# Delayed metamorphosis of amphibian larvae facilitates *Batrachochytrium dendrobatidis* transmission and persistence

Daniel Medina<sup>1</sup>, Trenton WJ Garner<sup>2</sup>, Luis María Carrascal<sup>3</sup> and Jaime Bosch<sup>3,4\*</sup>

 <sup>1</sup> Department of Biological Sciences, Derring Hall 2119, Virginia Tech, Blacksburg, VA 24061, USA
 <sup>2</sup> Institute of Zoology, Regent's Park, London NW1 4RY, United Kingdom
 <sup>3</sup> Museo Nacional de Ciencias Naturales, CSIC, José Gutiérrez Abascal 2, 28006 Madrid, Spain
 <sup>4</sup> Centro de Investigación, Seguimiento y Evaluación, Parque Nacional de la Sierra de Guadarrama, Cta. M-604, Km. 27.6, 28740 Rascafría, Spain

Running Head: Amphibian long-lived larvae and chytridiomycosisKey Words: *Batrachochytrium dendrobatidis*; delayed metamorphosis; intraspecific reservoir; overwintered larvae; pathogen transmission

# **Corresponding Author:**

Email address: bosch@mncn.csic.es Phone number: +34 914111328, ext. 1228 Fax number: +34 915645078

## 1 ABSTRACT

2 Highly virulent pathogens that cause host population declines confront the risk of fade-out, but if 3 pathogen transmission dynamics are age-structured, pathogens can persist. Among other features of 4 amphibian biology, variable larval developmental rates generate age structured larval populations, 5 which in theory can facilitate pathogen persistence. We investigated this possibility empirically in a 6 population of Salamandra salamandra in Spain affected by Batrachochytrium dendrobatidis (Bd) at 7 breeding sites that lacked alternative amphibian hosts. None of the adults presented infection by Bd. However, for the larvae, while environmental heterogeneity was the most important predictor of 8 9 infection, the effect on infection dynamics was mediated by transmission from overwintered larvae to 10 new larval recruits, which occurred only in permanent larval habitats. We suggest that interannual Bd 11 maintenance in a host population that experiences mass mortality associated with infection can occur 12 without an environmental reservoir or direct involvement of an alternative host in our study system. 13 However the two aquatic habitat types that support intraspecific reservoirs, permanent streams and 14 ponds, are not ideal habitats for long-term Bd maintenance, either due to poor transmission 15 probability or low host survival respectively. While intraspecific pathogen maintenance due to larval plasticity might be possible at our study sites, this transmission pattern is not without significant risk 16 to the pathogen. The availability of alternative hosts nearby does indicate that permanent Bd fade-out 17 18 is unlikely.

#### **19 INTRODUCTION**

20 Emerging infections are increasingly associated with high levels of host mortality followed by 21 persistent host decline or local extirpation (De Castro & Bolker 2005, Fisher et al. 2012). Pathogens causing catastrophic host responses are put at risk by the rapid, large-scale decline in primary host 22 density, which might reduce the likelihood of successful pathogen transmission (Briggs et al. 2010). 23 Pathogens can compensate against this risk of fade-out (i.e. the pathogen is lost from the host 24 25 population below a density threshold, Bartlett 1960) by exploiting alternative hosts or by environmental persistence outside of a host (De Castro & Bolker 2005, Garner et al. 2006). However, 26 27 both of these strategies also entail risk for the pathogen. Alternative hosts can exhibit significant resistance to infection (Agrawal 2000) and intraspecific contacts may be significantly more likely 28 29 than interspecific contacts, reducing the opportunity for interspecific transmission events (Ruiz-30 González et al. 2012). Similarly, environmental pathogen stages may not survive for extended periods 31 of time outside of a host, or withstand shifts in environmental conditions (Fuller et al. 2012).

32 Pathogens can compensate for these risks by adopting strategies that allow them to exploit the 33 primary host exclusively even when causing it to suffer mass mortality. As long as host mortality 34 remains low enough to allow at least some new infections to occur (i.e., the pathogen's basic reproductive ratio  $R_0 > 1$ ), even highly virulent and generalist pathogens can be maintained in a single 35 36 host system (Briggs et al. 2010). Within this context, the ecological setting (e.g. different habitats) may offer opportunities for virulent pathogens and highly susceptible hosts to coexist even when 37 38 hosts experience mass mortalities. Moreover, if host mortality is age-dependent, and survival of the susceptible age class allows for sufficient recruitment into older age classes, high rates of age-specific 39 40 mortality may be tolerated and infection maintained in the single host species population as has been 41 observed in the infection dynamic between the larvae of tiger salamanders (Ambystoma tigrinum stebbinsi) and Ranavirus, ATV (Brunner et al. 2004). 42

Typically, larval amphibians either accelerate development in response to environmental risk or delay
metamorphosis in resource-constrained environments until sufficient resources are accrued to ensure

45 increased post-metamorphic survival exceeding that experienced by those that do not delay 46 metamorphosis (reviewed in Wells 2007). Thus, it is not uncommon, due to either developmental 47 plasticity or multiyear larval period, for different cohorts of larvae to overlap in the same 48 environment, potentially offering pathogens the opportunity to be transmitted amongst age classes.

