595 Mg is vaporised at \sim 2700 K, at which temperature \sim 28% of K occurs as vapour (all as atomic K). 596 Using a published⁴⁵ $\alpha^{40/39} K_{g/liq}^{kin}$ of 0.9892 we obtain that ⁴¹K/³⁹K fractionates by ~7‰. This compares to \leq 2.7±1‰ observed fractionation in Solar System material²⁵, underscoring the implausibility of 598 kinetic fractionation.

599 We also examine an equilibrium liquid-vapour fractionation model. Vapour production results in 600 isotopically light vapour and heavy liquid compositions, thus evolving a vapour depleted bulk 601 planetesimal to isotopically heavier compositions. The composition of silicate vapour in equilibrium 602 with a molten planetesimal was calculated with a thermodynamic model involving equilibrium 603 reactions between silicate liquid and vapour species for nine elements: O, Na, Mg, Al, Si, K, Ca, Ti 604 and Fe. The model is modified from the MAGMA code by Fegley and co-workers^{46,47}. We followed 605 the approach of these authors to non-ideal mixing in the silicate liquid (i.e. assuming ideal mixing of 606 complex oxide and silicate pseudo-components), used their tabulated thermodynamic data, and, like

607 them, we assumed ideal mixing in the gas. Our approach differs from theirs in that we let go of their 608 constraint that oxygen-to-metal ratios in the gas must be identical to the original liquid. Instead, we 609 used the ideal gas law to convert partial pressures of gas species to number of moles in order to 610 enforce conservation of mass by simultaneously solving mass balance equations for the number of 611 moles of each element. Hence, we have 66 equilibrium equations and nine mass balance equations to 612 solve for activities of 75 species. The disadvantage of our approach is that the ideal gas law adds one 613 freely adjustable parameter in the form of the volume the gas can expand into. We have chosen to fix 614 this volume such that vapour fractions between ~0.001 and ~0.15 were obtained between 2500 K and 615 3500 K. Such fractions are of similar order of magnitude to the average vapour fraction produced in 616 single collisions in the N-body simulations (note that an order of magnitude variation in the chosen 617 volume leads to ~5 fold variation in the vapour fractions but these changes do not affect our 618 conclusions because their effect is counterbalanced by the number of "collisions" that are run to obtain 619 the observed Mg isotope composition; see below). To convert from activities of the liquid species to 620 moles, which we need for the mass balance equations, we need one more variable, i.e. the total moles 621 of all liquid species, bringing the number of unknowns to 76. However, there is the activity 622 normalisation constraint: the activities (i.e. mole fractions) of liquid species must sum to 1. Hence, we 623 have 76 constraints to solve for 76 variables. The code is easily expandable with extra elements and 624 equilibrium reactions and is freely available from the authors upon request.

625 In our equilibrium liquid-vapour fractionation model, we used published reduced partition 626 functions (*β*) to approximate equilibrium Mg, Si and Fe isotope fractionation factors between silicate 627 liquid and atomic silicate vapour. Experimental calibrations of equilibrium isotope fractionation 628 factors between vapour and liquid do not exist to date. As *β* are currently unavailable for silicate 629 liquid, we approximated them with those for forsterite crystals for Mg^{48} and Si^{49} and fayalite crystals 630 for Fe⁵⁰. We used further literature sources for *β* for other vapour species MgO_(g)⁴⁸, FeO_(g)⁵¹ and 631 SiO_(g)^{49,52}. Relative abundances of species in mixed vapours, e.g. Mg(g) and MgO(g), were obtained 632 from the thermodynamic model described above. A two-component mass balance relationship 633 combining isotope compositions of the vapour (subscript *g*) and the remaining 'liquid' (subscript *liq*) 634 were used to determine the offset relative to the original bulk composition (set to 0 for reference here)

635 prior to loss of a vapour fraction
$$
(f_g)
$$
: $\delta^{25/24} Mg_{liq} = -f_g \delta^{25/24} Mg_g / (1 - f_g)$.

