



**The integration of music and mathematics education in Catalonia and England: Perspectives on theory and practice**

Journal:	<i>Music Education Research</i>
Manuscript ID	CMUE-2016-0016.R1
Manuscript Type:	Original Article
Keywords:	integrated approach, mathematics, music, education

SCHOLARONE™  
Manuscripts

## The integration of music and mathematics education in Catalonia and England: Perspectives on theory and practice

The relationship between music and mathematics has often been the subject of discussion, both inside and outside the field of education. As part of an exciting project on a European scale, the paper explores the changing contexts in Catalonia (Spain) and England (UK) in relation to the integrated approach to the teaching of music and mathematics. We analyse three areas: academic literature, the curriculum frameworks, and publications and resources prepared by and for teachers. Our findings suggest that due to the more favourable attitude towards cross-curricular approaches in education, more progress has been made in England, in terms of developing resources to support an integrated approach to the teaching of music and mathematics, than in Catalonia. Nonetheless, teachers in both locations are very interested in developing these approaches. Although there is a need for further teacher training and support, there is evidence of progress already being made in schools.

Keywords: Integrated approach; mathematics; music

### Introduction

Mathematics education is a major priority across Europe and in many other parts of the world. Attitudes towards music education, however, are more varied. Music education takes many different forms in European schools, albeit on account of the different musical traditions in each country/region, differences in school syllabi, and because initial teacher education (with the option of specialising in music or not) varies from one country to another. Within this mixed landscape, there is an emerging interest in the promotion of a joint, unifying vision of an integrated approach to the teaching and learning of music and mathematics that is of mutual benefit.

In Catalonia and England, there have been repeated curriculum changes over the last 30 years, many of which have been politically driven. Each of these changes has

1  
2  
3 resulted in quite different curricula and educational intentions. Also during this period,  
4  
5 the issue of integrated approaches has often been discussed. In music and mathematics,  
6  
7 integration has usually taken the form of music being used to support children to rote-  
8  
9 learn number facts, but does this represent an integrated approach that benefits both  
10  
11 areas of knowledge?  
12

13  
14 For the purpose of this article we will be defining integrated approaches as those that  
15  
16 seek to develop understanding, knowledge and appreciation of both music and  
17  
18 mathematics at the same time (in the sense suggested by Viladot and Cslovjceksek,  
19  
20 2014).  
21  
22

23  
24 Within the framework of the *Comenius European Music Portfolio-Maths:*  
25  
26 *Sounding Ways into Mathematics* project (2013-2016), we present a range of  
27  
28 educational issues (academic literature, curriculum requirements, publications and  
29  
30 resources for practitioners) in relation to an integrated approach to the teaching and  
31  
32 learning of music and mathematics in Catalonia and England. We hope that this  
33  
34 discussion will help to identify the complex nature of the task, and also the challenges  
35  
36 and opportunities that have arisen in seeking to address this within the Comenius  
37  
38 project.  
39  
40  
41  
42  
43

#### 44 **General overview of the academic literature in Spanish and English**

##### 45 *Existing literature from a Spanish perspective*

46  
47  
48 In a Spanish-speaking context, the literature that relates to music and mathematics in the  
49  
50 field of education is rather limited. This can be inferred from an initial analysis of  
51  
52 articles on this topic published in the main Spanish refereed journals on both music and  
53  
54 mathematics education, as shown by Casals et al. (2014). Among these journals, *Suma*  
55  
56  
57  
58  
59  
60

1  
2  
3 deserves special mention, as this is a mathematics journal review that includes an  
4  
5 important number of the articles published on this topic in a Spanish-speaking context,  
6  
7 most of them written by the same author, Vicente Liern. Liern's articles provide a  
8  
9 theoretical perspective on questions relating mathematics to music and are aimed  
10  
11 primarily at teachers in secondary and higher education (see, e.g., Liern 1994, 2009).  
12

13  
14 Most of the available literature is to be found in publications specialising in the  
15  
16 field of mathematics education and taking a mathematical perspective. The reasons for  
17  
18 this are unclear. It is possible that the scientific and theoretical profile of mathematics,  
19  
20 as compared to the artistic idea that we have of music, is driving this bias. Perhaps also,  
21  
22 a widespread perception that mathematics is more important than music in the  
23  
24 curriculum also has had a decisive influence in this respect.  
25  
26

27  
28 A second level of analysis of the literature surrounding this issue identifies two  
29  
30 main types of publication, namely those adopting a theoretical approach (without  
31  
32 teaching experiences and contributions) and others that provide an applied or  
33  
34 pedagogical approach (with example strategies, materials and classroom activities). In  
35  
36 this first group are found informative articles on specific aspects (e.g., Liern 2008, who  
37  
38 describes the meaning that number seven has in the field of music/ the meaning of  
39  
40 number seven in the field of music), educational research papers (e.g., Villasmil de  
41  
42 Vázquez and Palomares 2007, who examine the influence of music in the development  
43  
44 of logical-mathematical thinking) and studies taking an analytical approach (e.g., Lopez  
45  
46 and Gustems 2007 or Navarra and Cian 1994, who reflect on the connection between  
47  
48 music and mathematics as a basis for interdisciplinary approaches in the classroom).  
49  
50 Although such a pedagogical application is not their main objective, these articles often  
51  
52 propose exercises, especially on mathematical topics, for both mathematics and music  
53  
54 teachers in secondary and higher education.  
55  
56  
57  
58  
59  
60

1  
2  
3 In the second group of publications there is a larger number of works focusing  
4 on music and mathematics in early childhood education (e.g., Ayala et al 2003; Lázaro  
5 and Riaño 2009) and also on secondary education (e.g., Arenzana and Arenzana 1998),  
6 rather than on primary education. This biasing may be because early years practice is  
7 characterised by blurred subject boundaries, whereas subjects are usually much more  
8 distinct at secondary school level. Certainly, the type of music and mathematics content  
9 found in publications relating to secondary education are quite specific (e.g. the  
10 Pythagorean scale, or the connection between fractions and musical notes).  
11  
12  
13  
14  
15  
16  
17  
18  
19