The fungus Batrachochytrium dendrobatidis (Bd), which causes the emergent infectious disease 49 chytridiomycosis, has been implicated in amphibian population declines and extinction worldwide 50 51 (Fisher et al. 2012). In the Bd-amphibian host system, age-specific transmission dynamics amongst 52 dissimilar age classes has been examined mathematically by Briggs et al. (2010) in an American 53 anuran species. Maintenance of Bd in an anuran population facilitated by a larval reservoir has also been postulated for another anuran species in Europe (Walker et al. 2010). Although post-54 metamorphic mortality was and continues to be extremely high in both species, host population 55 56 persistence is a strong indication that at some locations enough animals survive to adulthood to 57 enable population persistence (Briggs et al. 2010, Walker et al. 2010).

58 In the amphibian-Bd system, while a role for delayed maturation of early developmental stages in 59 pathogen maintenance has been justified mathematically (Briggs et al. 2005), empirical data in 60 support of theory are scant. This is because delayed development is exhibited by some larvae in all populations described in Briggs et al. (2010) and at all high-elevation sites studied by Walker et al. 61 62 (2010), and potential alternative hosts occur in both systems (Reeder et al. 2012). To ascertain if host 63 developmental plasticity is a key factor in pathogen maintenance, it would be necessary to compare infection dynamics across geographically proximate populations with and without delayed 64 metamorphosis and eliminate the potential for pathogen maintenance via alternative hosts. 65

Here we report a comparative study of infection dynamics in larval populations of the fire salamander, *Salamandra salamandra*. At high elevation sites in Western Europe, larvae of this species commonly delay metamorphosis and overwinter in water at rearing sites. However, at some of these locations water may be ephemeral, obliging larvae to complete metamorphosis in the same season that they were deposited into the water. In Guadarrama National Park of Spain, infection with 71 Bd causes both pre- and post-metamorphic mortality (Bosch & Martínez-Solano 2006). After the 72 local extirpation of Alytes obstetricans in the study area (Bosch et al. 2001), fire salamander larvae became the sole occupants of many larval rearing sites throughout the year (Bosch, unpublished 73 data), and the natural history of the species ensures that only female adults make contact with rearing 74 75 sites, and then only fleetingly (Wake 1993, Schmidt et al. 2007). In our study, we used field data of larval infection to determine if infection in cohorts of new (young of year, YoY) larvae could be the 76 77 result of cohabitation with infected, overwintered (OW) larvae. We also examined how interactions 78 between YoY and OW larvae were affected by rearing site hydrology (ponds vs. streams) and 79 sampled adults to see if they act as potential pathogen reservoirs in the system. In order to place 80 pathogen dynamics in a broader context, we surveyed S. salamandra rearing sites across Guadarrama N.P. for dead larvae and recently metamorphosed juveniles. Although the biology of the Bd-81 82 amphibian interaction hypothetically allows for the observed infection dynamic, our results provide some of the first empirical evidence that intraspecific infection with Bd could be possible without 83 84 alternative hosts and that interactions between different larval age classes play a pivotal role in Bd 85 maintenance.

86

# 87 METHODS

#### 88 Study design

Salamandra salamandra adults and larvae were sampled in 2011 at 8 larval rearing sites located in Guadarrama N.P., Central Spain (40°50'N, 3°57'W). Sites were located within 800 meters of each other in the same drainage and at nearly identical elevations. Streams (n = 4) and ponds (n = 4) were evenly divided between permanent and temporary (i.e., dried completely each season) sites. Pond surface ranged from 60 to 5452 m<sup>2</sup> and stream lengths ranging from 45.5 to 325 m were included. We visited each site 3 to 5 times between late May and August, weather permitting.