636 We used this equilibrium vapour-liquid fractionation model to simulate vapour loss as various 637 temperature events (i.e. planetary collisions). We initiated the model with a chondritic elemental 638 composition (see main text) and isotope compositions of 0, as mentioned above. We removed 95% of 639 the chondritic Fe assuming it segregated into a core which is not affected by vaporisation. We let a 640 single "collision" affect 20% of the body and assumed that the body undergoes full chemical 641 homogenisation between two events. After the first "collision", the calculated isotopic and elemental 642 compositions of the residual liquid were then used as initial values for the next "collision", and so 643 forth. The temperature used to calculate equilibrium vapour-liquid compositions and isotopic

- 644 fractionation in any "collision" event was obtained by random selection of a temperature uniformly
- 645 distributed between 2500 K and 3500 K.
- 646 647
- 648 **Additional references**
- 649 32 Galy, A. *et al.* Magnesium isotope heterogeneity of the isotopic standard SRM980 and new 650 reference materials for magnesium-isotope-ratio measurements. *J. Anal. At. Spectrom.* **18**, 651 1352-1356, doi:10.1039/b309273a (2003).
- 652 33 Coplen, T. B. Guidelines and recommended terms for expression of stable-isotope-ratio and 653 gas-ratio measurement results. *Rapid Commun Mass Sp* **25**, 2538-2560, doi:10.1002/rcm.5129 654 (2011).
- 655 34 Regelous, M., Elliott, T. & Coath, C. D. Nickel isotope heterogeneity in the early Solar 656 System. *Earth Planet. Sci. Lett.* **272**, 330-338, doi:10.1016/j.epsl.2008.05.001 (2008).
- 657 35 Catanzaro, E. J., Murphy, T. J., Garner, E. L. & Shields, W. R. Absolute isotopic abundance 658 ratios and atomic weight of magnesium. *Journal of Research of the National Bureau of* 659 *Standards Section - A Physics and Chemistry* **70A**, 453-458 (1966).
- 660 36 Pierrehumbert, R. T. *Principles of planetary climate*. (Cambridge University Press, 2010).
- 661 37 Perez-Becker, D. & Chiang, E. Catastrophic evaporation of rocky planets. *Mon Not R Astron* 662 *Soc* **433**, 2294-2309, doi:10.1093/mnras/stt895 (2013).
- 663 38 Lehmer, O. R., Catling, D. C. & Zahnle, K. J. The longevity of water ice on Ganymedes and 664 Europas around migrated giant planets. *The Astrophysical Journal* **839**, 32-40, 665 doi:10.3847/1538-4357/aa67ea (2017).
- 666 39 Patrick, M. R., Orr, T., Swanson, D. A. & Lev, E. Shallow and deep controls on lava lake 667 surface motion at Kīlauea Volcano. *J. Volcanology Geothermal Res.* **328**, 247-261, 668 doi:10.1016/j.jvolgeores.2016.11.010 (2016).
- 669 40 Moussallam, Y. *et al.* Hydrogen emissions from Erebus volcano, Antarctica. *B. Volcanol.* **74**, 670 2109-2120, doi:10.1007/s00445-012-0649-2 (2012).
- 671 41 Davies, A. G. *Volcanism on Io: A comparison with Earth*. (Cambridge University Press, 672 2007).
- 673 42 Solomatov, V. S. Scaling of temperature- and stress-dependent viscosity convection. *Physics* 674 *of Fluids* **7**, 266-274, doi:10.1063/1.868624 (1995).
- 675 43 Melosh, H. J. *Impact cratering: A geologic process*. (Oxford University Press, 1989).
- 676 44 Richter, F. M., Janney, P. E., Mendybaev, R. A., Davis, A. M. & Wadhwa, M. Elemental and 677 isotopic fractionation of Type B CAI-like liquids by evaporation. *Geochim. Cosmochim. Acta* 678 **71**, 5544-5564, doi:10.1016/j.gca.2007.09.005 (2007).
- 679 45 Richter, F. M., Mendybaev, R. A., Christensen, J. N., Ebel, D. & Gaffney, A. Laboratory 680 experiments bearing on the origin and evolution of olivine-rich chondrules. *Meteorit. Planet.* 681 *Sci* **46**, 1152-1178, doi:10.1111/j.1945-5100.2011.01220.x (2011).