20  
21 Lastly, the literature published in a Spanish-speaking context reveals a stronger  
22 tradition in combining music and mathematics in education in the Latin America region  
23 compared to Spain. An example of this are the projects carried out by Venegas et al.  
24 (2013) in Chile, who developed a computer program with activities relating Maths to  
25 Music, and Bustos (2007) in Argentina, who presented two applied research projects in  
26 the classroom that demonstrate the potential to connect these two fields.  
27  
28  
29  
30  
31  
32  
33  
34  
35  
36

### 37 *Existing literature from an English perspective*

38  
39 Whilst there is much literature published in English which focuses on issues linking  
40 music and mathematics, we will focus here on a few particularly pertinent examples.  
41  
42  
43  
44

45 In terms of actual classroom practices, there have been a number of studies  
46 exploring the integration of mathematics and music teaching (e.g. An et al., 2013; Jones  
47 and Pearson, 2013; Still and Bobis, 2005). However, these seem to have been mostly  
48 short-term interventions, so it is not possible to identify significant impact on overall  
49 curriculum development and practice. The NCTM (National Council of Teachers of  
50 Mathematics, USA) is intending to fund a number of classroom-based studies to  
51  
52  
53  
54  
55  
56  
57  
58  
59  
60

1  
2  
3 investigate the use of music to teach mathematics during the period from June 2016 to  
4  
5 May 2017 ([https://www.nctm.org/Grants-and-Awards/Grants/Using-Music-to-Teach-](https://www.nctm.org/Grants-and-Awards/Grants/Using-Music-to-Teach-Mathematics-Grants/)  
6  
7 [Mathematics-Grants/](https://www.nctm.org/Grants-and-Awards/Grants/Using-Music-to-Teach-Mathematics-Grants/), last accessed 21 January 2016).  
8  
9

10 In a broader sense, there have been a wide range of studies which have tried to  
11 identify the positive effects of music on children's achievement in other areas of the  
12 curriculum, including mathematics. For example, the visual representation of music is  
13 reported to help to develop children's sensory integration and memory (Aizenman et al.,  
14 2013). In addition, playing music from notation, whether formal or informal, has been  
15 reported to help to develop visuo-motor coordination (Brown et al., 1981). Taking such  
16 findings together, alongside the proposal that there is a positive link between children's  
17 visuo-spatial skills and their mathematical attainment (Tosto et al., 2014), implies that  
18 both playing music and notating music can contribute to the development of children's  
19 competence in mathematics.  
20  
21  
22  
23  
24  
25  
26  
27  
28  
29  
30  
31

32 In terms of mathematics education, there is much literature (e.g. Burton, 1984;  
33 Fauvel et al., 2003; Hofstadter, 1979) that has tried to demonstrate the link between  
34 mathematics and music by exploring what is meant by 'mathematical thinking'. By  
35 describing mathematical thinking as relying on pattern recognition, iteration and  
36 repetition, it is easy to see that these processes are found not only in mathematics, but  
37 also in music (*cf* Ockelford, 2005). Moreover, recent work in neuroscience (e.g. Zeki et  
38 al. 2014) suggests that our brains experience beauty in music in the same way as we  
39 experience beauty in mathematics.  
40  
41  
42  
43  
44  
45  
46  
47  
48  
49

50 Finally, the evidence that mathematics is best learned in a context that is  
51 meaningful and engaging for children (Van den Heuvel-Panhuizen, 2001) suggests that,  
52 if mathematics and music are to be approached in an integrated way, teachers will  
53 require appropriate subject knowledge, confidence and creativity within and across  
54  
55  
56  
57  
58  
59  
60

1  
2  
3 these two knowledge areas.  
4  
5  
6

## 7 **Integration of music and mathematics in education**

### 8 ***Curriculum perspectives in Catalonia***

9  
10  
11 Catalonia, as an autonomous community in Spain, holds delegated powers in the field of  
12 education. Since 2007, the school curriculum in Catalonia has been aimed at achieving  
13 eight basic competences. These include mathematical as well as artistic and cultural  
14 competences,<sup>1</sup> although – at present – not all are defined to the same degree of detail  
15 and the artistic and cultural curriculum remains to be developed.  
16  
17  
18  
19  
20  
21  
22

23 The current primary school level curriculum (Departament d'Educació, 2015) is  
24 divided into six fields, which include mathematics and arts education (where music  
25 enters). In relation to arts education, the following goal was established:  
26  
27  
28  
29  
30  
31

32 *Arts education in primary education aims to develop the competences of*  
33 *perception and expression that allow students to understand their environment*  
34 *and the artistic and cultural worlds, and acquire tools to communicate through*  
35 *artistic languages.*  
36  
37  
38  
39

40 (Departament d'Educació, 2015: 103).  
41  
42  
43  
44

45 Within this focus, the arts subject seeks to develop the three following competent  
46 dimensions: a) Perception, comprehension and valuation; b) Performance and  
47 production; c) Imagination and creativity. A part from these dimensions, the curriculum  
48 divides the contents into two parts: exploring and perceiving; and creating and  
49  
50  
51  
52  
53  
54

---

55  
56 <sup>1</sup> The eight competences are as follows: communicative, linguistic and audiovisual; mathematical;  
57 knowledge and interaction with the physical world; artistic and cultural; digital; social and civic; learning  
58 to learn; and autonomy, personal initiative and entrepreneurship.  
59  
60