# 95 Field methods

### 96 Density and infection surveys

We counted all visible larvae by walking along transects that covered  $\sim 90$  % of the stream. Ponds 97 were small enough that we were able to walk around the entire perimeter and count all visible larvae 98 within 1-2 m of the shoreline. Due to the small size of the ponds, narrowness of streams (< 1m) and 99 the transparency of the water, this method provides the most accurate larval density estimates in this 100 101 system (Martínez-Solano et al. 2003). To facilitate comparison between streams and ponds we converted larval counts to densities in animals m<sup>-1</sup>. We sampled any adult salamanders that we 102 encountered within 1-2 m of the shoreline for evidence of infection with Bd by running a fine-tipped 103 104 swab (MW100; Medical Wire and Equipment Ltd., Wiltshire, England) repeatedly over the epidermis of the abdominal region (10 strokes), all four limbs and digits of each foot (5 strokes/limb). Briefly, 105 all adults and larvae were handled with a pair of powder-free nitrile gloves and although Bd is known 106 107 to occur across the study area, gloves were changed among sites in order to avoid cross-site 108 contamination. Using nets that were sterilized among sites, we randomly captured 20 or 40 larvae at 109 each site, once during the spring surveys (early June) and once during the summer surveys (late August) and sampled each for evidence of infection with Bd similarly as described above, with the 110 111 exception that the whole body of the larvae was swabbed (20 strokes total). Dry swabs were stored at 4°C until being processed in the laboratory. Sample sizes differed between sites based on the presence 112 113 of OW larvae. Up to 40 larvae were swabbed at sites where both YoY and OW larvae occurred (i.e. permanent sites in May-June), swabbing up to 20 from each category, and up to 20 YoY were 114 115 sampled at locations where OW larvae were absent (i.e. temporal sites and permanent sites in August). This is because early in the season (May-June), both overwintering larvae from the previous 116 year and new larvae of the current year are found at permanent sites. However, later in the season 117 (August), the overwintering larvae have metamorphosed (or died), and therefore, the sites contained 118 only the current year larvae. OW larvae are distinguished from the small dull grayish-brown YoY by 119 120 their larger body size, and blackish coloration with the presence of golden-yellowish dorsal spots on both sides of the head. All animals were unharmed and released at point of capture immediately after 121 122 sampling.

In addition, a parallel survey was conducted with the help of the local park staff to collect and collate dead animals counts for all water bodies located within the park boundaries that have been identified as *S. salamandra* rearing sites. Every site was surveyed for dead larval and recently metamorphosed juveniles 6 times every year, and we report findings for the two years immediately preceding the infection survey and for that same year.

#### 128 Laboratory analysis

129 DNA extraction and qPCR amplification was conducted following the protocol of Boyle et al. (2004) 130 using a 96 well CFX machine (BioRad). Each sample was run in duplicate against duplicate standards of 0.1, 1, 10 and 100 zoospore genomic equivalents (GE) and two negative controls. We considered 131 132 an animal infected if both duplicates amplified with a mean GE of 0.1. We used an internal positive control (IPC) to measure PCR inhibition in randomly selected samples that tested negative for Bd 133 infection. Following the methodology of Hyatt et al. (2007), a VICTM labelled synthetic amplicon 134 was used as the IPC (VICTM dye, Applied Biosystems). The IPC was included in one of each 135 136 duplicate well as 1 µl 10x Exo IPC mix and 0.5 µl 50x Exo IPC DNA.

#### 137 Statistical analyses

138 General Linear Mixed Models (GLMM) were applied to analyze Bd infection (BdI) dynamics in salamander larvae. The sampling site was considered as a random factor, the habitat, water 139 140 permanence, larval stage and month as fixed factors, and larval density as the fixed covariate. The 141 random factor "site" was nested within the corresponding levels of the fixed factors. The mean square 142 (MS) and the degrees of freedom (df) of the error terms were estimated following Satterthwaite's method, which finds the linear combinations of sources of random variation that serve as appropriate 143 144 error terms for testing the significance of the respective effect of interest. We used the unconstrained 145 parameters model to test the significance of the fixed effect of the covariate, where its error term was the interaction of the covariate with the random factor "site" (Quinn & Keough 2002). This analytical 146 procedure is very conservative, because it solves the problem of inflated sample sizes by reducing the 147 148 degrees of freedom of the error terms and avoids pseudoreplication (i.e. the proper sample unit for the 149 fixed effects is the sampling locality "site" and not every salamander larvae captured in the field). Bd infection was transformed using the Box-Cox transformation prior to data analyses (lambda=-1.56; 150  $BdI' = [(BdI+1)^{-1.56}-1]/-1.56)$ . Homoscedasticity and normality of residuals of the GLMMs were 151 checked and they did not show considerable deviations from the canonical assumptions. Due to the 152 153 existence of missing cells (i.e., the lack of data at several levels of the interactions among fixed factors; e.g., 'month x larval stage', 'larval stage x permanence', 'month x permanence') three 154 GLMM were carried out: (a) one including the whole sample of salamander larvae and all factors 155 156 excluding the month, (b) another including the month but restricted to permanent sites of the permanence factor, and finally (c) one examining the *Bd* infection of YoY in August as the response 157 to determine if *Bd* infection of OW in June was a significant predictor. In the second GLMM, we 158 159 used two planned *a priori* comparisons to attain greater statistical power, testing for the effect of 160 larval stage (YoY vs OW) within the sample of larvae collected in June, and testing for the effect of months (June vs August) using the sample of new YoY larvae. Data were analyzed using StatSoft's 161 Statistica 12 (StatSoft Inc, Tulsa, Oklahoma). 162