- 682 46 Fegley, B. & Cameron, A. G. W. A vaporization model for iron/silicate fractionation in the 683 Mercury protoplanet. *Earth Planet. Sci. Lett.* **82**, 207-222, doi:10.1016/0012-821x(87)90196-8 684 (1987).
- 685 47 Schaefer, L. & Fegley, B. A thermodynamic model of high temperature lava vaporization on 686 Io. *Icarus* **169**, 216-241, doi:10.1016/j.icarus.2003.08.023 (2004).
- 687 48 Schauble, E. A. First-principles estimates of equilibrium magnesium isotope fractionation in 688 silicate, oxide, carbonate and hexaaquamagnesium(2+) crystals. *Geochim. Cosmochim. Acta* 689 **75**, 844-869, doi:10.1016/j.gca.2010.09.044 (2011).
- 690 49 Huang, F., Wu, Z. Q., Huang, S. C. & Wu, F. First-principles calculations of equilibrium 691 silicon isotope fractionation among mantle minerals. *Geochim. Cosmochim. Acta* **140**, 509- 692 520, doi:DOI 10.1016/j.gca.2014.05.035 (2014).
- 693 50 Polyakov, V. B. & Mineev, S. D. The use of Mössbauer spectroscopy in stable isotope 694 geochemistry. *Geochim. Cosmochim. Acta* **64**, 849-865, doi:10.1016/S0016-7037(99)00329-4 695 (2000).
- 696 51 Pahlevan, K. *Chemical and isotopic consequences of lunar formation via giant impact* PhD 697 thesis, Califoria Institute of Technology, (2010).
- 698 52 Javoy, M., Balan, E., Méheut, M., Blanchard, M. & Lazzeri, M. First-principles investigation 699 of equilibrium isotopic fractionation of O- and Si-isotopes between refractory solids and gases 700 in the solar nebula. *Earth Planet. Sci. Lett.* **319**, 118-127, doi:10.1016/j.epsl.2011.12.029 701 (2012).
- 702 53 Clayton, R. N. & Mayeda, T. K. Oxygen isotope studies of carbonaceous chondrites. 703 *Geochim. Cosmochim. Acta* **63**, 2089-2104, doi:10.1016/S0016-7037(99)00090-3 (1999).
- 704 54 Van Schmus, W. R. & Wood, J. A. A chemical-petrologic classification for the chondritic 705 meteorites. *Geochim. Cosmochim. Acta* **31**, 747-765, doi:10.1016/S0016-7037(67)80030-9 706 (1967).
- 707 55 Sossi, P. A., Nebel, O. & Foden, J. Iron isotope systematics in planetary reservoirs. *Earth* 708 *Planet. Sci. Lett.* **452**, 295-308, doi:10.1016/j.epsl.2016.07.032 (2016).
- 709 56 O'Neill, H. S. C. & Palme, H. Collisional erosion and the non-chondritic composition of the 710 terrestrial planets. *Phil. Trans. Roy. Soc. A* **366**, 4205-4238, doi:10.1098/rsta.2008.0111 711 (2008).
- 712 57 Badro, J. *et al.* Effect of light elements on the sound velocities in solid iron: Implications for 713 the composition of Earth's core. *Earth Planet. Sci. Lett.* **254**, 233-238, 714 doi:10.1016/j.epsl.2006.11.025 (2007).
- 715 58 Hin, R. C., Fitoussi, C., Schmidt, M. W. & Bourdon, B. Experimental determination of the Si 716 isotope fractionation factor between liquid metal and liquid silicate. *Earth Planet. Sci. Lett.* 717 **387**, 55-66, doi:10.1016/j.epsl.2013.11.016 (2014).
- 718 59 Armytage, R. M. G., Georg, R. B., Savage, P. S., Williams, H. M. & Halliday, A. N. Silicon 719 isotopes in meteorites and planetary core formation. *Geochim. Cosmochim. Acta* **75**, 3662- 720 3676, doi:10.1016/j.gca.2011.03.044 (2011).
- 721 60 Schiller, M., Handler, M. R. & Baker, J. A. High-precision Mg isotopic systematics of bulk 722 chondrites. *Earth Planet. Sci. Lett.* **297**, 165-173, doi:10.1016/j.epsl.2010.06.017 (2010).
- 723 61 Schiller, M., Baker, J. A. & Bizzarro, M. 26 Al- 26 Mg dating of asteroidal magmatism in the 724 young Solar System. *Geochim. Cosmochim. Acta* **74**, 4844-4864, 725 doi:10.1016/j.gca.2010.05.011 (2010).
- 726 62 Larsen, K. K. *et al.* Evidence for Magnesium Isotope Heterogeneity in the Solar 727 Protoplanetary Disk. *Astrophys J Lett* **735**, doi:10.1088/2041-8205/735/2/L37 (2011).
- 728

