SURVEY REVIEW

Translanguaging and the shifting sands of language education

Emma Brooks

Translanguaging and Transformative Teaching for Emergent Bilingual Students: Lessons from the CUNY-NYSIEB Project
City University of New York – New York State Initiative on Emergent Bilinguals (ed.)
Routledge, 2021, 330 pp., £36.99 (paperback)
ISBN 9780367434984

English-Medium Instruction and Translanguaging
BethAnne Paulsrud, Zhongfeng Tian, and Jeanette Toth (eds.)
Multilingual Matters, 2021, 240 pp., £29.95 (paperback)
ISBN: 9781788927314

Envisioning TESOL through a Translanguaging Lens: Global Perspectives
Zhongfeng Tian, Laila Aghai, Peter Sayer, and Jamie L. Schissel (eds.)
Springer Nature Switzerland AG, 2020, 374 pp., £65.99 (hardback), £99.99 (paperback); £79.50 (ebook)
ISBN 9783030470302 (hardcover)/9783030470333 (paperback)/ 9783030470319 (ebook)

Translanguaging in EFL Contexts: A Call for Change
Michael Rabbidge
Routledge, 2019, 204 pp., £36.99 (paperback)
ISBN 9780367671198

Translanguaging as Transformation: The Collaborative Construction of New Linguistic Realities
Emilee Moore, Jessica Bradley, and James Simpson (eds.)
Multilingual Matters, 2020, 288 pp., £34.95 (paperback)
ISBN 9781788928038

Key words: Translanguaging, multilingual classroom, English in global contexts, language education

Translanguaging: a survey review

It will have been almost impossible for anyone working in the field of language teaching to have avoided encountering the term translanguaging. Over the past decade, it has become one of the most influential concepts

in the field of applied and sociolinguistics: indeed, I include myself in the growing number of academics, researchers, and teachers engaging with its pedagogy, theory, and/or associated practice (see, for example, García and Li 2014; Li 2018; Baynham and Lee 2019). With a proliferation of publications, papers, and workshops all pointing to a wide range of implications for language policy, educational reform, and classroom practice, grappling with what translanguaging is (or isn't) and the extent to which this concept/approach can meet some of the more (occasionally) evangelical claims must indeed be a publisher's dream. But what exactly is translanguaging and what is its relevance for language teaching and learning? Before introducing and discussing the five books under review, I begin first with a brief introduction to translanguaging, a reflection on the pedagogic advantages it is said to bring and some of the criticisms with which the concept has been met. Following this, I then touch on the potential institutional, structural, commercial, and personal tensions that adopting a translanguaging pedagogy may provoke and—given its orientation to social justice and linguistic equity—its relationship to 'transformation'.

Translanguaging

Adapted from the Welsh word 'trawsieithu' and first translated as 'translinguifying', the term translanguaging was originally coined to describe the pedagogic practice of alternating between Welsh and English in order to enrich the processes of meaning-making and to deepen understanding of content (Williams 1994; Baker 2001). When students read something in English and then respond in written Welsh, the prefix 'trans' is said to capture the seamless movement across and between languages, with the verb 'languaging' implying a focus on activity and individual agency. In this sense, languaging is not something that can be conceptualized as a 'product' but instead represents 'the simultaneous process of continuous becoming of ourselves and of our language practices as we interact and make meaning in the world' (García and Li 2014: 8). In contrast to conventional understandings of language(s), where speakers are imagined to access, select, and deploy resources from discrete areas of the brain, a translanguaging perspective sees language(s) as developing on a horizontal continuum: that is, individuals strategically deploy features from their entire linguistic and semiotic repertoire, depending on the context in which they find themselves (Vogel and García 2017).

In the context of bilingual education, where much of the theorization has taken place, a translanguaging approach can be seen to contrast with established practice in the anglophone tradition, where educational settings tend to echo a societal view of languages as distinct entities, and therefore teach them as such. Translanguaging advocates regard these conventional methods as restrictive, arguing that by ignoring a person's full linguistic repertoire, their resources are reduced and learning potential constrained—the combination of which contributes to an unequal access to education (García 2009). Instead, translanguaging pedagogy takes the language practices of bi/multilinguals as the starting point, emphasizing the opportunities presented for invoking criticality, enhancing creativity, disrupting notions of bounded language, and creating new subjectivities (García and Li 2014). García and Li

assert that translanguaging can not only 'expos[e] alternative histories, representations and knowledge … [but has] the potential to crack the 'standard language bubble' in education that continues to ostracise many … students' (2014: 115). As may now be apparent, a cornerstone of translanguaging theory is a specific, often explicit, orientation towards social justice and (racio)linguistic equity.

Translanguaging and transformation

With this in mind, it is perhaps then unsurprising that translanguaging as pedagogic innovation has both captured the academic imagination and a few raised eyebrows in equal measure, not least for the associated claims of 'transformation'. This effect, so often attributed to translanguaging, has aroused scepticism in some quarters, and Jaspers' (2018) pointed critique elaborates extensively as to the limits translanguaging may hold for comprehension, learning and experience—all of which he feels are generally underacknowledged by scholars in the field. Firstly, and as we will see as we move through this review, it is true that the notion of what can be considered 'transformation(al)' is very much open to interpretation: whereas Aghai, Sayer, and Vercellotti (Chapter 16, *Envisioning TESOL through a Translanguaging Lens*) may see the possibilities of this pedagogic approach to transform language education and classroom practice, García goes even further to make connections to the political, with transformation emerging only 'if [it] result[s] in challenges to the structural inequalities that would position these bodies differently from how they are positioned today' (*Translanguaging as Transformation*: xxi). As transformation never seems too far from the concept of translanguaging (the term features in two out of the five titles selected for review), readers may be advised to regard such claims with a pragmatic lens.