163

# 164 RESULTS

165 A total of 364 larvae and 116 adults of S. salamandra were swabbed. None of the adults tested positive for infection. IPCs showed that there was no evidence of PCR inhibition in any of the 166 samples. Table 1 shows the average figures of prevalence and infection intensity of salamander larvae 167 (original, non-transformed data) according to habitat type, water permanence of water bodies and 168 larval stage. The General Linear Mixed Model with all data ( $F_{12,351}$ = 50.33, p << 0.001, 63.2% of the 169 170 variance accounted for; Table 2) showed that Bd infection intensity in salamander larvae was not affected by larval density, and was significantly influenced by the larval stage, type of breeding 171 habitat and permanence. No significant differences were found across the 'site' factor in infection 172 intensity. There were significant interactions among the fixed factors 'permanence x type of breeding 173 habitat' and 'larval stage x type of breeding habitat'. Bd infection intensity was greater in 174

ጰ

175 salamanders from permanent ponds, and was absent or weak with little variation in salamanders occupying temporary water bodies and permanent streams, respectively. Also, Bd infection intensity 176 of salamander larvae in ponds was greater in OW than in YoY larvae (we could not estimate the 177 remaining interaction terms due to missing cells in the data; see Methods). Habitat type and larval 178 stage were the predictors with the highest magnitude effects (partial  $\eta^2$ ) that also explained the largest 179 amount of the variance in Bd infection intensity, followed by the interaction term 'type of habitat x 180 larval stage', while the influence of the site and the larval density inside water bodies were negligible. 181 182 The second General Linear Mixed Model showed that the effects on infection intensity of larval stage (YoY vs OW) within the sample of larvae collected in June ( $F_{1,5}$ = 57.44, p < 0.001), and of months 183 (June vs August) within the sample of new young of the year (YoY) larvae ( $F_{1,5}$ = 37.94, p = 0.002) 184 were highly significant (after controlling for the effect of site, larval density and type of habitat; see 185

greater in August than in June in new YoY salamander larvae inhabiting permanent water bodies,

Methods for statistical details regarding a design with missing cells). Bd infection intensity was

while Bd infection intensity was also greater in OW than in new YoY larvae inhabiting permanent 188

189 water bodies in June.

190 Finally, during parallel field surveys, dead salamanders were found more frequently at locations with permanent water than at temporary ponds across Guadarrama N.P. (Table 3). Taken together, these 191 192 results suggest that differences in type of breeding habitats and permanence, which foster large, 193 overwintering larvae, were critical in driving Bd infection intensities.

194

186

187

#### DISCUSSION 195

196 Our results show that the type of habitat and larval stage were the most important predictors of Bd197 occurrence (which imply transmission to newly deposited larvae), and these were closely followed by 198 the factor of water permanence (Table 2). A mechanistic link between water availability and the persistence of Bd is generally accepted based on the physiological needs of this fungal pathogen 199 200 (Kriger & Hero 2007). Thus, although Bd can persist in moist sand for extended periods of time

201 (Johnson & Speare 2005), drying at four of our eight study locations might have been lethal to any Bd that might be present in the environment given its sensitivity to desiccation (Johnson et al. 2003, 202 Garmyn et al. 2012). At the three sites where infection persisted (i.e., two permanent ponds and one 203 permanent stream), infection intensity in larval cohorts was significantly reduced when water was 204 205 flowing rather than standing. Environmental conditions restricted to the aquatic environment can have a direct effect on transmission rate and infection dynamics by altering the density of viable zoospores 206 207 (Schmeller et al. 2014). Increased water flow rate should also reduce the density of infectious 208 particles that are available for transmission and reduce the likelihood that successful transmission will 209 occur. In contrast, Kriger & Hero (2007) also described a significant difference in Bd prevalence 210 when comparing amphibian infection data generated from sites with standing versus flowing water, 211 but instead found that frogs at streams were more likely to be infected than those at ponds. The 212 difference between these two studies is likely attributable to susceptibility differences across species: 213 post-metamorphic stages of our focal species are not carrying the fungus, whereas in Kriger & Hero 214 (2007) adult frogs were heavily infected. Therefore, our system excludes any influence of the 215 terrestrial contact rates on transmission dynamics.