1  
2  
3 interpreting. On a musical level, this structure coincides in good measure with the  
4  
5 leading musical-didactic tendencies of the present day, based on three areas of  
6  
7 competence: listening, performance and composition (e.g. Swanwick and França, 1999;  
8  
9 Zaragozá, 2009; Malagarriga et al., 2010). In short, the curriculum aims to promote  
10  
11 music education through musical practice and experiences, but barely specifies the  
12  
13 levels of competence to be achieved. Therefore, it allows teachers in Catalonia a great  
14  
15 deal of flexibility when having to adapt the curriculum to their own circumstances.  
16  
17

18  
19 The arts education curriculum focuses on two different subjects: music and dance  
20  
21 on the one hand, and the visual and plastic arts on the other. For all these areas, it is  
22  
23 recommended that teaching should aim at developing communication competences,  
24  
25 which include the artistic and cultural competences, as well as others such as  
26  
27 mathematics. Regarding this latter example, the only recommendation is found in the  
28  
29 previous curriculum (2009) and states that the field of arts should “tackle geometric  
30  
31 concepts and shapes, and work on rhythm and the musical scales” (Departament  
32  
33 d’Educació, 2009: 96).  
34  
35

36  
37 Meanwhile, the mathematics curriculum is focused on “learning mathematics for  
38  
39 everyday life, to help interpret the world around us” (Departament d’Educació, 2015:  
40  
41 61). The main purpose of mathematics education is:  
42  
43  
44

45 *To help train citizens to know the world which they live in and make sure they are*  
46  
47 *able to base their criteria and their decisions on solid foundations and adapt to*  
48  
49 *changes in the different areas of their lives.*  
50

51  
52 (Department d’Educació, 2015: 61).  
53  
54  
55

56 Therefore, mathematics is conceived as an instrument of knowledge, reasoning,  
57  
58  
59  
60

1  
2  
3 and critical analysis of reality and the problems of the environment itself.  
4

5 The mathematics curriculum is inspired by the NCTM Standards for School  
6 Mathematics (National Council of Teachers of Mathematics, 2000) and is organised  
7 into five blocks: numbers and operations, relations/connections and change, space and  
8 form, measurement, and data analysis and probability.<sup>2</sup> In any case, what guides the  
9 teaching-learning process in this area are the mathematical processes to be developed,  
10 which correspond to the aspects that structure mathematical competence: problem  
11 solving, reasoning and proof, connections, communication and representation.  
12  
13  
14  
15  
16  
17  
18  
19

20 Regarding the didactic meeting between music and mathematics in the curriculum  
21 and other official documents in relation to mathematics education at school, we only  
22 find vague references. For example:  
23  
24  
25  
26  
27

28  
29 *It is important to offer different presentations of problems: oral, written, in*  
30 *images, with ICTs, etc. And in different contexts: real, using a story,*  
31 *mathematical and in other areas (science, music, arts, etc.)*  
32  
33

34  
35  
36 (Departament d'Educació, 2013: 11).  
37  
38  
39

40 In contrast, the very focus of the curriculum on competences and the emphasis on  
41 interdisciplinary projects encourages schools to work increasingly with inter- and cross-  
42 disciplinary proposals (González-Martín, 2013).  
43  
44  
45  
46  
47  
48  
49

### 50 ***Curriculum perspectives in England***

51  
52  
53  
54

---

55  
56 <sup>2</sup> The blocks of content 'relations and change' and 'space and form' are equivalent to 'algebra' and 'geometry' in the  
57 NCTM Standards.  
58  
59  
60

1  
2  
3 What does music education look like in English primary schools? As in many other  
4  
5 countries, attempts have been made to design a music curriculum that encompasses  
6  
7 broader musical learning, includes playing an instrument, singing, creating music  
8  
9 (through improvisation and composition) as well as developing understandings of  
10  
11 musical culture and context.  
12

13  
14 The stated aims of music education in England are described as:  
15

16  
17  
18 *'Music is a universal language that embodies one of the highest forms of*  
19  
20 *creativity. A high-quality music education should engage and inspire pupils to*  
21  
22 *develop a love of music and their talent as musicians, and so increase their self-*  
23  
24 *confidence, creativity and sense of achievement. As pupils progress, they should*  
25  
26 *develop a critical engagement with music, allowing them to compose, and to*  
27  
28 *listen with discrimination to the best in the musical canon' (DfE, 2013).*  
29  
30  
31

32  
33  
34 The National Curriculum for Music in England has been revised a number of  
35  
36 times since its inception in 1992 and is now in its fifth iteration. The amount of  
37  
38 specification as to what children should study has recently been reduced, giving schools  
39  
40 a framework in which to develop their own curricula for music. In the previous version  
41  
42 of the curriculum, attainment targets were outlined that gave teachers an indication of  
43  
44 musical progression through the curriculum. The 2013 revision for 2014  
45  
46 implementation removed these attainment targets. This amendment was designed to  
47  
48 encourage schools to develop context specific understandings of musical progress,  
49  
50 based on the particular musical strengths of the school. However, this has resulted in a  
51  
52 national curriculum briefing that gives no guidance to teachers as to how to implement  
53  
54  
55  
56  
57  
58  
59  
60

1  
2  
3 the curriculum, nor how to approach the activities, nor what the teacher's role should be  
4  
5 and what the relationship is between and across activities.  
6

7 What does mathematics education look like in English primary schools?

8  
9 Mathematics education has seen similar changes to music education within the  
10  
11 framework of the 2014 revised national curriculum (DfE, 2014). The mathematics  
12  
13 programmes of study have been reduced for Key Stages 1 and 2 (for children aged 5 to  
14  
15 11 years). There is less detail in terms of how mathematics should be taught, so teachers  
16  
17 have the freedom to make decisions about how and when to teach particular  
18  
19 mathematical ideas and concepts. The emphasis is on depth of understanding, with  
20  
21 children being moved on only when they have securely grasped the mathematical ideas  
22  
23 and concepts being covered. There is also now an emphasis on age-related expectations,  
24  
25 as opposed to levelling (as in older versions of the national curriculum). The intention is  
26  
27 that the majority of the children in each year group will achieve a minimum set of  
28  
29 outcomes in mathematics, as specified in the programmes of study.  
30  
31  
32  
33