A second criticism of translanguaging points to an apparent privileging of fluid communicative practices over a named language. This could be considered a point well made, especially when one considers how the authenticating experience of cultural and linguistic identity, promoted through language maintenance programmes for example, has been so integral in the dismantling the influences of colonialism (Kubota 2016; Jaspers 2019). Nonetheless, a counterargument that translanguaging can actually begin to redress linguistic inequalities and contribute to language revitalization goes some way to refuting this argument. Li (2018) suggests that the fact that linguistic fluidity empowers speakers to go beyond the social construction of named languages also gives them the opportunity to disrupt the wider structures or hierarchies they inherently imply. By allowing 'Others to come to the forefront' (Li 2018: 24), translanguaging is therefore seen to offer a unique perspective for addressing 'criticality … social justice and the linguistic human rights agenda' (Li 2018: 24). This is clearly evidenced in many of the chapters included in this review: for example, several authors in *English-Medium Instruction and Translanguaging* (Chapters 3 and 4) draw on the African system of 'Ubuntu', or connectedness, to illustrate how rich, flexible repertoires can resist and destabilize colonial discourse. In these instances, translanguaging can be seen to disturb a historical tension where (imposed) language(s) have been previously used to sow social division, create and reinforce inequalities, and regulate access to

positions of political and socioeconomic advancement. That is not to say that English as a form of colonialism-by-proxy no longer exists, as Bassey Antia's excoriating characterization of EMI reminds us in the introduction to *English-Medium Instruction and Translanguaging*, but that scholars who embrace this tradition must redouble their commitment to social justice.

Introducing the books reviewed

Each of the books reviewed here presents translanguaging as a linguistically inclusive pedagogy, as well as speaking in varying degrees to some of the critiques that have been made of the approach. Similarly consistent are the ripples of wider conversations about language ideologies, educational policies, linguistic inequalities, and social justice. I begin by reviewing accounts of the groundbreaking CUNY-NYSIEB project in *Translanguaging and Transformative Teaching for Emergent Bilingual Students: Lessons from the CUNY-NYSIEB Project*: led by Ofelia García and colleagues, this is often considered to be the most influential translanguaging project to date. The following two books, *English-Medium Instruction and Translanguaging* and *Envisioning TESOL through a Translanguaging Lens: Global Perspectives*, transport translanguaging theory out of an ESL environment, where learners arguably experience the language of instruction as much outside school as they do within, to the EFL context where exposure to the target language may not go beyond the confines of the lesson itself. Unique in their global reach, these two volumes comprise a raft of empirical and conceptual studies, each chapter situating research within a rich educational context as practitioners seek to transform the academic achievement and experiences of their students. The fourth book reviewed, *Translanguaging in EFL Contexts*, gives detailed insight into some of the challenges of implementing translanguaging pedagogy in South Korea, where a focus on acquiring 'native-speaker' English competes with a national desire to maintain identity. Finally, since *Translanguaging as Transformation* explores collaborative, arts-based and action research projects, it can arguably be read as a retort to the imagined limits some may seek to impose.

Translanguaging and Transformative Teaching for Emergent Bilingual Students: Lessons from the CUNY-NYSIEB Project

This compelling book details an ambitious and groundbreaking project which initiated and continues to introduce innovative approaches to educating emergent bilingual students. Documenting the differing ways in which translanguaging pedagogy is embraced and adapted in institutions across New York state, the volume offers inspirational strategies and practices to 'liberate and engage' those students who are frequently disadvantaged by raciolinguistic, colonial, and class discrimination. As such, it is likely to be of great interest to teachers, teacher-trainers, researchers, and students working with, and in, multilingual classrooms.

Content and features of the book

The book is split into six sections, each of them mapping the progressive stages of the CUNY-NYSEIB project: as is implied by the title of the initial section, 'Foundations', García and Otheguy start by tracing their engagement with translanguaging theory and pedagogy, before going on to emphasize the centrality of *juntos*, a concept of togetherness which underpins this project's approach to emancipatory education. Indeed the fact that many of the chapters are written by different combinations of the same authors seems to

further exemplify close collaboration and teamwork. Ensuing contributions document the ideological and practical challenges of implementing a translanguaging pedagogy in a state-wide education system. Replete with contextual detail, the book not only reminds the reader of the 'purist' concepts which dominate language teaching, but also of the degree of flexibility and innovation that can be accommodated by the largely decentralized model of education in the United States. By focusing on schools which serve above-average numbers of emergent bilinguals and are often labelled as 'in need of improvement', the translanguaging initiative promises ongoing professional development and a commitment to intensive engagement and support (as can be seen in the subsequent chapters by Menken and García and by Kleyn and Sánchez).

Section 2, 'Evolving Juntos Structures', provides further insight into the practicalities of such an extensive project—from the day-to-day realities of managing research teams in different institutions and the complexities of securing distributed leadership in schools, to navigating educational policies and increasing teachers' awareness of bilingualism (Espinet, Flores, Sánchez, and Seltzer, Chapter 4; Sánchez and Menken, Chapter 5). An additional focus on the experiences of researchers and teachers working *juntos* with school boards, head teachers, emergent bilingual children, their families and communities adds a rich textured layer to this contextualization (Collins, Kaya, Pappas, and Zaino, Chapter 6). Enriched by vignettes and examples of classwork, the next section, 'Shifting Educational Spaces', reveals the ways in which linguistic flexibility has the potential to boost student confidence and foster bilingual reading identities. It also demonstrates institutional shifts towards an ecology of multilingualism (Aponte, Espinet, and Seltzer, Chapter 8; Menken, Pérez-Rosario, and Guzmán Valerio, Chapter 9). Of interest to many will be Chapter 7, where Vogel, Seltzer, Carpenter, Ebe, Celic, and Martin describe the development of translanguaging materials, revised iteratively over a period of seven years, and offering clear guidance as to how to place dynamic bilingualism at the core of classroom practice. This segues nicely into 'Literacies Juntos: Instruction and Assessment', a section which illustrates how emergent translingual literacy practices are addressed in the expanding linguistic landscape of New York schools. Beginning with the multilingual, preschool classroom, before moving to classrooms catering for young adults, the chapters explore a multiplicity of creative strategies that are used to enhance (bi)literacy acquisition. As Espinosa, Moreno, and Vogel argue (Chapter 12), the movement away from the confines of monolingualism towards inclusive hybridized literacies not only emphasizes the importance of multimodal resources in establishing agency and voice but also helps to reflect children's lived experience. For those of us who may be trying to reconcile the demands of traditional assessment with translanguaging pedagogy, Ascenzi-Moreno's call in Chapter 13 for differentiated responses to reading comprehension—accepting answers in different languages; oral instead of written responses; individual learning plans informed by close attention to miscues when reading aloud—highlights an obligation to facilitate a level playing field through actively shaping classroom practice.

