

1 **Pneumococcal protein antigen serology varies with age and may predict antigenic**  
2 **profile of colonizing isolates**

3  
4 Azarian T<sup>1</sup>, Grant LR<sup>2</sup>, Georgieva M<sup>1</sup>, Hammitt LL<sup>2</sup>, Reid R<sup>2</sup>, Bentley SD<sup>3</sup>, Goldblatt D<sup>4</sup>,  
5 Santosham M<sup>2</sup>, Weatherholtz R<sup>2</sup>, Burbidge P<sup>4</sup>, Goklish N<sup>2</sup>, Thompson CM<sup>1</sup>, Hanage  
6 WP<sup>1</sup>, O'Brien KL<sup>2</sup>, Lipsitch M<sup>1</sup>

7  
8 1 Center for Communicable Disease Dynamics, Department of Epidemiology, T.H. Chan  
9 School of Public Health, Harvard University; 2 Center for American Indian Health, Johns  
10 Hopkins Bloomberg School of Public Health, Baltimore, Maryland; 3 Wellcome Trust  
11 Sanger Institute, Cambridge, UK; 4 Immunobiology Section, Institute of Child Health,  
12 University College London, London, UK.

13  
14 Word Count:

15 Abstract: 200

16 Main text: 3497

17 References: 37

18  
19 Lindsay R. Grant [lgrant10@jhu.edu](mailto:lgrant10@jhu.edu)

20 Maria Georgieva [georgiev@hsph.harvard.edu](mailto:georgiev@hsph.harvard.edu)

21 Laura Hammitt [lhammitt@jhu.edu](mailto:lhammitt@jhu.edu)

22 Ray Reid [rreid2@jhu.edu](mailto:rreid2@jhu.edu)

23 Stephen D Bentley [sdb@sanger.ac.uk](mailto:sdb@sanger.ac.uk)

24 David Goldblatt [d.goldblatt@ucl.ac.uk](mailto:d.goldblatt@ucl.ac.uk)

25 Mathuram Santosham [msantosham@jhu.edu](mailto:msantosham@jhu.edu)

26 Robert Weatherholtz [rwheathe1@jhu.edu](mailto:rwheathe1@jhu.edu)

27 Polly Burbidge [p.burbidge@ucl.ac.uk](mailto:p.burbidge@ucl.ac.uk)

28 Novalene Goklish [ngoklish@jhsph.edu](mailto:ngoklish@jhsph.edu)

29 Claudette M Thompson [cthomps@hsph.harvard.edu](mailto:cthomps@hsph.harvard.edu)

30 Bill Hanage [whanage@hsph.harvard.edu](mailto:whanage@hsph.harvard.edu)

31 Kate O'Brien [klobrien@jhsph.edu](mailto:klobrien@jhsph.edu)

32 Marc Lipsitch [mlipsitc@hsph.harvard.edu](mailto:mlipsitc@hsph.harvard.edu)

33  
34  
35 **Corresponding Author:**

36 Taj Azarian, PhD MPH

37 352.494.2011

38 Center for Communicable Disease Dynamics,

39 Harvard T.H. Chan School of Public Health,

40 677 Huntington Avenue, Suite 506, Boston, MA 02115

41 [tazarian@hsph.harvard.edu](mailto:tazarian@hsph.harvard.edu)

42

43 **Abstract**

44

45 **Background:** Several *Streptococcus pneumoniae* proteins play a role in pathogenesis  
46 and are being investigated as vaccine targets. It is largely unknown whether naturally-  
47 acquired antibodies reduce the risk of colonization with strains expressing a particular  
48 antigenic variant.

49 **Methods:** Serum IgG titers to 28 pneumococcal protein antigens were measured among  
50 242 individuals, aged < 6 months - 78 years in Native American communities between  
51 2007-2009. Nasopharyngeal swabs were collected at least 30 days after serum  
52 collection, and the protein antigen variant in each pneumococcal isolate was determined  
53 using genomic data. We assessed the association between preexisting variant-specific  
54 antibody titers and subsequent carriage of pneumococcus expressing a particular  
55 antigen variant.