216 Despite the consistent effect of water dynamics on infection in our system, the necessity of an aquatic 217 environment for the survival and persistence of Bd has been challenged by detection of infection in 218 strictly terrestrial amphibian species (e.g. Weinstein 2009). Permanent water is also not a guarantee 219 for zoospore survival (Schmeller et al. 2014). Although recent evidence suggested that Bd can persist 220 in the water through the year in pond habitats, the detection probability of Bd increased as density of 221 amphibians increased at the sampling sites (Chestnut et al. 2014). Thus, efforts to detect environmentally persistent forms of the fungus in aquatic habitats (including water bodies in 222 223 Guadarrama N.P.) suggest that persistence outside the host in water is limited and that detection of Bd 224 in aquatic environments is predicated on the presence of infected animals at the time of sampling 225 (Kirshtein et al. 2007, Walker et al. 2007, Hossack et al. 2009). Certainly, the lack of transmission to YoY at ephemeral sites cannot be directly attributed to pond or stream drying over the course of our 226 field season, as water was present at all four sites during our August surveys. We can also eliminate 227

228 the potential for vertical transmission, as none of the adults we sampled in the area exhibited detectable infections. Instead, our data suggest that OW larvae -which did not occur at ephemeral 229 230 sites as drying either forced larvae to complete metamorphosis or die, leaving these sites unoccupied for the incoming cohort of larvae in the subsequent year- drive infection dynamics in this system. We 231 232 conclude that the effect of water permanence on infection dynamics was potentially driven through its direct effect on the presence of the intraspecific reservoir OW larvae. As argued in Fisher et al. 233 234 (2009), the amphibian host is the primary environment for *Bd*, thus maintenance of infection in a host 235 species and its ability to transmit infection to susceptible hosts should be the most important 236 predictors of pathogen persistence.

237 Field experiments investigating transmission probabilities of Bd in larval populations have shown that site effects are interactive with host density (Rachowicz & Briggs 2007). This may go some way to 238 239 explaining why larval abundance was not an important factor affecting infections in our system, which should be the case if transmission was density-dependent (Table 2). The few attempts that have 240 been made to determine the transmission function of *Bd* are inconsistent in their support of wholly 241 242 density-dependent transmission (Rachowicz & Briggs 2007, Briggs et al. 2010). The probability of transmitting *Bd* resulting in sustained infections may instead be more strongly affected by factors that 243 influence the frequency of individual transmission events, such as temperature (Fernández-244 245 Beaskoetxea et al. 2015), rather than the frequency of individual transmission events alone. Infections 246 in even highly susceptible host species are often lost then reacquired through subsequent re-exposure. 247 and threshold burdens are associated with clearance and maintenance of infection, as well as host 248 mortality; burdens that are realized through re-exposure and re-infection (Briggs et al. 2010, 249 Vredenburg et al. 2010).

Although the presence of OW larvae strongly influences transmission to YoY larvae at our study sites, transmission to and reinfection of YoY is likely a process that continues after OW larvae have completed metamorphosis. Infection intensity of larval cohorts was weak at permanent stream sites and remains so across the season, which we attribute to the diluting effect of running water. In comparison, significant amplification of infection intensity in YoY larvae, between June and August 255 in permanent ponds, indicates that the processes of transmission and intensification of infections are better supported in permanent ponds and ongoing across the sampling period. Permanent stream sites 256 therefore represent a riskier environment for age-specific, single host species maintenance of Bd in 257 258 Guadarrama N.P. Nevertheless, YoY sampled at the end of the season in ponds with permanent water 259 exhibited weaker infections than their OW reservoir counterparts at the beginning of the sampling 260 period. Thus, although our study did not look at interannual patterns of infections, we would expect 261 that in the following year the remaining larvae will exhibit higher infection levels (i.e., similar to 262 those of the OW we sampled).

263 Although we conclude that Bd infection can be maintained in S. salamandra populations through 264 intraspecific transmission among larval age classes, it remains unresolved whether infection can be sustained over the long term exclusively in this species without the benefit of an interspecific or 265 266 environmental reservoir. Our study indicates that intraspecific dynamics at permanent streams are more likely to favour host persistence due to decreased intensity of infections compared to permanent 267 268 ponds, and in the long run might also favour pathogen fade out. Transmission dynamics at ponds 269 instead favour pathogen persistence over the short term. Importantly, declines of S. salamandra were 270 documented predominantly at pond locations and local extirpation associated with chytridiomycosis 271 was recorded at many of these ponds (Bosch & Martínez-Solano 2006). Salamanders are still dying 272 due to chytridiomycosis, and at much higher rates at locations with permanent water (Table 3). Extirpation of OW larvae from a pond site could presumably be compensated for through 273 274 recruitment, but without the reservoir, the persistence of *Bd* at such a location seems highly unlikely. 275 Overall, while the maintenance of Bd infection in S. salamandra without an exogenous source of 276 infection in sites with OW larvae appears possible from our study, for the long term, the strategy is risky for the pathogen. 277