This disruption of what can be considered 'appropriate' languaging is the focus of Section 5, 'Inquiry en Comunidad', where the notion of bilingual programmes, so popular in the United States, is interrogated. Explicit segregation, it is argued, can devalue the dynamic language use of bilingual students and simultaneously invoke the kinds of deficit perspectives that are often used to describe racially and linguistically marginalized communities. Nevertheless, the different authors suggest that such implicit and explicit ideologies can be transformed through skilful pedagogic facilitation and an institutional orientation to social justice. This is beautifully illustrated in Chapter 14, by Espinet, Aponte, Sánchez, Cardenas Figueroa, and Busone-Rodríguez, where a walk through the local community is transformed into a learning experience that stimulates children's metalinguistic awareness and pride. In turn, Espinet and Lê (Chapter 15) show how by bringing parents into the classroom to collaborate *juntos* on a translanguaging reading activity with their children, linguistic hierarchies are dismantled, and repertoires gain an empowering validation.

'Transforming Teacher Education', the final section of the book, returns to the origins of this fascinating project, documenting first the transformation of educational provision at CUNY. Here, the authors trace initial institutional and individual reluctance to move away from established paradigms such as TESOL and bilingual education programmes and illustrate how translanguaging pedagogy has become integral to teacher training in their context, as well as embedded in classroom practice across the curriculum. Additional reflections by the wider CUNY-NYSIEB research team offer personal insights into the benefits of reimagining curricula in new settings, but it is clear that disrupting the monolingual ideologies which underpin most educational provision is not without difficulties. These issues are picked up in the final chapter, where Kearney and Mahoney relate their experiences of providing a support network across New York state as they help teachers to resist, rewrite, and reimagine language policies in their schools.

The viability of a new model

This is an excellent and immersive introduction to a translanguaging pedagogy informed by theory, practice, and rich experience. In recognition of the challenge posed by reimagining the monolingual classroom through a multilingual lens, each of the chapters talks the reader through anticipated hurdles. As teachers, educators, researchers, and students share inspirational vignettes and case studies, they create an extremely persuasive case for translanguaging as an emancipatory and transformative pedagogy in ESL/ESOL. If one were to try and identify a weakness of this book, it does not relate to the content—this vividly illustrates effective ways of supporting and nurturing emergent bilingual students—but more to the *implications* of trying to replicate such a wide-ranging project, given the institutional and ideological constraints which are often shaped by wider political and national agendas in many EFL contexts. Equally, in countries such as the United Kingdom, where the curriculum is nationalized and monolingual instruction is presupposed, a translanguaging pedagogy would certainly struggle to gain traction in this much-politicized area of public discourse. It is also worth noting that

the collaborative nature of the CUNY-NYSIEB project suggests that much of its success is due to the dedication of an extensive teacher support network, which is likely to prove difficult to replicate without government funding.

English-Medium Instruction and Translanguaging

English-Medium Instruction and Translanguaging will be of interest to students, parents, teachers, institutions, and those in charge of language policy alike. Comprising conceptual and empirical contributions from a range of diverse contexts around the world, it explores the pedagogic and personal affordances that translanguaging can bring to 'English-only' learning environments, despite an apparent incongruity of approach.

Contents and features of the book

The foreword of the volume, by South African scholar Bassey Antia, may initially take readers by surprise, starting as it does with a highly critical framing of English as a medium of instruction. His beautifully written and powerful text describes the exclusive use of English, in outer and expanding circles, as a 'cultural travesty', ideologically linked to linguistic imperialism and key to a globalized political economy which only furthers the interests of so-called inner circle countries. In recognition that change is unlikely to happen overnight, Antia concedes that the process of allowing local languages to interact with English in the classroom offers the potential to repel the exponential, global growth of English and promote linguistic equity and local languages. This idea is taken forward in the introduction, where the editors begin by situating translanguaging in the EMI context, before going on to present contributions from programmes around the world where flexible language use has been afforded classroom space.

The first four chapters of this book explore the relationship between translanguaging and EMI in universities with very different language policies. Drawing on empirical research from a science class in Turkey, Sahan and Rose (Chapter 1) present short extracts showing the everyday reality of teachers and students moving fluidly between languages in order to co-construct meaning and enrich understanding of complex scientific concepts. This is followed by Adamson and Fujimoto-Adamson's study recording the benefits of translanguaging as a strategy to scaffold learning in EMI and CLIL classes at a Japanese university. Yet, as the following chapters show, the relation between EMI policy and real-world classroom practice is not without tensions, many of which have historical origins. Tracing Malawi's (post)colonial history, Reilly (Chapter 3) not only offers a clear background to the current English-only policy but also shows the vivid contrast between official directives and the everyday realities of a multilingual classroom: indeed, anyone wanting exemplification of what translanguaging 'looks like' would be recommended to explore the rich and dynamic language use illustrated here. These examples lead smoothly into Luckett and Hurst-Harosh's further exploration of translanguaging in the humanities and social sciences in South Africa (Chapter 4), where scholars have responded to a call for a decolonialization of the curriculum and a move away from representations of local languages as deficient. By explicitly adopting translanguaging as a pedagogic strategy, teachers record that students are more engaged and can begin to 'express their

feelings and attitudes towards language, identity and culture in ways that are normally repressed in their English medium-only essays' (p. 60).

Chapter 5 remains in an African context, with a longitudinal study recording a commitment to redress linguistic inequality. Crisfield, Gordon, and Holland share an exploratory case study of a private primary school in Kenya seeking to introduce an ethical curriculum that uses both national languages in equal measure: that is, to incorporate teaching and resources in Kiswahili in addition to the traditional medium of instruction, English, which has historically been regarded as more prestigious. Although they note some practical and ideological difficulties with the project, the authors also recognize the huge potential of translanguaging to boost cultural identities and stem the attrition of local language(s). Mohamed's case study of a Maldivian classroom, in the following chapter, offers a similarly rich illustration of productive and creative multilingualism as children's story-telling flits seamlessly between English and Dhivehi. In contrast, Pun's observations of a science lesson in a Hong Kong high school (Chapter 7) show the pedagogic benefits of translanguaging as a means to scaffold and integrate content and language learning. Although the three accounts from schools in these chapters take place in very different contexts, in combination they emphasize the absurdity of implementing monolingual language policies in multilingual settings.