56 **Results:** Antibody titers often increased across pediatric groups before decreasing  
57 among adults. PspA and StkP IgG titers decreased from <6 months to 6-12 months  
58 ( $p < 0.01$ ). Individuals with low titers against Group 3 PspC variants were more likely to  
59 be colonized with pneumococci expressing those variants. For other antigens, variant-  
60 specific IgG titers do not predict colonization with pneumococci expressing particular  
61 variants.

62 **Conclusion:** We observed an inverse association between variant-specific antibody  
63 concentration and homologous pneumococcal colonization for only one protein. Further  
64 assessment of antibody repertoires may elucidate the nature of anti-pneumococcal  
65 antibody-mediated mucosal immunity while informing future vaccine development.

66

67 **Key words:** *Streptococcus pneumoniae*, pneumococci, protein antigens, sera,  
68 immunology, PspC, PspA, vaccine, pilus, antibody

69

## 70 **Introduction**

71 Current pneumococcal conjugate vaccines have significantly reduced invasive  
72 disease caused by the included *Streptococcus pneumoniae* (pneumococcal) serotypes.  
73 However, the currently licensed vaccines, PCV-10 and PCV-13, target only 10 or 13 of  
74 the ~90 recognized pneumococcal capsular serotypes. In addition to incomplete  
75 coverage of disease-causing types, significant disadvantages of capsular vaccines  
76 include their production cost, production complexity, and serotype replacement. While  
77 PCV formulations are still an attractive vaccine approach, these limitations have  
78 motivated pursuit of pneumococcal protein antigens as vaccine candidates. Protein-  
79 based vaccines would, in theory, generate robust antibody responses, be efficacious in  
80 young children, and may decrease carriage (1).

81 Pneumococcal surface protein A (PspA), PspC, pilus (RrgA/B/C), pneumolysin  
82 (Ply) and neuraminidase (NanA) are among the pneumococcal proteins being  
83 investigated for use in vaccine formulations (1). Studies suggest that in some cases  
84 combinations of these proteins may elicit better protection than any of the proteins  
85 themselves (1,2). In humans, antibodies to pneumococcal proteins can be detected  
86 during colonization and natural infection, providing protection from subsequent  
87 colonization and invasive disease (3–8). Virolainen *et al.* showed that among children  
88 with invasive pneumococcal infections, those with lowest antibody titers to PspA were  
89 infected most frequently with pneumococci (9). However, animal data show that while  
90 antiprotein antibodies are correlated with protection against subsequent challenge, the  
91 mechanism of protection is not necessarily antibody mediated, suggesting antibody  
92 levels may correlate with degree of immune response but not necessarily exclusively  
93 mediate protection. Evidence of variant-specific protection, in which antibodies to a  
94 particular protein antigenic variant correlate with protection against colonization by  
95 homologous pneumococci (i.e. those with that protein variant), would be more strongly

96 indicative of antiprotein antibodies' causal role in protection, as has been observed for  
97 serotype-specific anticapsular antibodies (10,11).

98         At the same time, such evidence would provide a mechanism to explain the high  
99 level of sequence variation and signs of diversifying selection at these loci. While these  
100 protein antigens are present in almost all pneumococci, they are also very diverse, and  
101 pneumococcal strains differ considerably in the particular antigenic variants they express  
102 (12). Two clear examples are the surface associated choline-binding proteins PspA and  
103 PspC. Both are encoded by polymorphic genes with clear structural variability, which  
104 becomes the basis for their division into 3 PspA families and 11 PspC groups (12,13).  
105 Studies suggest structural differences in these proteins impact the nature and specificity  
106 of the antibody response generated toward them. For example, family-specific antibody  
107 responses among children exposed to pneumococci possessing family 1 and 2 PspA  
108 variants have been observed (14).

109         Important uncertainties remain about the biologic function of protein antibodies  
110 and the extent to which their binding and activity are specific to particular variants of  
111 polymorphic antigens. Here, we investigate whether naturally acquired antibodies to  
112 protein antigens reduce the risk of nasopharyngeal acquisition (i.e. colonization) with  
113 strains containing particular variants of diverse proteins such as PspA and PspC. To  
114 address this question, we used pneumococcal genomic data to identify variants of 21  
115 pneumococcal protein antigens present in *S. pneumoniae* carriage isolates. We then  
116 assessed the association between antibody titers and subsequent colonization with *S.*  
117 *pneumoniae* strains expressing an antigen recognized by preexisting antibodies. We  
118 posited that individuals who had low antibody titers to a specific protein antigen variant  
119 would be more likely to be colonized with *S. pneumoniae* expressing that variant.