34 The national curriculum makes specific reference to the fact that 'mathematics is  
35  
36 a creative and highly interconnected discipline that has been developed over centuries'  
37  
38 (DfE, 2014). The overarching aims of the national curriculum for mathematics are that  
39  
40 children should:  
41

- 42  
43 • *become fluent in the fundamentals of mathematics, including through varied and*  
44  
45 *frequent practice with increasingly complex problems over time, so that pupils*  
46  
47 *develop conceptual understanding and the ability to recall and apply knowledge*  
48  
49 *rapidly and accurately;*  
50  
51 • *reason mathematically by following a line of enquiry, conjecturing relationships*  
52  
53 *and generalisations, and developing an argument, justification or proof using*  
54  
55 *mathematical language;*  
56  
57  
58  
59  
60

- *be able to solve problems by applying their mathematics to a variety of routine and non-routine problems with increasing sophistication, including breaking down problems into a series of simpler steps and persevering in seeking solutions.*

(DfE, 2014)

The idea of teaching mathematics across the curriculum is not new to the English education system, and has been a topic of discussion for decades. During this time, there have been a number of government-led initiatives, in addition to more general discussions in the world of education and educational research. In the new curriculum, there is an expectation that mathematics will be developed in all subjects areas across the curriculum, in order to enable children to appreciate the relevance and importance of mathematics (DfE, 2014).

In England, there have been a number of government driven initiatives to encourage cross-curricular teaching. The ‘Numeracy across the curriculum’ initiative (DfES, 2001) was designed to encourage teachers of 11 to 14 year old children in secondary schools to plan for a more cross-curricular approach to the teaching of mathematics. The document provided some useful guidance on where links could be made with music (and other subjects), without outlining any specific activities. Through posing questions, it was hoped that teachers would engage with some of the common features that cross subject boundaries. For example:

*Music makes significant use of symbolic representation, as does mathematics.*

*Do we use the similarities in the ways symbols are interpreted in both subjects?*

*Can rhythm patterns, represented either symbolically or numerically, be seen to have parallels in mathematical sequences?*

1  
2  
3 *Can pupils' knowledge of time and speed enhance their understanding of*  
4 *musical time, when considering technical issues such as beats per second and*  
5 *the differences between certain types of music, for example music from around*  
6 *the world, pop, techno, and so on?*

7  
8  
9  
10  
11  
12 *Is the study of pattern in musical forms such as ABA, AABA, ABAB (leading to*  
13 *fugue, sonata and symphonic form) enhanced by pupils' understanding of*  
14 *repeating patterns in mathematics?*

15  
16  
17  
18  
19 (DfES, 2001, p.93).

20  
21  
22 In primary education, the benefits of a cross-curricular approach to teaching  
23 were highlighted in the Excellence and Enjoyment agenda (DfES, 2004). It was  
24 suggested that a cross-curricular approach can deepen children's understanding by  
25 providing opportunities to reinforce and enhance learning in all subject areas. This was  
26 accompanied by a detailed analysis of the mathematics curriculum and an  
27 accompanying document was produced which identified cross-curricular links with a  
28 range of subject areas, including music. The proposed links were similar to those  
29 identified in the 'Numeracy across the curriculum' initiative, but appropriately adapted  
30 for the primary curriculum.  
31  
32  
33  
34  
35  
36  
37  
38  
39  
40  
41

42 Bearing all this in mind, we still need to ask why with all this encouragement,  
43 we do not see more integrated approaches in our classrooms.  
44  
45  
46  
47  
48

## 49 **Publications and resources for practitioners in Catalonia and England**

### 50 ***Catalonia***

51  
52 In the Catalan context, publications that relate to music and mathematics in education  
53 are quite scarce. These publications are always by the same authors and deal with  
54  
55  
56  
57  
58  
59  
60

1  
2  
3 similar topics. These often focus on adapting subject matter to primary education, but  
4  
5 taking a more historical than didactic approach. Many of these proposals have a  
6  
7 unidirectional nature – making use of music to learn mathematics (Segarra, 2008) – and  
8  
9 few of them have a bi-directional character, or promote real interaction between the two  
10  
11 subjects (such as Saguer & Saguer, 2004). Lastly, there are some manuals with  
12  
13 suggestions for work activities at school to mark special days or festivals (e.g. Liern and  
14  
15 Queralt, 2008).

16  
17  
18 Despite this limited output, it seems that interest in interdisciplinary  
19  
20 relationships and connections between subjects has grown in the Catalan educational  
21  
22 context in recent years. Evidence of this is the take-up of professional development  
23  
24 courses exploring the integration of subjects (Lago, 2007) such as music and  
25  
26 mathematics (Casals et al. 2016; Carrillo et al. in press), and the development of  
27  
28 undergraduate projects (Frade, 1994; Rué, 2007), and postgraduate research (Andreu,  
29  
30 2012; Viñas 2016) by practising teachers.