729

730

732 Source data for Table 1 and all Figures not generated by modelling data have been provided with 733 the paper. Data generated by modelling code can be made available from the corresponding author 734 upon reasonable request. Magnesium isotope compositions generated in this study are available in the 735 EarthChem repository. 736 737 738 **Extended Data Table and Figure captions** 739 740 Extended Data Table 1. Sample sources and weights of digested sample from which aliquots were 741 taken for Mg isotope analysis in this study. NHM is Natural History Museum, London, UK. NASA is 742 National Aeronautics and Space Administration. ¹Aliquot from a homogenised powder of several 743 grams. 744 745 Extended Data Figure 1. Magnesium isotope compositions of carbonaceous chondrites plotted 746 against their average literature oxygen isotope compositions⁵³. These mass-dependent oxygen isotope 747 measurements reflect parent body hydrothermal alteration²⁰, so the correlation ($R^2 = 0.78$) between Mg 748 and O isotopes (as well as with petrographic group⁵⁴; indicated in brackets under sample names) 749 implies that the Mg isotope compositions of some carbonaceous chondrites have been altered by 750 hydrothermal processes. The most altered samples, to the upper right of this diagram, are excluded 751 from our chondrite Mg isotope means. 752 753 Extended Data Figure 2. Magnesium isotope compositions of peridotites plotted against whole rock 754 MgO (panel a) and Al_2O_3 (panel b) contents. The absence of correlations of Mg isotope compositions 755 with MgO or Al_2O_3 indicates absence of discernible Mg isotope fractionation during partial melting. 756 757 Extended Data Figure 3. Comparison between modelled compositions of a vapour depleted liquid 758 and observed planetary compositions. As Figure 3 in main text, but additionally including observed 759 isotope compositions for Mars, and eucrite and angrite parents bodies as well as including elemental 760 and isotopic Fe observations (panels b and d; Fe isotope data from [55] and references therein, all 761 other references as in Figure 3). Comparison of observed Fe contents and isotope ratios are 762 complicated by core formation because most Fe enters the core. In our model we assume that the iron 763 in the core has not been affected by vaporisation, inferred to occur later. For instance, the effect of 764 ~48% Fe loss (panel c) on the current bulk silicate Earth Fe content is dependent on the fraction of Fe 765 that entered the core prior to collisional vaporisation and the oxygen fugacity evolution of the growing 766 Earth. For reference, the datum labelled Fe** in panel d is therefore the Fe/Ca of the bulk Earth

731 **Data availability**

767 (calculated from [56]) instead of the Fe/Ca of the bulk silicate Earth. Similarly, Si can also enter the

768 core, although its quantity is likely <3 wt%⁵⁷. Right pointing arrows in b) and d) indicate the effect of 3 wt\% Si in the core (3000 K assumed for metal-silicate Si isotope fractionation factor⁵⁸).

770

771 Extended Data Figure 4. Comparison between modelled compositions of a vapour depleted liquid 772 and observed planetary compositions. Similar to Extended Data Figure 3, but for model runs with a CI 773 chondrite initial composition. Observed Mg and Fe isotope compositions (panel b) are presented 774 relative chondrite mean, while Si isotope observations are relative to a mean of carbonaceous and 775 ordinary chondrites⁵⁹, because those chondrites have undistinguishable Si isotope compositions, yet 776 are distinctly different from enstatite chondrites (see [4] and references therein).

777

778 Extended Data Figure 5. Magnesium isotope compositions of reference samples analysed in 779 multiple studies. The shaded areas show the mean and 2se of the isotope compositions observed in this 780 study. Note that the plotted composition of Murchison for Bourdon et al.¹⁰ is a mean of the two 781 replicates presented in their Table 1. The value for BHVO of Chakrabarti and Jacobsen¹⁶ is BHVO-1, 782 all others are BHVO-2.