120

121 **Methods**

122

123 *Study Population, Serum Collection, and Nasopharyngeal Colonization*

124

125           Individuals included in this study were a subset of participants in a larger  
126 prospective, longitudinal, observational cohort study of pneumococcal carriage among  
127 Navajo and White Mountain Apache families described elsewhere (15). Briefly,  
128 participants living on reservations in the southwest USA were enrolled from March 2006  
129 to March 2008. Demographic and epidemiological data are provided in Supplementary  
130 Table 1. Serum and nasopharyngeal (NP) specimens were obtained on the initial visit  
131 after recruitment, and NP samples were collected at each of six follow-up visits at one-  
132 month intervals to determine pneumococcal carriage status (16). We selected  
133 individuals who were negative for carriage at the initial visit, had an available enrollment  
134 serum sample, and subsequently had a pneumococcal isolate detected  $\geq 30$  days after  
135 serum collection. The Navajo Nation, White Mountain Apache tribe and the IRBs of the  
136 Johns Hopkins Bloomberg School of Public Health, the Navajo Nation and the Phoenix  
137 Area IHS approved this study. Written informed consent was obtained from adult  
138 participants and from caregivers of child participants. Assent was obtained from children  
139 7-17 years.

140

141 *Protein Antigen Serology*

142

143           Serum IgG to 28 pneumococcal protein antigens were measured using direct  
144 binding electrochemiluminescence-based multiplex assay (MSD, Rockville, MD) (7).  
145 Antibody levels among participants are expressed as a titer relative to the amount in a  
146 reference serum. The 28 antigens represent 21 pneumococcal proteins and alleles or  
147 structural variants of polymorphic proteins (Table 1). In particular, antibody titers were

148 measured for variants of PcpC, PspA, pilus subunit RrgB, pneumolysin (ply), and  
149 pneumococcal histidine triad D (PhtD). Four PspC variants, representing four of the 11  
150 recognized major groups (12), were selected based on their prevalence in a  
151 pneumococcal carriage study in Massachusetts, USA (17). Two variants, var-I and var-  
152 II, contain choline-binding domains (CBD), while var-III (Group 7) and var-IV (Group 8)  
153 contain the LPXTG (sortase) motif. Truncated PspC constructs were designed to  
154 uniquely represent each PspC variant. Truncation removed the proline-rich and cell wall  
155 anchor motifs, which are highly homologous to those found in PspA (Supplementary  
156 Figure 1).

157

#### 158 *Genome Sequencing and Protein Antigen Identification*

159

160 Genomic DNA from *S. pneumoniae* isolates were sequenced on the Illumina  
161 HiSeq to produce paired-end 100 bp reads at  $\geq 30$ -fold coverage. Serotypes were  
162 determined by mapping reads to concatenated CPS locus sequences of 90  
163 pneumococcal serotypes using SRST2 (18,19). *De novo* genome assemblies were  
164 generated with Velvet (20) and annotated using Prokka (21). Pangenome analysis was  
165 conducted with Roary (22) to cluster and abstract protein antigen genes. The coding  
166 sequence for each protein antigen in the MSD assay was downloaded from KEGG  
167 (<http://www.kegg.jp/>) and orthologs from *S. pneumoniae* reference strains were identified  
168 (Table 1). The MSD index variant, *S. pneumoniae* reference orthologs, and *de novo*  
169 assembled protein antigen genes were aligned with PRANK using a codon-aware  
170 algorithm (23). The diversity of each protein antigen among sequenced isolates was  
171 assessed to classify each antigen as polymorphic or conserved. Maximum likelihood  
172 phylogenies were inferred from the alignments using RAxML v8.0.0. For polymorphic  
173 antigens, one reference variant was selected from each monophyletic clade and used to

174 construct a protein database for SRST2 (19). To determine the antigenic profile of each  
175 carried pneumococci, reads were mapped to each variant and the highest scoring match  
176 was reported.