31  
32  
33  
34 In schools there is a growing interest in developing practice to explore the  
35  
36 relationship between music and mathematics and, in general, in the interdisciplinary  
37  
38 connections that school subjects can generate. Examples of these are the blogs created  
39  
40 by educators, such as *Matemusicant* (<http://matemusicant.blogspot.com.es/>), *Sumado*  
41  
42 (<http://sumado.blogspot.co.uk/2010/05/matematicas-vs-musica.html>) and *Musicomàtics*  
43  
44 (<https://musicomatics.wordpress.com/>) that contain resources and ideas that have been  
45  
46 tried and tested by teachers. In addition, the authors of this paper are aware of other  
47  
48 resources such as workshops and exhibitions, where pupils and teachers can experiment  
49  
50  
51  
52  
53  
54  
55  
56  
57  
58  
59  
60

1  
2  
3 with materials and activities that they can later make use of in the classroom (see  
4  
5 examples below<sup>3</sup>).  
6  
7

### 8 9 *England*

10  
11 In the last ten years, a number of books have been published that focus exclusively on  
12  
13 mathematics across the curriculum. These books have concentrated on the benefits of  
14  
15 cross-curricular teaching and have also attempted to provide some examples of how this  
16  
17 can be managed (e.g. Fox & Surtees, 2010; Pound & Lee, 2011; and Hansen &  
18  
19 Vaukins, 2012). **There have also been a number of publications that use music and  
20  
21 songs to introduce and practise mathematical concepts and principles, such as those by  
22  
23 MacGregor (2005) and MacGregor and Chadwick (2011). Although these do not adopt  
24  
25 the integrated approach that we are proposing, they do try to use songs to introduce  
26  
27 concepts and principles alongside ideas for how to develop these further.**  
28  
29  
30

31  
32 In addition, there are a range of other resources that are available within  
33  
34 mathematics and music education to support teachers by providing cross-curricular  
35  
36 approaches within the teaching of music and mathematics. For example, NRIC  
37  
38 (<http://nrich.maths.org>), an online mathematics resource run by the University of  
39  
40 Cambridge, aims to:

- 41  
42
- 43 • *Enrich mathematical experiences so that all students have the opportunity to*  
44 *explore, engage with and communicate mathematical ideas.*
  - 45 • *Offer challenging activities and resources which can develop mathematical*  
46 *thinking and problem solving skills.*
- 47  
48  
49  
50

---

51  
52  
53 <sup>3</sup> Example of workshop: <http://fresno.pntic.mec.es/mrir0002/exposiciomatematicas/web2008/index.htm>

54  
55 Example of exhibition: <http://www.mnactec.cat/ofertaeducativa/fitxa/les-matematicues-i-la-vida/>

- *Show the use of mathematics in engaging and meaningful contexts.*
- *Contribute to national and international debates relating to maths teaching and learning.*

Similarly, the National Centre for Excellence in the Teaching of Mathematics Education (NCETM) (<https://www.ncetm.org.uk/>), whose aim is to ‘raise levels of achievement in maths, and to increase appreciation of the power and wonder of maths’, provides a wide range of resources and references to projects in schools which have focused on making links between music and mathematics.

Sing Up (<https://www.singup.org>), a not-for-profit organisation promoting good quality music provision in primary schools, is developing a programme of activities exploring the integration of music with other curriculum subjects. A large part of this development is focusing on an integrated approach to the teaching of music and mathematics (e.g., <https://www.singup.org/singup-songbank/top-ten-curriculum-songs/mathematics-curriculum-songs/>).

The main educational weekly newspaper in England, *The Times Educational Supplement*, provides a forum for teachers to post activities for practitioners to use. Although this is an open forum, there are opportunities for other teachers to provide useful feedback. On this forum, there exist a number of activities which exploit the relationship between music and mathematics (e.g., <https://www.tes.com/teaching-resources/search/?q=music+and+mathematics>).

## **Discussion**

In addition to the points already made, there exist other factors which are common to both countries. Both the Catalan and English educational systems encourage teachers to pursue on-going professional development, but these exist within certain political and

1  
2  
3 cultural dimensions which necessarily impact on the choices teachers are able to make  
4  
5 (e.g. Lago, 2007; Hardy and Melville, 2013). In this respect, at the time of writing, both  
6  
7 countries are beginning collaborative projects between higher education institutions and  
8  
9 schools to develop integrated approaches to the teaching of music and mathematics  
10  
11 through different projects (mentioned above). This training provides tools, materials and  
12  
13 examples of activities for teachers and promotes collective reflection, based on the  
14  
15 analysis of experiences in the classroom. We are also developing ways of incorporating  
16  
17 integrated approaches in our initial teacher training programmes. For example, at UCL  
18  
19 Institute of Education, in London, UK, primary music and mathematics specialists  
20  
21 spend time working together in workshops which are designed to facilitate an integrated  
22  
23 approach. In many cases this leads to trainee teachers completing master's level projects  
24  
25 exploring the integration of music and mathematics. **Finally, the existence of the**  
26  
27 **internet has provided the possibility of new ways of sharing information and**  
28  
29 **communicating.** Both countries have well respected teacher organisations that support  
30  
31 and encourage teachers to share information in a public domain (e.g. the TES, in the  
32  
33 UK).

34  
35  
36  
37  
38 There are, however, some differences between the two countries. For example,  
39  
40 in Catalonia, music is taught by music specialists in primary schools and yet experience  
41  
42 suggests that music is not valued (Carrillo & Baguley, 2011). From our work with these  
43  
44 music specialists, it has become apparent that the music specialists often lack  
45  
46 confidence in their own knowledge and understanding of mathematics and are reluctant  
47  
48 to teach it (Carrillo and Baguley, 2011). In England, the situation is often quite  
49  
50 different. Music in English primary schools is usually taught by generalist teachers who  
51  
52 lack confidence in their own knowledge, understanding and expertise in music and who,  
53  
54 as a consequence are likely to be reluctant to teach it, especially with older children  
55  
56  
57  
58  
59  
60

1  
2  
3 (Welch & Henley, 2014). In addition, in Catalonia there are few publications and  
4  
5 resources to help teachers develop integrated approaches, but, as has already been seen,  
6  
7 this is a developing area in England. In England, there have also been government  
8  
9 initiatives, such as the 'Numeracy across the curriculum' (DfES, 2001) which have  
10  
11 attempted to encourage integrated approaches, but in Catalonia, these initiatives have  
12  
13 been slow to develop over the last 10 years.  
14  
15

