

The Classical Review

<http://journals.cambridge.org/CAR>

Additional services for *The Classical Review*:

Email alerts: [Click here](#)

Subscriptions: [Click here](#)

Commercial reprints: [Click here](#)

Terms of use : [Click here](#)



M. E. Stone, M. E. Shirinian: *Pseudo-Zeno: Anonymous Philosophical Treatise*. Pp. xiv + 254. Leiden, Boston, and Cologne: Brill, 2000. Cased, \$85. ISBN: 90-04-11524-2.

R. W. Sharples

The Classical Review / Volume 51 / Issue 02 / October 2001, pp 393 - 393

DOI: 10.1093/cr/51.2.393, Published online: 25 April 2006

Link to this article: http://journals.cambridge.org/abstract_S0009840X01002554

How to cite this article:

R. W. Sharples (2001). Review of M. E. Stone, and M. E. Shirinian 'Pseudo-Zeno: Anonymous Philosophical Treatise' The Classical Review, 51, pp 393-393 doi:10.1093/cr/51.2.393

Request Permissions : [Click here](#)

M. E. STONE, M. E. SHIRINIAN: *Pseudo-Zeno: Anonymous Philosophical Treatise*. Pp. xiv + 254. Leiden, Boston, and Cologne: Brill, 2000. Cased, \$85. ISBN: 90-04-11524-2.

This treatise, first published in 1950 as Zeno's *On Nature*, is here provided with a newly edited Armenian text, an annotated translation (the first into a Western European language), and extensive indices. It is the work—in spite of earlier claims (p. 5)—neither of Zeno of Citium nor of Zeno of Elea, but rather, the present editors argue, a compendium of philosophical doctrines composed originally in Greek by a Christian writer of the late sixth or early seventh century A.D., who used both David and Elias. It was translated, in a style which follows the Greek so closely as to be obscure, as part of a movement to develop philosophy in the Armenian language for theological purposes. It consists of a series of lists and classifications concerned chiefly with logic, physics, and theology; the section on the 'economic, moral, and political' is in fact largely about rhetoric. The treatment is often compressed and allusive to the point of near-incomprehensibility outside its original educational context: 'a philosophical theory hides behind almost each sentence' (p. xiv)—though the particular example of such obscurity cited on p. 19 is suggested by p. 143 n. 114 to be rather the result of mistranslation, the explanation of 'definition' (*ὀρισμός*) as a metaphor from the *boundaries* (*ὀροθέσια*) in fields being misunderstood as 'from the agrarian proof'.

As the editors note, there are Neoplatonic and Pythagorean elements, but the main influences are Aristotelian. This is not surprising in late antiquity where more elementary topics are concerned; nor is the fact that, as the index of sources makes clear, the *Categories* predominates among the Aristotelian texts employed. But the Pythagoreans are the only Greek philosophers actually named in the text, at 3.1.6; and, after an introductory section on various sciences, the order followed is an ascending one, culminating in a theological section concerned with good and evil, and ultimately the infinite. (Is the 'art called speaking with God' of 4.3.5, cf. 3.1.10, a misunderstanding of *θεολογική*?) Some of the doctrines are surprising at this date. That the stars may be moved by air (1.1.7) is indeed a possibility considered by the Epicureans, though *Letter to Pythocles* 93 and Lucretius 5.637–49, cited in p. 128 n. 6, are concerned with the movement of the sun, not as here with that of the fixed stars; more relevant would be Lucretius 5.522–3 and, no doubt, the lacuna between *Letter to Pythocles* 92 and 93. That, however, does not make its presence in a treatise influenced by the Aristotelian tradition any less surprising. In general, the text now made accessible will be of interest to students of classical philosophy not so much as throwing new light on classical doctrines, but rather as an example of the way in which the classical tradition was employed and developed in the early medieval period.

The introduction includes a listing of other published Armenian translations of Greek philosophical texts. An electronic edition with further resources is promised.

University College London

R. W. SHARPLES