Chapter 8 signals a shift to exploring translanguaging in the context of higher education and introduces Boun and Wright's research in a Cambodian university. We learn that as EMI frequently presents a challenge to students previously instructed in Khmer, the majority of staff respond to this social injustice by adopting an explicitly translanguaging stance in order to support equitable access to the curriculum. This contrasts with students at an Italian university, where translanguaging functions as a way of filling 'lexical gaps' and as a lingua franca between international students (Dalziel and Guarda, Chapter 9). Another aspect of translanguaging is introduced in Goodman, Kerimkulova, and Montgomery's study (Chapter 10), where students at a Kazakhstani university make use of flexible languaging as a means of enhancing the transfer of academic skills. Chapter 11 changes focus entirely to offer an insightful overview of translanguaging in South Africa, where the colonial reach of English is so entrenched that it has become the universal method of instruction. Here, Probyn identifies the interplay between racial disadvantage and the perception of local languages as deficient, and argues for a new orientation towards social justice. In the context of teacher education, this involves specific pre-/in-service training, to encourage and inform educators on how best to develop strategic translanguaging pedagogies 'so as to open up opportunities to learn in EMI classrooms' (p. 171). Probyn's impassioned, and informed, advocacy complements the ensuing epilogue, where Ute Smit succeeds in synthesizing the 'collage of insights' (p. 176) captured across the volume. Adeptly highlighting the strengths of the studies, she also points to additional emergent themes: translanguaging as classroom practice, as a means of contesting sociolinguistic inequalities and, at a macro level, as a clear riposte to anglonormative policies and ideologies.

EMI—a global challenge

A key strength of this well-structured book is the breadth of empirical and conceptual work. From primary, secondary, and tertiary contexts to public and private sectors, the research has an incredibly diverse global reach, with the juxtaposition of studies frequently reflecting wider discussions on linguistic hegemony: for example, the *imposition* of English in African and ex-colonial contexts (see Reilly, Chapter 3; Boun and Wright, Chapter 8) versus the *choices* afforded to students in Europe (Dalziel and Guarda, Chapter 9). Although contributors consistently cast a critical eye on the ideologies, policies, and methodologies that augment the position of English as a global lingua franca, there is also a recognition that the concept of translanguaging is open to interpretation. Smit's epilogue picks up on the different definitions of what authors understand by translanguaging and/or EMI: whilst acknowledging that variations can be seen as potentially confusing, she nonetheless reminds the reader that interpretations have situated nuance and adds that research traditions stand to gain more from constructive inclusivity than they do from splitting theoretical hairs (p. 180). The editors' concluding comments are similarly refreshing as they concede that the intersection of translanguaging and EMI (see also Jaspers, 2019) warrants 'further, critical exploration' (p. 183). With a recognition of historical contexts and the internationalization of education, Antia's superb emotive foreword is balanced beautifully by the editors' reflective considerations, as they bookend a volume that makes for a thought-provoking and inspiring read.

Envisioning TESOL through a Translanguaging Lens: Global Perspectives

This volume is aimed at language teachers working in TESOL and foreign language education as well as those working in the broader fields of EFL and applied linguistics. Inspired by the foundational work of Ofelia García, the authors seek to extend translanguaging theorization and pedagogy to the wider TESOL context and initiate critical conversations about monolingual orientations to English teaching and learning.

Contents and features of the book

Comprising contributions from scholars working across five continents, *Envisioning TESOL through a Translanguaging Lens* begins with a powerful foreword by Angel Lin, where, following a brief overview of the book's contents, the scholar builds a persuasive rationale for an industry-wide response to the realities of the plurilingual classroom. By way of an additional introduction, Chapter 1 maps the landscape and scholarly aims of this collection very effectively. In an era of post-multilingualism, Tian, Aghai, Sayer, and Schissel argue that emergent communicative practices both illustrate the dynamic mutability of language and simultaneously problematize concepts which have been previously taken for granted, especially in the field of English language teaching, such as discourses of monolingualism, native speakerism, and 'English-only' pedagogy. In moving away from dominant themes of the field, readers are encouraged to engage with the descriptive, theoretical, and pedagogic lens of translanguaging as a means of reimagining the TESOL classroom as a truly equitable space.

The remaining sixteen chapters are divided into three parts. The first part, 'Theorizing Translanguaging in TESOL', begins by introducing the conceptual advantages and challenges posed by translanguaging

in a TESOL context, before going on to explore practical implications for the classroom and teacher training in the subsequent sections. This part is characterized by bottom-up and top-down theorization and begins with what could be considered one of the most well-known and influential examples of translanguaging on the ground—the foundational CUNY-NYSEIB project which is the topic of the first book reviewed above. Drawing on findings from this project, Seltzer and García's chapter illustrates the transformative effects of welcoming different languages, dialects, and modes into a traditional high school classroom as well as recognizing students as 'speakers and writers who bring creative and critical … perspectives and language practices' (p. 25) to their language learning. Yet, in the broader context of TESOL, the concept of translanguaging challenges established thinking, not least because it disturbs the privileged primacy of English. In Chapter 3, Sembiante and Tian highlight the ways in which the vested interests of institutions and journals can be said to stand in the way of exploring alternative pedagogies, as well as ignoring multilingual realities. Noting a clear contrast between the 'continuing promotion of monolingual teaching by … stakeholders in the field" (p. 86) and the embedded use of translanguaging practices by expert teachers, Hall echoes their sentiments and calls for broader conversations that explicitly recognize the facilitative benefits of multilingualism.