177

### 178 *Statistical Analysis*

179

180 To investigate correlation among participants' anti-protein titers and association  
181 with age, we performed hierarchical clustering of 28 titers using the mclust v5.2 package  
182 in R. We then assessed the association between titers and subsequent carriage of a  
183 pneumococcus possessing alleles against which the participant had antibodies. For  
184 each polymorphic protein antigen, log antibody titers were compared among individuals  
185 carrying a pneumococcus with the respective variant. Statistical significance was  
186 assessed using analysis of variance and Tukey's HSD. For the pilus (RrgA/B), which is  
187 present in only a fraction of pneumococci, we assessed anti-pilus titers between  
188 individuals colonized with piliated and non-piliated strains.

189

### 190 **Results**

191 This analysis included 242 participants who had new pneumococcal colonization  
192  $\geq 30$  days after serum collection (range 30-225 days, median=69). Individuals ranged in  
193 age from <1 month to 78 years of age, and had 34 pneumococcal serotypes identified in  
194 addition to 4 non-typable isolates (Supplementary Table 2). For two participants, two  
195 serotypes were identified, and a single serotype was selected for WGS. Among  
196 participants, 14 carried pneumococci that were PCV-7 vaccine types, and the distribution  
197 of PCV-7 types did not significantly differ by age group (Fisher's Exact,  $p=0.28$ ).

198

### 199 *Classification of pneumococcal protein antigens*

200 Phylogenetic analysis identified 11 polymorphic protein antigens and 10 that  
201 were largely conserved. Table 2 lists the variant frequencies for the 21 protein antigens.  
202 In some cases, the protein antigen variant was unable to be assigned; therefore, counts  
203 for some antigens do not total 242. We measured antibody titers to multiple variants of  
204 three proteins with polymorphisms (PspC, PspA, and RrgB). For the remaining 10  
205 proteins, we measured antibody titers for one variant and compared titers among  
206 individuals with carriage isolates possessing polymorphic variants.

207

### 208 *Protein Antigen Serology*

209

210 Participants' responses to different PspC variants were positively correlated,  
211 ( $r=0.29-0.90$ ,  $p<0.05$  for all correlations), such that those with high PspC var-I titers also  
212 had high titers to the other PspC variants (Figure 1 and Supplementary Figure 2). Titers  
213 against two of the three RrgB variants were highly correlated with each other (0.96,  
214  $p<0.01$ ), and less correlated with those against Var-III (Figure 1 and Supplemental  
215 Figure 3). Among other protein antigens, we found significant correlation between  
216 variants of the same antigen (Figure 1). There was also high correlation among  
217 antigens including PiuA, PiaA, PcsB, Spr2021, PcpA, CbpA, PhtE, and PhtD.

218 Antibody titers for most proteins increased with age including PspC variants  
219 (Figure 2A), PspA variants (Figure 2B), Ply variants (Figure 2D) and others  
220 (Supplementary Figure 4). Anti-pilus (RrgA/B) titers did not vary across pediatric ages;  
221 however, adults (18+ years) had significantly higher anti-RrgA/B titers compared to  
222 pediatric participants (<18 years) ( $p<0.001$ ) (Figure 2C). For PspA ( $p<0.01$ ), StkP  
223 ( $p<0.01$ ) and PhtD ( $p<0.01$ ), participants 6-12 months and 12-24 months had lower  
224 titers than <6-month-old participants. Among most protein antigens, the magnitude of

225 titers were comparable, with the exception of PspC var-IV titers that were an order of  
226 magnitude lower across all ages, compared to other PspC variants.

227 Hierarchical clustering of individual sera by the patterns of scaled antibody titers  
228 identified two clusters. The larger cluster (A) included substantial numbers of participants  
229 from all age groups, while cluster B was comprised largely of participants <5 years of  
230 age (86.8%) (Supplemental Figure 5). This cluster of pediatric participants had antibody  
231 titers below the population mean for a large proportion of protein antigens, compared to  
232 pediatric participants in cluster A, suggesting this population was either comparatively  
233 unexposed to pneumococcal protein antigens, or unresponsive to them.