783

784 Extended Data Figure 6. Variation in velocity of individual impacts (normalized by target body 785 escape velocity) as a function of target body radius. Central line denotes median value, shaded box 786 encompasses region spanning $25th - 75th$ percentiles, upper lines denote 90th percentile. Bulk density 787 assumed to be 3000 kg m^3 .

788

789 Extended Data Figure 7. Fractional mass loss in Grand Tack simulation as a function of final body 790 radius for direct vapour outflow model to illustrate results both with (white boxes, as Figure 2b) and 791 without (shaded boxes) the inclusion of inheritance effects (see Methods). Boxes denote the median 792 value, bars denote the $25th$ and $75th$ quartiles.

793

795 Table 1. Magnesium isotope compositions of chondrites, terrestrial (ultra-)mafics, and achondrites.

Sample	Type	$\delta^{25}Mg$ $(\%0)$	2se	n ¹
Orgueil	CI1	-0.105	0.010	8
Ivuna	CI1	-0.095	0.008	12
Al Rais	CR ₂	-0.094	0.008	12
Renazzo	CR ₂	-0.135	0.008	12
Kainsaz	CO ₃	-0.158	0.010	8
Murchison	CM2	-0.145	0.010	8
Parnallee	LL3	-0.152	0.009	11
Dhurmsala	LL6	-0.148	0.010	8
Ceniceros	H ₃	-0.157	0.009	11
Zag	H3	-0.132	0.007	19,2
Khairpur	EL6	-0.137	0.006	23,2
Hvittis	EL ₆	-0.135	0.008	12
Yilmia	EL6	-0.130	0.007	16
St Mark's	EH ₅	-0.129	0.006	23,2
Abee	EH4	-0.142	0.008	12
Indarch	EH4	-0.128	0.008	12
Mean Chondrites ²		-0.140	0.006	
$JP-1$	Dunite	-0.117	0.004	43,5
BZ116	Sp Hz	-0.133	0.009	11
Vi 313-102	Gt Lz	-0.130	0.010	8
BZ143	Sp Lz	-0.120	0.009	11
BZ-29	Sp Lz	-0.115	0.010	8
Vi 314-56	Sp Lz	-0.115	0.010	8
BZ251	Plg Lz	-0.129	0.010	8
2370-1	MORB	-0.111	0.010	8
DS12-29	MORB	-0.110	0.010	8
9/30a(1)	MORB	-0.124	0.010	8
$BIR-1$	ОIВ	-0.099	0.010	8
BHVO-2	OIB	-0.095	0.004	60,3
Mean Earth ³		-0.121	0.005	
ALHA 77005	Lz Sherg	-0.112	0.009	11
DaG 476	Bas Sherg	-0.123	0.009	11
EETA 79001	Bas Sherg	-0.113	0.009	11
RBT 04262	Ol Sherg	-0.117	0.010	8
Zagami	Bas Sherg	-0.113	0.010	8
LAR 06319	Ol Sherg	-0.102	0.009	11
Mean Mars		-0.113	0.006	
Johnstown	Diogenite	-0.102	0.010	8
Shalka	Diogenite	-0.104	0.010	8
Tatahouine	Diogenite	-0.127	0.010	8
Mean Diogenites		-0.111	0.016	
d'Orbigny	Angrite	-0.079	0.010	8

¹ Total number of analyses. If a comma is present, the number behind the comma refers to the number of digestions. Each digestion was passed through chemistry once.

² The two CI1 chondrites (Ivuna, Orgueil) and one CR2 (Al Rais) were excluded from the mean.

³ The two Ocean Island Basalts (BHVO-2 and BIR-1) were excluded from the mean.

Sp Hz = Spinel Harzburgite, Gt Lz = Garnet Lherzolite, Plg = Plagioclase, MORB = Mid-Ocean Ridge Basalt, OIB = Ocean Island basalt, Bas Sherg = Basaltic Shergottite, $O = O$ livine-phyric.

¹Aliquot from a homogenised powder of several grams

NHM = Natural History Museum

NASA = National Aeronautics and Space Administration

Observed isotopic compositions relative to enstatite chondrites (‰/amu)