Persistence of *S. salamandra* at Guadarrama N.P. is also uncertain. Our survey data shows that the mortality rate that likely contributed to previously recorded extirpations is ongoing (Table 3). *Salamandra salamandra* existence at higher elevations is closely linked to the ability of larvae to delay metamorphosis and as we have shown this strategy requires that water be available throughout 282 the year. Ponds are a more reliable permanent water body than streams, as they are far more common in the park, and far less likely to dry out than streams. If Bd does render these locations unavailable to 283 S. salamandra larvae, the overwintering strategy will be far less suitable. Notwithstanding, there is 284 reason to be more optimistic than when Bd was first detected in the park (Bosch et al. 2001). 285 286 Salamanders were thought to be in decline in Guadarrama N.P. and infection with Bd was considered to be the culprit (Bosch & Martínez-Solano 2006), but more recent surveys suggest that the park 287 population may be at a relatively stable equilibrium (J. Bosch, unpublished data). Although adult 288 289 salamanders are susceptible to lethal disease under high Bd intensity (Bosch & Martínez-Solano 2006), after the near extirpation of A. obstetricans from our study sites they appear not to contract 290 infections. Irrespective, persistence of Bd and S. salamandra at Guadarrama N.P. cannot be predicted 291 292 based on intraspecific infection and transmission dynamics. Within this context, the recently 293 described amphibian pathogen, Batrachochytrium salamandrivorans (Bsal), although not present at this point at the study site (Martel et al. 2014), would potentially affect the interaction between Bd 294 and S. salamandra due to its high virulence to S. salamandra and lower thermal range for optimal 295 296 growth compared to Bd (Martel et al. 2013).

297 Considering the infection dynamic we described and the threat posed by *Bsal*, mitigation strategies at 298 the Guadarrama N.P. to allow future amphibian reintroductions should focus on the life-history stages 299 that undergo extended periods of exposure to the pathogen (Scheele et al. 2014). Therefore, reducing transmission events between larval stages of S. salamandra at permanent ponds could be an effective 300 301 starting point, while also assuring the conservation of habitats (with established S. salamandra larvae 302 populations) that are unsuitable for Bd transmission, such as permanent streams. On the other hand, 303 Guadarrama N.P. is host to several other amphibian species, including hosts that can harbour 304 infections. Whatever the fate of Bd in single host species populations, it is unlikely to be extirpated 305 from the area and the pattern of amphibian host decline still continues.

#### **307 ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS**

We thank J. L. Hite for statistical advise and field assistance, S. Fernández-Beaskoetxea for field
assistance, the people working at the Guadarrama National Park for field data, facilities and permits,
and Fundación General CSIC, Banco Santander and BioDiversa project RACE for financial support.

311

# 312 **BIBLIOGRAPHY**

- Agrawal AA (2000) Host-range evolution: adaptation and trade-offs in fitness of mites on alternative
  hosts. Ecology 81:500–508
- Bartlett MS (1960) The critical community size for measles in the United States. *J R Stat Soc* A
  123:37-44
- Bosch J, Martínez-Solano I (2006) Chytrid fungus infection related to unusual mortalities of *Salamandra salamandra* and *Bufo bufo* in the Penalara Natural Park, Spain. Oryx 40:84-89
- Bosch J, Martínez-Solano I, García-París M (2001) Evidence of a chytrid fungus infection involved
- in the decline of the common midwife toad (*Alytes obstetricans*) in protected areas of central
  Spain. Biol Conserv 97:331–337
- Boyle DGD, Boyle DBD, Olsen VV, Morgan JATJ, Hyatt ADA (2004) Rapid quantitative detection

323 of chytridiomycosis (Batrachochytrium dendrobatidis) in amphibian samples using real-time

- 324 Taqman PCR assay. Dis Aquat Org 60:141–148
- Briggs CJ, Knapp RA, Vredenburg VT (2010) Enzootic and epizootic dynamics of the chytrid fungal
  pathogen of amphibians. Proc Natl Acad Sci USA 107:9695–9700
- 327 Briggs CJ, Vredenburg VT, Knapp RA, Rachowicz LJ (2005) Investigating the population-level
- effects of chytridiomycosis: an emerging infectious disease of amphibians. Ecology 86:3149–
- 329 3159

- 330 Brunner JL, Schock DM, Davidson EW, Collins JP (2004) Intraspecific reservoirs: complex life
- history and the persistence of a lethal ranavirus. Ecology 85:560–566
- Chestnut T, Anderson Ch, Popa R, Blaustein AR, Voytek M, Olson DH, Kirshtein J (2014)
  Heterogeneus occupancy and density estimates of the pathogenic fungus *Batrachochytrium dendrobatidis* in waters of North America. PloS ONE 9:e106790
- 335 De Castro F, Bolker B (2005) Mechanisms of disease-induced extinction. Ecol Lett 8:117–126
- 336 Fernández-Beaskoetxea S, Carrascal LM, Fernández-Loras A, Fisher MC, Bosch J (2015) Short term
- 337 minimum water temperatures determine levels of infection by the amphibian chytrid fungus in
- *Alytes obstetricans* tadpoles. PLoS ONE 10:e0120237
- 339 Fisher MC, Garner TWJ, Walker SF (2009) Global Emergence of Batrachochytrium dendrobatidis
- and Amphibian Chytridiomycosis in Space, Time, and Host. Annual Review of Microbiology
  63:291–310
- Fisher MC, Henk DA, Briggs CJ, Brownstein JS, Madoff LC, McCaw SL, Gurr SJ (2012) Emerging
  fungal threats to animal, plant and ecosystem health. Nature 484:186–194
- Fuller E, Elderd BD, Dwyer G (2012) Pathogen persistence in the environment and insect-
- baculovirus interactions: disease-density thresholds, epidemic burnout, and insect outbreaks. The
  Am Nat 179:E70–E96
- 347 Garmyn A, Van Rooij P, Pasmans F, Hellebuyck T, Van Den Broeck W, Haesebrouck F, Martel A
- 348 (2012) Waterfowl: potential environmental reservoirs of the chytrid fungus *Batrachochytrium* 349 *dendrobatidis*. PLoS ONE 7:e35038
- 350 Garner TWJ, Perkins MW, Govindarajulu P, Seglie D, Walker S, Cunningham AA, Fisher MC
- 351 (2006) The emerging amphibian pathogen *Batrachochytrium dendrobatidis* globally infects
- introduced populations of the North American bullfrog, *Rana catesbeiana*. Biol Lett 2:455–459
- 353 Hossack BR, Muths E, Anderson CW, Kirshtein JD, Corn PS (2009) Distribution limits of