This leads neatly into the second section of the book, 'Translanguaging in TESOL Teacher Education'. Starting in the United States, the first three chapters recount recurrent themes of personal and structural resistance to translanguaging pedagogy in teacher education, but also highlight the degree of confidence and support that teachers may need in order to adopt a translanguaging stance in the classroom (see Andrei, Kibler, and Salerno, Chapter 5; Deroo, Ponzio, and De Costa, Chapter 6; Robinson, Tian, Crief, and Lins Prado, Chapter 7). Building on this, the ensuing chapters go on to illustrate how dominant language ideologies can be navigated and attitudes changed. Initially, we see how teachers in Mexico (Morales, Schissel, and López-Gopa, Chapter 8) and Australia (Turner, Chapter 9) successfully draw on the multilingual resources of students and the wider environment to enhance teaching, learning, and experience in university and primary classrooms, respectively. However, Lau's account of introducing teachers to critical language pedagogy in the postcolonial context of rural Malawi (Chapter 10), brings to the fore real-world tensions between the legitimization of ethnolinguistic identities and the enduring vision of English as synonymous with quality education and global citizenship.

The studies in Part 3 of this volume, 'Translanguaging in TESOL Classrooms', enable the reader to make direct connections between theory and classroom practice, as they explore empirical work in a variety of settings around the world. Incorporating research on an early-years classroom in the Netherlands, newcomers in a US high school, task-based learning activities in Vietnam, and an EAP programme for international students in Canada, studies in this section illustrate the benefits and challenges of strategically adapting translanguaging approaches to

different contexts (see Günther-van der Meij and Duarte, Chapter 11; Seilstad and Kim, Chapter 12; Seals, Newton, Ash, and Nguyen, Chapter 13; and Galente, Chapter 14). Of particular interest to teachers may be an holistic, and practical, framework for multilingual education (Chapter 11), as well as work which shows the ways in which translanguaging can advance the learner-centric pedagogy of TBLT (Chapter 13). For those working in EAP settings, Galente's mixed-methods research (Chapter 14) also clearly demonstrates the positive effects of infusing classes with alternative languages. The next two chapters consider translanguaging from a teacher's perspective: while Fallas Escobar recommends the use of critical dialogue to reveal and disrupt the language ideologies which (sub)consciously inform attitudes, Aghai, Sayer, and Vercelloti discover that teachers frequently position translanguaging as a problem, a natural process, or a resource (following Ruiz 1984). The volume ends with a reflection by Sayer, who skilfully draws together the resonances and dissonances which have emerged from 'different facets of the same conceptual and pedagogical challenge' (p. 363).

Opportunties and obstacles of translanguaging

The major, noticeable, strength of this volume is the quality of its contributions, underpinned as they are by rigorous methodology and thoughtful critique. In addition, the wide range of educational, socioeconomic, and geopolitical contexts in which translanguaging pedagogy is exemplified in this volume serves to underpin its theoretical credibility and adds to a growing body of evidence to support multilingual education. Nevertheless, many authors also recognize some of the challenges facing the introduction of translanguaging approaches. For example, it is clear that teachers do not live in a vacuum, and can be as affected by wider political discourse, colonial language ideologies, and neoliberal tropes of English as linguistic capital, as their students are (see Lau, Chapter 10). Andrei et al. (Chapter 5) note the scepticism and reluctance of pre-service teachers, whereas Deroo et al. (Chapter 6) record the structural barriers faced by those who try to adopt a translanguaging stance. While translanguaging orientations towards social justice are, of course, commendable, whether they can be furthered through teaching and learning in the TESOL classroom, in the face of more hegemonic, historical, and prevailing discourses, remains to be seen. Similarly, although several authors in this volume refer to adapting or amending tests to incorporate, recognize, and value the multilingual realities of their students (e.g., Galente, Chapter 14; Morales et al, Chapter 8), I imagine that it will be of great professional interest for many of us to watch for any changes to the multi-million-pound industries that create and sustain the high-stakes English tests upon which so many institutions and students rely.

Translanguaging in EFL Contexts: A Call for Change

As the only monograph in this review, *Translanguaging in EFL Contexts: A Call for Change* draws on findings from Michael Rabbidge's doctoral research, and is unique in the fact that it only focuses on one context, South Korea. Yet the arguments made by its author could, in effect, relate to a multitude of EFL settings where government guidelines recommend that languages are segregated in the classroom for the purposes of teaching and learning. Gaining independence in 1945, South Korea has

risen from an impoverished nation to a thriving world power and one that places the teaching and learning of English as central to economic success on a global stage. As it is also a country where education is seen as a vehicle of upward mobility, one can begin to understand a national, and often parental, motivation to introduce children to English from an early age, often through private tutoring. However, as such tutoring proliferates, it serves to widen the language gap between those who can and can't afford supplementary classes. Inequitable access to resources increases the need for differentiation in the mainstream classroom, which in turn aggravates tensions between a state insistence on using the target language for instruction and the sense of inadequacy felt by teachers if they 'resort' to using Korean (L1).

It is from this starting point that Rabbidge sets out his call for change, petitioning for a reimagining of the South Korean classroom as a translanguaging space where linguistic flexibility, not language separation, holds the key to both supporting students and valuing teachers' repertoires. Using interviews and observations, Rabbidge explores the experiences, reflections and beliefs of five South Korean EFL teachers, in addition to offering a glimpse of contemporary teaching practices. He begins with a whistle-stop tour of influential scholarship in language learning and teaching, and relates them to the South Korean context. The first few chapters then give a broad overview of the theoretical frameworks that inform his approach to pedagogic research. Here, he gently builds a persuasive argument for moving beyond policies and practice that sustain monolingual ideologies and linguistic hierarchies (for example, the use of terms such as NNEST and the banning of L1 in the classroom) towards those that embrace a translanguaging perspective. Chapter 3 addresses teachers' beliefs about language and classroom practice with considerable nuance: Rabbidge not only considers the interplay between prior education, teacher-training, and situational constraints, but also looks at the ways in which additional aspects of wider societal discourse help to shape multiple, occasionally conflicting, teacher identities.