16           In the present climate, in both countries, there remain a number of challenges.  
17  
18 For teachers to be confident in their ability to incorporate integrated approaches in the  
19  
20 teaching of music and mathematics, teachers may need to reconceptualise what it is that  
21  
22 makes an activity 'musical' and 'mathematical'. This may require support from higher  
23  
24 education tutors and teachers and is likely to take time to develop. Experience to date  
25  
26 indicates that, when experienced teachers and trainee teachers engage with appropriate  
27  
28 activities for themselves, they quickly develop the confidence to explore the activities  
29  
30 further and even go on create activities of their own. In England, a key challenge often  
31  
32 concerns finding time to teach music. Where music is taught by a music specialist, the  
33  
34 challenge is ensure that the generalist primary teacher is involved (Welch and Henley,  
35  
36 op.cit.).  
37  
38  
39

40           In changing approaches, we need to support teachers to make time for learning  
41  
42 to take place and avoid using music as a quick way of getting children to learn number  
43  
44 facts with no meaning! We want to encourage our teachers to allow children in primary  
45  
46 and early childhood education to explore and play in both music and mathematics and  
47  
48 to experience the synergy of exploring the two subjects as one.  
49  
50  
51  
52  
53  
54  
55  
56  
57  
58  
59  
60

## References

- Aizenman, A., Gold, J., & Sekuler, R. 2013. Multisensory Integration in Visual Pattern Recognition: Music Training Matters *Journal of Vision*, 13(9).
- An, S., Capraro, M.M. & Tillman, D.A. 2013. Elementary Teachers Integrate Music Activities into Regular Mathematics Lessons: Effects on Students' Mathematical Abilities. *Journal for Learning through the Arts*, 9(1), p.n1.
- Andreu, M. 2012. L'assoliment de les competències bàsiques en alumnes de Centres integrats de primària i música. [The attainment of basic competences by pupils in centres that integrate primary and music education] (Doctoral Thesis). Retrieved from <http://www.tdx.cat/handle/10803/96516>
- Arenzana, V., & Arenzana, J. 1998. Aproximación Matemática a la Música [Mathematical Approach to Music]. *Números. Revista de didáctica de las matemáticas* 35: 17–31.  
<http://www.sinewton.org/numeros/numeros/35/Articulo03.pdf>
- Ayala, G., Gilabert, A., Gilabert, M. T., López, I., Martínez, M. E., Navarro, V., Pérez, I., & Ros, M. T. 2003. “El Desarrollo del Pensamiento Lógico-Matemático a través de los Cuentos y las Canciones en Educación Infantil” [The Development of Logical - Mathematical Thinking through Stories and Songs in Kindergarten]. *Educación en el 2000. Revista de formación del profesorado* 6: 82–86.
- Brown, J., Sherrill, C. & Gench, B. 1981. Effects of an integrated physical education / music program in changing early childhood perceptual-motor performance. *Perceptual and Motor Skills*, 53(1), 151-154.
- Burton, L. 1984. Mathematical Thinking: The Struggle for Meaning. *Journal for Research in Mathematics Education*, 15:1, 35-49.
- Bustos, M. A. 2007. “Un Itinerario Reflexivo, Semántico y Didáctico, sobre Interdisciplinariedad en Educación Musical: Dos Informes de Investigación” [A Reflexive, Semantic and Teaching Itinerary on Interdisciplinarity in Music Education: Two Research Reports]. *Em Pauta* 18 (31): 95–122.  
<http://seer.ufrgs.br/index.php/EmPauta/article/view/7464/4650>
- Carrillo, C., & Baguley, M. 2011. From school teacher to university lecturer: Illuminating the journey from the classroom to the university for two arts educators. *Teaching and teacher education*, 27(1), 62-72.
- Carrillo, C., Viladot, L., González-Martín, C. & Casals, A. in press. “European Music Portfolio – Maths: Theoretical and Practical Contributions in the Catalan and Spanish Context”. *Hellenic Journal of Music, Education, and Culture* 6 (1).

1  
2  
3 Casals, A., Carrillo, C., & González-Martín, C. 2014. “La Música también Cuenta: Combinando  
4 Matemáticas y Música en el Aula” [Music also Matters: Combining Math and Music in the Classroom].  
5 *Lista Electrónica Europea de Música en la Educación* 34: 1–17.

6  
7 <http://musica.rediris.es/leeme/revista/casalsetal14.pdf>

8  
9 Casals, A., Viladot, L. & González-Martín, C. 2016. “Formant mestres des d’un enfocament integrat de  
10 música i matemàtiques”. *Educa Sonograma*, 32. [http://sonograma.org/2016/10/formant-mestre-musica-](http://sonograma.org/2016/10/formant-mestre-musica-matematiques/)  
11 [matematiques/](http://sonograma.org/2016/10/formant-mestre-musica-matematiques/)

12  
13 Department d’Educació de la Generalitat de Catalunya. 2009. *Curriculum educació primària* [Primary  
14 School Curriculum]. Barcelona: Servei de Comunicació, Difusió i Publicacions - Generalitat de  
15 Catalunya.

16  
17 Department d’Educació de la Generalitat de Catalunya. 2013. *Competències bàsiques de l’àmbit*  
18 *matemàtic. Identificació i desplegament a l’educació primària* [Key Competences in Mathematics:  
19 Identifying and spreading them in Primary]. Barcelona: Servei de Comunicació i Publicacions –  
20 Generalitat de Catalunya.

21  
22 Department d’Educació de la Generalitat de Catalunya. 2015. “Decret 119/2015, de 23 de juny,  
23 d’ordenació dels ensenyaments de l’educació primària” [Legislative Decree 119/2015 to rule the Primary  
24 School Curriculum ]. *Diari Oficial de la Generalitat de Catalunya* 6900: 1-136.