*Batrachochytrium dendrobatidis*: a case study in the Rocky Mountains, USA. J Wildl Dis
45:1198–1202

Johnson ML, Speare R (2005) Possible modes of dissemination of the amphibian chytrid

Hyatt AD, Boyle DG, Olsen V, Boyle DB, Berger L, Obendorf D, Dalton A, Kriger K, Hero M,

Hines H, Phillott R, Campbell R, Marantelli G, Gleason F, Colling A (2007). Diagnostic assays

and sampling protocols for the detection of Batrachochytrium dendrobatidis. Dis Aquat Org

356

357

358

359

360

73:175-192

361 Batrachochytrium dendrobatidis in the environment. Dis Aquat Org 65:181-186 362 Johnson ML, Berger L, Phillips L, Speare R (2003) Fungicidal effects of chemical disinfectants, UV 363 light, desiccation and heat on the amphibian chytrid, Batrachochytrium dendrobatidis. Dis Aquat Org 57:255-260 364 Kirshtein JD, Anderson CW, Wood JS, Longcore JE, Voytek MA (2007) Quantitative PCR detection 365 366 of Batrachochytrium dendrobatidis DNA from sediments and water. Dis Aquat Org 77:11-15 367 Kriger KM, Hero J-M (2007) The chytrid fungus Batrachochytrium dendrobatidis is non-randomly 368 distributed across amphibian breeding habitats. Diversity Distrib 13:781-788 Martel A, Spitzen-van der Sluijs A, Blooi M, Bert W, Ducatelle R, Fisher MC, Woeltjes A, Bosman 369 370 W, Chiers K, Bossuyt F, Pasmas F (2013) Batrachochytrium salamandrivorans sp. nov. causes lethal chytridiomycosis in amphibians. Proc Natl Acad Sci USA 110:15325-15329 371 372 Martel A, Blooi M, Adriaensen C, Van Rooij P, Beukema W, Fisher MC, Farrer RA, Schmidt BR, 373 Tobler U, Goka K, Lips KR, Muletz C, Zamudio KR, Bosch J, Lötters S, Wombwell E, Garner 374 TWJ, Cunningham AA, Spitzen-van der Sluijs A, Salvidio S, Ducatelle R, Nishikawa K, Nguyen 375 TT, Kolby JE, Van Bocxlaer I, Bossuyt F, Pasmas F (2014) Recent introductions of a chytrid 376 fungus endangers Western Paleartic salamanders. Science 346:630-631 377 Martínez-Solano I, Bosch J, García-París M (2003) Demographic trends and community stability in a

378

montane amphibian assemblage. Conser Biol 17:238-244

Quinn GP, Keough MJ (2002) Experimental Design and Data Analysis for Biologists. Cambridge
University Press, Cambridge

Rachowicz LJ, Briggs CJ (2007) Quantifying the disease transmission function: effects of density on
 *Batrachochytrium dendrobatidis* transmission in the mountain yellow-legged frog *Rana*

383 *muscosa*. J Anim Ecology 76:711–721

- Reeder NMM, Pessier AP, Vredenburg VT (2012) A reservoir species for the emerging amphibian
  pathogen *Batrachochytrium dendrobatidis* thrives in a landscape decimated by disease. PLoS
  ONE 7:e33567
- 387 Ruiz-González MX, Bryden J, Moret Y, Reber-Funk C, Schmid-Hempel P, Brown MJF (2012)

388 Dynamic transmission, host quality, and population ptructure in a multihost parasite of
389 bumblebees. Evolution 66:3053–3066