Adding flesh to the bones of theoretical underpinnings, Chapter 4 comprises a series of vignettes that offer keen insight into the experiences of five South Korean teachers, as they trace their journeys from language learners to classroom teachers. Unsurprisingly, participants vary greatly in their appreciation of changing teaching methodologies. It is fascinating to read about their individual attitudes, ideologies, and strategic considerations of discrete language use, and Rabbidge readily reflects that these often disrupt assumptions of exclusive monolingual instruction. Similarly, the following chapters echo the complex interplay between policy, practice, and personal experience. Chapter 5 quickly identifies the potential for the classroom as a translanguaging space and it is compelling to observe greater linguistic flexibility than the research participants' earlier musings may have implied. Here, extracts of interaction illustrate teachers' translanguaging strategies of inclusion as they fluently blend Korean and English to clarify, elucidate, and ensure understanding. However, this creativity contrasts starkly with examples shared in Chapter 6, where an overreliance on more traditional teaching methods such as initiation–response–feedback (IRF; Sinclair and Coulthard, 1975) or

strict 'no-Korean' guidelines, appear to function as practices of linguistic constraint. Rabbidge shares a fascinating illustration of this through an extract which documents a teacher eliciting animal vocabulary using a mixture of Korean and English, but then explicitly reprimanding students for doing the same. The effect of what Rabbidge calls *restrictive translanguaging* demonstrates that the power to decide which aspects of repertoire are legitimate, and when, lies solely with the teachers. The following chapter on linguistic repertoire reflects at length on contradictory approaches, as Rabbidge returns once more to the themes of Chapter 3. He argues that although teachers may model bilingual identities, they have limited autonomy within the constraints of the education system: equally, they are not immune to circulating discourses of linguistic hierarchies. Therefore, as English continues to wield such symbolic and cultural capital in the country, Rabbidge concludes that it is likely that Korean will remain relegated to a language of instruction and behaviour management.

It is unsurprising then, that Rabbidge's concluding chapter echoes his initial call for change: in a wide-ranging discussion, the author recommends introducing an inclusive translanguaging pedagogy, where bilingual identities are valued and nurtured in the classroom and beyond. This ambitious agenda, however, also includes an updating of teacher-training programmes which, given the reported dominance of linguistic ideologies, as well as wider social stratification, may exceed his circle of influence.

Strengths and weaknesses

Rabbidge's perceptive documentation of translanguaging strategies of inclusion and exclusion (Chapters 5 and 6) is particularly effective at illustrating the tensions between monolingual ideologies and multilingual realities and, although the size of this study may be small, it contributes to an emergent literature of translanguaging in an East Asian context. However, if one were to identify a shortcoming with this book, it could be with the plethora of neologisms designed to capture Rabbidge's observations of teaching/student interaction. Several of the sixteen new terms proposed, such as *facilitative translanguaging* (helping students learn lexical and pragmatic knowledge) or *participatory translanguaging* (peer support to encourage participation) are often taken as implicit characteristics of (trans)languaging pedagogy (see, for example, Otheguy, García, and Reid 2015; Li 2018; Baynham and Lee 2019) and I was therefore not sure that we needed them. Yet, conversely, what such terms and their accompanying illustrative examples could succeed in doing is to make translanguaging more accessible, allowing EFL teachers to make clear links between everyday classroom practice and pedagogic theories that may sometimes appear slippery to define.

Translanguaging as Transformation: The Collaborative Construction of New Linguistic Realities

The volume begins with a powerful foreword by Ofelia García, where she praises the authors for their ability both to extend and challenge her own understanding of translanguaging: clearly this is quite some compliment, coming as it does from a leading scholar in the field. Indeed, as we move into the introduction it becomes clear that the book will not disappoint. Starting with the assumption that translanguaging goes beyond the

linguistic and multimodal, Bradley, Moore, and Simpson approach the concept as a project concerned with exploring meaning-making, co-created through collaboration and driven by notions of social justice. Chapters include studies that critically examine how people from different backgrounds, communities, geographical locations, and positionalities work together, despite sharing differing frames of knowledge. However, while contributions to the book reveal the potential to generate different ways of seeing the world as well as practical changes to everyday realities, there is a strong emphasis on 'critically engag[ing] with notions of transformation and its (im)possibilities' (p. 7).

Content and features of the book

The book is divided into three sections: the first considers the *collaborative relationships* which emerge during research; the second explores the *collaborative processes* of joint endeavours; and the third focuses on *collaborative outcomes*. Each section comprises an introductory comment (nearly a chapter in itself) and is followed by four numbered chapters. Mike Baynham's introduction to 'Collaborative Relationships' begins with a characterization of translanguaging as an ongoing retort to the normativity of monolingualism: this is not without nuance as he also fully acknowledges the privilege that such resistance implies, in that not everyone is in a position to disrupt conventions or to be able to make themselves heard. As such, Baynham suggests that to take a translanguaging stance is first to recognize it as a political project committed to addressing inequitable access to 'power/knowledge/resources' (p. 20). Tracing this theme through each chapter in the section, he describes ways in which researchers attempt to transform environments into spaces for collaborative dialogue and co-production.

Collaborative relationships

Chapter 1 begins with Hawkins's hugely creative StoryBridge project: it documents communication between groups of young people in under-resourced communities in rural Uganda and urban Spain, as they seek to build positive, equitable relationships, and improve linguistic, literacy, and technological skills. In places it makes for a somewhat uncomfortable read, as it is clear that although shared videos sent between the groups promote transnational dialogue, the ability to communicate does not necessarily foster sustainable relations. In the absence of shared perspectives, learning environments require careful scaffolding to nurture an understanding of the lived realities of others. Remaining in a virtual context, Simpson (Chapter 2) explores discussion content from an e-seminar held on the ESOL-Research forum, an online platform for teachers and researchers working in the United Kingdom. Exploring the contemporary multilingual classroom, discussions reveal that although pervasive monolingual ideologies and the wider political landscape may challenge inclusive practices, practitioners adopting a translanguaging approach can help to validate and support the multilingual realities of students' lives. Chapter 3 tugs on the heartstrings, as Pöyhönen, Kokkonen, Taarnanen, and Lappalainen introduce us to a collaborative photography project with unaccompanied adolescents seeking asylum in Finland. The researchers' acute sensitivity to ethical responsibilities, attention to reflexivity, and long-term commitment, help to dismantle power asymmetries and create relationships based on trust. In turn,

the cameras empower children to express themselves and allow them to become 'visible' in a place of in-betweenness. The final chapter of this section is located in an educational setting, where Ballena, Masats, and Unamuno document the processes, and co-labour, of designing and implementing a bilingual curriculum in a new community-led, primary school in Argentina, where equal consideration is given to the indigenous language of Wichi, and to the dominant (colonial) language of Spanish. The project illustrates the ways in which communities can create a learning environment where translanguaging not only scaffolds multilingual competence but legitimizes plurilingual realities and thereby holds the potential to improve the 'social, emotional and academic development of the indigenous children' (p. 90).