25  
26 <http://www.xtec.cat/web/curriculum/primaria/curriculum>

27  
28 Department for Education and Science. 2001. *Numeracy across the curriculum*. London: DfES.

29  
30 Department for Education and Science. 2004. *Excellence and Enjoyment: learning and teaching in the*  
31 *primary years*. London: DfES.

32  
33 Department for Education. 2013. *National Curriculum in England: music programmes of study*. London.  
34 DFE-00187-2013.

35  
36 Department for Education. 2014. *National curriculum in England: mathematics programmes of study*.  
37 Retrieved from [https://www.gov.uk/government/publications/national-curriculum-in-england-](https://www.gov.uk/government/publications/national-curriculum-in-england-mathematics-programmes-of-study/national-curriculum-in-england-mathematics-programmes-of-study#contents)  
38 [mathematics-programmes-of-study/national-curriculum-in-england-mathematics-programmes-of-](https://www.gov.uk/government/publications/national-curriculum-in-england-mathematics-programmes-of-study/national-curriculum-in-england-mathematics-programmes-of-study#contents)  
39 [study#contents](https://www.gov.uk/government/publications/national-curriculum-in-england-mathematics-programmes-of-study/national-curriculum-in-england-mathematics-programmes-of-study#contents).

40  
41 Fauvel, J., Flood, R., & Wilson, R. J. (Eds.). 2003. *Mathematics and Music*. Oxford University Press.

42  
43 Fox, S., & Surtees, L. 2010. *Mathematics across the Curriculum: Problem-solving, reasoning and*  
44 *numeracy in primary schools*. London: Continuum.

45  
46 Frade, R. 1994. *Elaboració d’una proposta de treball interdisciplinari entre els continguts impartits a les*  
47 *classes de matemàtiques i el seu ús a les altres àrees i viceversa*. [Elaboration of an interdisciplinary

1  
2  
3 proposal between contents from the Maths class and their use in other areas and vice-versa]. (Llicència  
4 d'estudis).

5  
6 González-Martín, C. 2013. "Músiques del món i projectes de treball. Anàlisi d'una pràctica didàctica  
7 innovadora a l'escola" [World Music and Project Method. Analysing an innovative teaching practice in  
8 schools]. (Doctoral Thesis). Universitat Autònoma de Barcelona. Retrieved from  
9  
10 <http://www.tdx.cesca.cat/handle/10803/129291>

11  
12  
13 Hansen, A., & Vaukins, D. 2012. *Primary Mathematics Across the Curriculum*. London: Learning  
14 Matters.

15  
16  
17 Hardy, I. & Melville, W. 2013. Contesting continuing professional development: reflections from  
18 England. *Teachers and Teaching*, 19(3), pp.311-325.

19  
20  
21 Hofstadter, D.R., 1979. *Godel, Escher, Bach: An Eternal Golden Braid*. New York, NY: Basic  
22 Books Inc.

23  
24  
25 Jones, S.M. and Pearson, D., 2013. Music Highly Engaged Students Connect Music to Math.  
26 *General Music Today*, 27(1), pp.18-23.

27  
28  
29 Lago, J. R. 2007. L'assessorament educatiu com a eina per a la reflexió i la millora de la pràctica  
30 educativa i de l'escola inclusiva.[The assessment as tool for the reflexion and improvement of the  
31 educational practice and the inclusive school]. *Suports*, 11 (1), 42-50.

32  
33  
34 Lázaro, C., & Riaño, M. 2009. "Números con Ritmo" [Numbers with Rhythm]. *UNO. Revista de*  
35 *didáctica de las matemáticas* 52: 106–115.

36  
37  
38 Liern, V. 1994. "La Música y sus Materiales: una Ayuda para las Clases de Matemáticas" [Music and its  
39 Materials: a Help for Mathematics Lessons]. *Suma. Revista para la enseñanza y el aprendizaje de las*  
40 *matemáticas* 14-15: 60–64. <http://revistasuma.es/IMG/pdf/14/060-064.pdf>

41  
42  
43 Liern, V. 2008. "La Música y el Número Siete. Historia de Una Relación Controvertida" [Music and  
44 Number Seven. Story of a Controversial Relationship]. *Suma. Revista para la enseñanza y el aprendizaje*  
45 *de las matemáticas* 58: 137–143. <http://revistasuma.es/IMG/pdf/58/137-143.pdf>

46  
47  
48 Liern, V., & Queralt, T. 2008. *Música y Matemáticas*. [Mathematics and Music]. Badajoz: Federación  
49 Española de sociedades de profesores de Matemáticas.

50  
51  
52 Liern, V. 2009. "Las Matemáticas y la Música Popular" [Mathematics and Popular Music]. *Suma. Revista*  
53 *para la enseñanza y el aprendizaje de las matemáticas* 62: 107–113.  
54  
55 <http://revistasuma.es/IMG/pdf/62/107-113.pdf>

1  
2  
3 López, P., & Gustems, J. 2007. "Reflexiones y Dificultades Interdisciplinarias: una Experiencia Conjunta  
4 de Matemáticas y Música" [Interdisciplinary Reflections and Challenges: a Combined Experience of  
5 Mathematics and Music]. *UNO. Revista de didáctica de las matemáticas* 44: 110–116.

6  
7  
8 MacGregor, H. 2005. *Tom Thumb's Musical Maths: Developing maths skills with simple songs*. London:  
9 A&C Black.

10  
11  
12 MacGregor, H., & Chadwick, S. 2011. *Singing Maths*. London: A&C Black.

13  
14 Malagarriga, T., Gómez, I., & Viladot, L. 2010. "Com fer persones competents?." [How to become  
15 competents?] In T. Malagarriga and M.Martínez (Eds.) *Tot ho podem expressar amb música* [Everything  
16 can be expressed through music], 17-30. Barcelona: DINSIC Publicacions Musicals.