390 Scheele BC, Hunter DA, Grogan LF, Berger L, Kolby JE, McFadden MS, Marantelli G, Skerratt LF,

391 Driscoll DA (2014) Interventions for reducing extinction risk in chytridiomycosis-threatened
 392 amphibians. Conserv Biol 28:1195–1205

393 Schmeller DS, Blooi M, Martel A, Garner TWJ, Fisher MC, Azerman F, Clare FC, Leclerc C, Jäger

L, Guevara-Nieto M, Loyau A, Pasmas F (2014) Microscopic aquatic predators strongly affect
 infection dynamics of a globally emerged pathogen. Curr Biol 24:176–180

396 Schmidt BR, Schaub M, Steinfartz S (2007) Apparent survival of the salamander Salamandra

*salamandra* is low because of high migratory activity. Front Zool 4:19

- Vredenburg VT, Knapp RA, Tunstall TS, Briggs CJ (2010) Dynamics of an emerging disease drive
   large-scale amphibian population extinctions. Proc Natl Acad Sci USA 107:9689–9694
- 400 Wake MH (1993) Evolution of oviductal gestation in amphibians. J Exp Zool 266:394–413
- 401 Walker SF, Baldi Salas M, Jenkins D, Garner T, Cunningham AA, Hyatt AD, Bosch J, Fisher MC

- 402 (2007) Environmental detection of *Batrachochytrium dendrobatidis* in a temperate climate. Dis
  403 Aquat Org 77:105–112
- 404 Walker SF, Bosch J, Gomez V, Garner TWJ, Cunningham AA, Schmeller DS, Ninyerola M, Henk
- 405 DA, Ginestet C, Arthur C-P, Fisher MC (2010) Factors driving pathogenicity vs. prevalence of
  406 amphibian panzootic chytridiomycosis in Iberia. Ecol Lett 13:372–382
- 407 Weinstein SB (2009) An aquatic disease on a terrestrial salamander: individual and population level
- 408 effects of the amphibian chytrid fungus, *Batrachochytrium dendrobatidis*, on *Batrachoseps*
- 409 *attenuatus* (Plethodontidae). Copeia 2009:653–660.
- 410 Wells KD (2007) The ecology and behavior of amphibians. University of Chicago Press, Chicago

Table 1. The effect of habitat type (pond / stream), water permanence (temporary / permanent) of
water bodies and larval stage (young of year, YoY / overwintered, OW) on prevalence and *Bd*infection intensity of salamander larvae (mean and SD of zoospore genomic equivalents). N: number
of salamander larvae.

417	Permanence	Habitat	Larval stage	Ν	Prevalence	Infection inter	nsity	
418						mean	SD	
419	Permanent	Pond	OW	40	0.975	38.47	34.02	
420	Permanent	Pond	YoY	80	0.438	5.17	18.09	
421	Permanent	Stream	OW	40	0.075	0.41	1.46	
422	Permanent	Stream	YoY	80	0.063	0.05	0.35	
423	Temporary	Pond	OW		not applicable			
424	Temporary	Pond	YoY	60	0.000	0.00	0.00	
425	Temporary	Stream	OW	not applicable				
426	Temporary	Stream	YoY	64	0.000	0.00	0.00	

Table 2. Results of a general linear mixed-model of Bd infection in salamander larvae (Box-Cox 428 429 transformed) in relation to larval density (fixed covariate), type of habitat (pond vs stream), 430 permanence (permanent vs temporary), and larval stage (young of year vs overwintered larvae) as 431 fixed factors, and site as a random factor (nested within the levels of the previous fixed factors). The 432 effect sizes are also given as % of variance explained (according to sum of squares) and partial  $\eta^2$ . The interaction terms 'permanence x type of habitat' and 'larval stage x type of habitat' were only 433 434 estimated considering the missing cells design. Denominator degrees of freedom have been rounded to the nearest unit. For more details on error term definitions, see Methods. 435

	Sum of squares	% variance	partial $\eta^2$	df	F	р
Larval density	0.001	0.00	0.000	1,6	0.03	0.864
Permanence (P)	0.712	3.41	0.784	1,6	23.38	0.002
Type of habitat (TH)	2.847	13.63	0.882	1, 14	105.50	< 0.001
Larval stage (LS)	2.261	10.82	0.921	1,6	73.94	< 0.001
P * TH	0.587	2.81	0.756	1,6	19.09	0.004
LS * TH	1.670	7.99	0.896	1,6	54.63	< 0.001
Site	0.185	0.89	0.024	6, 351	1.41	0.209

Table 3. Counts of ponds located in Guadarrama National Park occupied by *S. salamandra* larvae of any age class. Counts are split by water permanence and data are summed across 3 year's sampling (2009-2011). Numbers in parenthesis are the number of carcasses counted across all ponds in a given water permanence category.

	Number of	Ponds with larvae	Ponds with only	Ponds with observed
	ponds	of any age class	overwintered larvae	mortality
Permanent	29	29	21	7 (58)
Temporary	213	153	0	1 (1)