Collaborative processes

The introduction to the 'Collaborative Processes' section begins with Adrian Blackledge's thoughtful reflections on the thorny aspect of (partial) representation in ethnographic research. Conceding the difficulties in trying to capture 'the whole picture', Blackledge suggests that the rise of alternative, more creative, and more expansive methods of interpreting social research may prove fruitful in generating knowledge and in the dissemination of findings to the wider public. Indeed, as we move through this section, the impact of theatre workshops, collaborative poetry, and arts-based learning certainly illustrates the benefits of collaborations across disciplines. Chapter 5 starts with research which follows a class of children from a linguistically and culturally diverse Parisian school over a period of four years: Aden and Eschenauer's longitudinal study introduces their inspirational 'enactive-performative' approach to language education. In theatre workshops run in collaboration with artists, actors, and language teachers, multilingual children are encouraged to draw on the breadth of their repertoires, which not only enhances their language (awareness) skills but is also shown to increase empathy and appreciation of cultural diversity. The advantages of working 'outside the box' are also explored in Chapter 6, where Andrews, Fay, Frimberger, Tordzro, and Sitholé reveal the benefits of using metaphor, mime, and poetry to shape and enrich shared perspectives on a huge interdisciplinary, multi-sited, multilingual research project. Chapter 7 offers an equally fascinating insight into research practices, as Bradley and Atkinson document their collaboration with young people living in a disadvantaged part of Leeds. Taking care to acknowledge the 'conceptual shift' needed to move from an explicitly linguistic focus to that of 'the *semiotic* and *embodied*" (p. 136, original emphasis), the researchers nevertheless illustrate the transformative affordances of bricolage, as multimodal translingual practices are exemplified through the creative rearticulation of artefacts. In an exploratory piece of work, the final chapter of this section is written collaboratively by teacher/researcher Moore and poet/researcher Tavares Manuel. As the text switches between first- and third-person narratives, poetry, and dialogue, it transpires that the poems can not only index local and wider issues of social justice but also instigate the co-production of knowledge, so central to the beginnings of collaborative work.

Collaborative outcomes

It is fitting that the introduction to the third part, 'Collaborative Outcomes', is penned by Zhu Hua and Li Wei, key translanguaging

scholars whose research has provided inspiration and foundational theorization for much of the work in this volume. Bringing us back to the core tenets of the paradigm, 'Collaborative Outcomes' reminds the reader that a translanguaging approach takes research as a social practice, with collaboration, criticality, and creativity at its core. While collaborative stances break down the implied hierarchies of researcher/researched and create more equitable relationships, the process also prompts reflections as to what constitutes project 'ownership' or 'outcomes'. This is vividly illustrated in Chapter 9, where Lou Harvey's performance art draws on Bakhtinian notions of 'voice' to *transcreate* knowledge. As the production develops from dialogic relationships and narrative voices, including that of the audience, the *transauthorship* disrupts ideas of what counts as collaboration and transforms expectations of 'outcome'. Chapter 10 moves to the more familiar territory of language education, where King and Bigelow explore four hyperlocal, and innovative, approaches to translanguaging pedagogy in Minnesota. We learn that, despite progressive state policies demonstrating an ethical and legal intent to support linguistically inclusive teaching, potentially transformative initiatives frequently prove difficult to sustain, as they grapple with institutional constraints. It is clear that in order to realize improved outcomes a more universal collaboration is needed. The following chapter shares findings from Llompart-Esbert and Nussbaum's participatory project in a linguistically and culturally diverse school in Barcelona and illustrates the benefits of collaboration between students, teachers, and researchers. As the authors trace the different stages of the research, students are gradually empowered to use and appreciate their full linguistic repertoire as they build knowledge. Equally, the teacher's monolingual vision for learning is soon reimagined. The final contribution is an inspirational piece of translanguaging-from-below, where Vallejo Rubinstein gives a rich account of a multi-sited research project in Spain. Drawing on data from an after-school club for children thought to be at risk of not meeting expected (monolingual) standards, the author introduces us to the complex, plurilingual practices of a young reader, who draws on four languages to generate meaning when reading and recounting a story. The researchers generate multimodal transcripts of the reading, in order to induct trainee-teachers into a translanguaging pedagogy, as well as to inform and inspire the creation of resources to be used in the after-school club. Bookending this tome perfectly, Angela Creese's impassioned epilogue responds to García's introductory idea that work in this volume 'starts from the other end' (p. xviii), as she reflects on the ways in which co-designed artistic and aesthetic collaborations offer new opportunities to establish linguistic diversity as a norm, critique and flatten hierarchies and give space to a plurality of 'voices from the margins' (p. 253).

As readers might infer from the amount of space given to this review, a core strength of this book is not only the sheer diversity of contexts and projects represented, but the impressive degree of innovation and creativity that underpin design and implementation. That the research is also co-designed with 'participants', in a critical endeavour to redress multiple inequalities, makes the undertaking(s) ground-breaking: social

justice is clearly at its core. *Translanguaging as Transformation* has very few weaknesses: it fuels the imagination, and compels the reader, especially those of us who work in the field of education, to rethink the way we engage, collaborate, and conduct research, as well as the subjects we teach and the ways that we teach them.