17  
18  
19 Navarra, G., & de Cian, S. 1994. "De los Frisos Gráficos a los Frisos Musicales. Un Análisis Geométrico  
20 de Dos Modelos: una Actividad Interdisciplinaria entre Matemáticas, Artes Figurativas y Música" [From  
21 Graphic Friezes to Musical Friezes. A Geometric Analysis of Two Models: an Interdisciplinary Activity  
22 among Mathematics, Figurative Arts and Music]. *UNO. Revista de didáctica de las matemáticas* 2: 43–  
23 56.

24  
25  
26 National Council of Teachers of Mathematics. 2000. *Principles and Standards for School Mathematics*.  
27 Reston, VA: NCTM.

28  
29  
30 Ockelford, A. (2005). Repetition in music: Theoretical and metatheoretical perspectives

31  
32  
33 Pound, L., & Lee, T. 2011. *Teaching mathematics creatively*. Abingdon: Routledge.

34  
35  
36 Rué, N. 2007. *El valor instrumental i transversal dels ensenyaments artístics: anàlisi d'experiències i*  
37 *orientacions de propostes per la didàctica de la música*. [The value of the arts education: analysis of  
38 experiences and guides for proposals on music didactics] (Llicència d'estudis). Recuperat de  
39 <http://www.xtec.cat/sgfp/licencies/200607/memories/1697m.pdf>

40  
41  
42  
43 Saguer, N., & Saguer, E. 2004. "Música, dansa i matemàtiques". [Music, dance and mathematics].  
44 Proceedings of the annual meeting *V Jornades de Música. Músiques i interdisciplinarietat (Educació*  
45 *infantil, primària i secundària)*, Barcelona: ICE UB.

46  
47  
48 Segarra, L. 2008. "Matemàtiques amb música: aprenem les taules de multiplicar cantant" [Mathematics  
49 with Music: learning the multiplication table through singing]. *Guix. Elements d'Acció Educativa* 348,  
50 24-25.

51  
52  
53  
54 Still, K., & Bobis, J. 2005. The integration of mathematics and music in the primary school classroom. In  
55 P. Clarkson, A. Downton, D. Gronn, M. Horne, A. McDonough, R. Pierce, & A. Roche  
56 (Eds.), Proceedings of the Annual Conference of the Mathematics Education Research Group of  
57  
58  
59  
60

1  
2  
3 Australasia. Building Connections: Theory, Research and Practice (pp. 712-719). Sydney: Mathematics  
4 Education Research Group of Australasia Inc.

5  
6  
7 Swanwick, K., & França, C.C. 1999. "Composing, performing and audience-listening as indicators of  
8 musical understanding". *British Journal of Music Education* 16 (1): 5-19.

9  
10  
11 Tosto, M.G., Petrill, S.A., Halberda, J., Trzaskowski, M., Tikhomirova, T.N., Bogdanova, O.Y., Ly, R.,  
12 Wilmer, J.B., Naiman, D.Q., Germine, L., Plomin, R., & Kovas, Y. (2014). Why do we differ in number  
13 sense? Evidence from a genetically sensitive investigation. *Intelligence* 43, 35-46.

14  
15  
16 Van den Heuvel-Panhuizen, M. 2001. Realistic Mathematics Education in the Netherlands. In: J.  
17 Anghileri, (Ed.). *Principles and practice in arithmetic teaching. Innovative approaches for the primary*  
18 *classroom.* (pp. 49-63). Buckingham: Open University Press.

19  
20  
21 Venegas, A., Tejada, J., Rodrigo, P. C., Thayer, T., Lecaros, A., & Petrovich, M. 2013. "Audiográficos:  
22 Implementación y Evaluación de un Programa Informático para el Aprendizaje de la Interpretación y  
23 Representación Matemática de Coordenadas a través de la Música y el Sonido" [AudioGraphics:  
24 Implementation and Evaluation of a Computer Program for the Learning of Mathematical Interpretation  
25 and Representation of Two-Axis Graphics through Music and Sound]. *Lista Electrónica Europea de*  
26 *Música en la Educación* 31: 135-155. <http://musica.rediris.es/leeme/revista/venegasetal13.pdf>

27  
28  
29 Viladot, L. & Cslovjcek. 2014. 'Do you speak...music?' Facing the challenges of training teachers on  
30 integration. *Hellenic Journal of Music, Education, and Culture* 5 (1): 1-14.

31  
32  
33 Villasmil de Vásquez, T., & Palomares, E. 2007. "Influencia de la Música en el Desarrollo del  
34 Pensamiento Lógico Matemático" [Influence of Music on the Development of Mathematical Logical  
35 Thinking]. *Equisangulo. Revista Iberoamericana de Educación Matemática* 2 (4).  
36  
37 <http://www.saber.ula.ve/bitstream/123456789/20331/1/articulo7.html>

38  
39  
40  
41 Viñas, M. F. 2016. "Análisis de una creación musical y coreográfica colectiva a través de un enfoque  
42 interdisciplinario de la 'simetría'". [Analysis of a collective music and choreographic composition  
43 through an interdisciplinary approach of 'symmetry'] (Master Thesis). Universitat Autònoma de  
44 Barcelona.

45  
46  
47  
48 Welch, G. F., & Henley, J. 2014. "Addressing the challenges of teaching music by generalist primary  
49 school teachers". *Revista da ABEM* 22 (32).

50  
51  
52 Zaragozá, J. L. 2009. *Didáctica de la Música en la Educación Secundaria [Music Didactics in Secondary*  
53 *Education]*. Barcelona: Graó.

54  
55  
56  
57 Zeki, S., Romaya, J. P., Benincasa, D. M., & Atiyah, M. F. 2014. "The experience of mathematical  
58 beauty and its neural correlates". *Frontiers in human neuroscience* 8.