Reflections on translanguaging as (social) practice

So how does translanguaging work in an EFL classroom? As the books in this selection ably illustrate, while on an individual level teachers may appreciate the equitable sentiments behind linguistic inclusion, the institutions and wider contexts in which they work may prove altogether more difficult to persuade. When one also takes into account the conflation between an incredibly profitable market for educational resources, high-stakes international assessment, and the notion of English as a passport to global citizenship, one can begin to see how a heady mix of institutional, commercial, and societal constraints may be hard to navigate (see, for example, Sembiante and Tian, and Hall, in *Envisioning TESOL through a Translanguaging Lens*). Yet, Michael Rabbidge's account, in *Translanguaging in EFL Contexts*, of attempts to introduce translanguaging pedagogy to a fervently 'Teaching English through English' environment in South Korea, suggests that it is not completely futile—just hard work. In contrast, the CUNY-NYSIEB project demonstrates that there is power in numbers. This state-wide initiative in New York, comprising teams of scholars, researchers, doctoral students, teachers, teacher-trainers, and school administrators, succeeded in making huge inroads into changing language policy, classroom practice, and teacher training. This is vividly illustrated in *Translanguaging and Transformative Teaching for Emergent Bilingual Students*, where the team are able to offer an almost step-by-step insight into the remarkable effects of translanguaging on-the-ground.

Yet for many teachers working in a less fertile landscape, the possibilities of juggling linguistic equity and expectations are likely to run second to the more mundane concerns of teaching objectives or exam pressures. Some of these legitimate anxieties raise questions about how theory translates into classroom practice and are explored with nuance in a number of different contexts. While Deroo, Ponzio, and De Costa (Chapter 6 in *Envisioning TESOL through a Translanguaging Lens*), as well as Simpson (Chapter 2 in *Translanguaging as Transformation*), explore the interplay between the wider political climate and teachers' personal language ideologies in the US and UK contexts, respectively, it is interesting to note that these studies are undertaken in countries that are said to recognize 'English' as their national language. So how then do teachers working in postcolonial or predominantly EMI contexts reconcile flexible languaging with the ideological conditions into which they have been inducted through education or lived experience? Although *English-Medium Instruction and Translanguaging* and *Envisioning TESOL Through a Translanguaging Lens* present a breadth of fascinating research from an ostensibly celebratory position, there are several chapters which concede real-world practicalities from a more critical perspective. From Andrei, Kibler, and Salerno's account of politely resistant pre-service teachers in the United States (Chapter 5 in *Envisioning TESOL Through a Translanguaging Lens*) to Lau's depiction of an 'engrained coloniality' in Malawian settings, patterns of

hesitancy and reluctance persist (Chapter 10 in *Envisioning TESOL Through a Translanguaging Lens*). Indeed, given the historical and entrenched emphasis on using English-only in the classroom, there is little doubt that the journey to alternative methods of instruction may be a rocky road.

This final comment leads to a theme threading through all five volumes, that of teacher education and professional development. While the exemplary training and support offered by and to those educators working on the CUNY-NYSIEB project can be seen to lead the way in terms of an holistic and networked approach, it is also possible to make positive changes at what may be perceived of as a micro level. The transformation of language practices in the Wichi community in Argentina is a perfect example of working *with*, rather than *on* or *for*, smaller communities to establish a translanguaging-from-below pedagogy (Chapter 4, *Translanguaging as Transformation*). Such examples serve to remind us that the historical and societal discourses that shape local and national educational policies, as well as teaching training, can be reimagined. For as García, Flores, Seltzer, Li, Otheguy, and Rosa (2021:9) argue in their persuasive manifesto, 'existing cultural and linguistic knowledge is neither a barrier nor a bridge to academic language, but rather legitimate on its own terms, and a necessary component in ensuring ... students' success'.

References

Baker, C. 2001. *Foundations of Bilingual Education and Bilingualism* (Third edition). Clevedon: Multilingual Matters.

Baynham, M and **T. K. Lee**. 2019. *Translation and Translanguaging*. London: Routledge

García, O. 2009. *Bilingual Education in the 21st Century*. Oxford: Wiley-Blackwell.

García, O. and **W. Li**. 2014. *Translanguaging: Language, Bilingualism and Education*. London: Palgrave Macmillan.

García, O., **N. Flores**, **K. Seltzer**, **W. Li**, **R. Otheguy**, and **J. Rosa**. 2021. 'Rejecting Abyssal Thinking in the Language and Education of Racialized Bilinguals: A Manifesto.' *Critical Inquiry in Language Studies*. DOI: 10.1080/15427587.2021.1935957.

Jaspers, J. 2018. 'The Transformative Limits of Translanguaging.' *Language and Communication* 58:1–10.

Jaspers, J. 2019. 'Authority and Morality in Advocating Heteroglossia.' *Language, Culture and Society* 1(1):83–105.

Kubota, R. 2016. 'The Multi/Plural Turn, Postcolonial Theory, and Neoliberal Multiculturalism: Complicities and Implications for Applied Linguistics.' *Applied Linguistics* 37(4):1–22.

Li, W. 2018. 'Translanguaging as a Practical Theory of Language.' *Applied Linguistics* 39(1):9–30

Otheguy, R., **O. García** and **W. Reid**. 2015. 'Clarifying Translanguaging and Deconstructing Named Languages: A Perspective from Linguistics.' *Applied Linguistics Review* 6(3):281–307

Ruiz, R. 1984. Orientations in Language Planning. *NABE Journal* 8(2):15–34.

Sinclair, J. and **M. Coulthard**. 1975. *Towards an Analysis of Discourse*. Oxford: Oxford University Press.

Vogel, S. and **O. García**. 2017. 'Translanguaging.' *Oxford Research Encyclopedia of Education*, doi:10.1093/acrefore/9780190264093.013.181

Williams, C. 1994. *Arfarniad o Ddulliau Dysgu ac Addysgu yng Nghyddestun Addysg Uwchradd Ddwyieithog* [*An Evaluation of Teaching and Learning Methods in the Context of Bilingual Secondary Education*]. Bangor: University of Wales.

The author

Emma Brooks works as a lecturer on the Applied Linguistics and TESOL programme at UCL Institute of Education, London, UK. Her doctoral study, 'Translanguaging Health' focused on the role of language in facilitating (in)equalities in healthcare. As an ESOL teacher, she has worked with asylum seekers and (un)settled migrant communities in the UK.

Email: Emma.Brooks@ucl.ac.uk