234

235 *Analysis of individual protein sequence variation and association with antibody titers*

236

237 *PspC*

238

239 Among PspC variants, var-I was the most prevalent (84.1% of carriage isolates)  
240 followed by var-II (12%). Var-I corresponds to Groups 2, 3 and 6 of PspC proteins  
241 based on sequence identity and structural organization, and var-II corresponds to Group  
242 4 (Table 1) (12). The low prevalence of other PspC variants largely limited statistical  
243 comparison of anti-PspC titers to var-I and var-II. As age may mediate pneumococcal  
244 carriage, we first investigated carriage of the PspC var-I by age group and found that it  
245 did not differ significantly between pediatric and adult participants ( $X^2=0.03$ , p-  
246 value=0.87). Similarly, PspC variants II-IV did not significantly differ by age group. Anti-  
247 PspC titers did not differ significantly by pneumococcal carriage isolate variant for var-II  
248 (p=0.18), var-III (p=0.23), or var-IV (p=0.53) (Figure 3A); however, differences in anti-  
249 var-I titers among participants carrying PspC variants approached statistical significance  
250 [ $F(3)=2.41$ , p=0.07]. We collapsed non-var-I PspC variants into a single category and

251 compared titers between var-I and non-var-I. We found anti-var-I titers were significantly  
252 lower among individuals who went on to acquire strains possessing var-I [median log  
253 antibody titer 3.20 (var-I) vs. 3.31 (non-var-I) ( $p=0.019$ )] (Figure 3B). This correlation  
254 was found in all age groups but only significant for participants <1 year of age  
255 (Supplementary Figure 6). In a logistic regression model controlling for age, low var-I  
256 titers were significantly associated with subsequent carriage of a strain carrying the var-I  
257 variant (OR=0.36, 95% CI 0.14-0.81,  $p=0.02$ ). This suggests that low anti-var-I titers  
258 may be positively associated with acquisition of a strain possessing the PspC var-I.

259

260 *PspA*

261

262         Among pneumococci in this sample, we identified all three families of PspA  
263 variants described by Hollingshead and colleagues (13). Most isolates (70%) were  
264 family 1 PspA variant (Table 1). Additionally, 1% of strains ( $n=3$ ) were a PspA variant  
265 that formed an out-group to Families 1-3. Anti-PspA antibody titers were assessed  
266 among individuals carrying four PspA variants (Family 1-3 and Unknown). Among  
267 participants carrying pneumococcal strains with polymorphic PspA variants, anti-PspA  
268 titers for Family 1 and 2 did not significantly differ ( $p=0.53$  and  $0.62$ ) (Figure 3C).  
269 Additionally, carriage of PspA variants was not found to vary by age.

270

271 *Type 1 Pilus (RrgA-C)*

272

273         Using the presence of RrgB as a marker, we found 11% of carriage strains were  
274 piliated (Table 1). Among piliated strains ( $n=24$ ), RrgB var-II was most common,  
275 followed closely by the var-III. Piliated strains were most often serotype 35B (42.9%),  
276 7B (21.4%), or 19A (14.3%). Carriage of a piliated pneumococcus did not significantly

277 differ between pediatric and adult participants ( $X^2=0.49$ ,  $p=0.49$ ). Anti-RrgB antibody  
278 titers of var-II and var-I did not significantly differ by carriage variant ( $p=0.38$  and  $0.37$ )  
279 (Figure 3C). However, we found that anti-RrgB var-III titers were significantly higher  
280 ( $p<0.001$ ) among participants with subsequent carriage strains possessing var-III RrgB.  
281 This is contrary to what would be expected if higher variant specific titers were protective  
282 against colonization with respective strains. Anti-RrgA titers also did not significantly  
283 differ among carriage variants ( $p= 0.148$ ). Last, we assessed anti-RrgB titers among  
284 carriage variants, comparing participants carrying piliated and non-piliated strains. Anti-  
285 RrgB titers did not significantly differ among participants subsequently colonized with  
286 piliated or non-piliated strains (Supplemental Figure 7).

287

#### 288 *Other polymorphic protein antigens*

289

290 For the polymorphic protein antigens NanA, SP0609, SP2194, PhtD, StkP, and  
291 StrH, where antibody titers were measured for only one variant, we compared titers  
292 among participants carrying pneumococci with heterologous antigen variants  
293 (Supplementary Figure 8). Distribution of NanA variants I-III did not differ between  
294 pediatric and adult participants ( $p=0.32$ ). Anti-NanA titers varied among participants  
295 ( $p=0.08$ ), with var-I titers marginally lower among participants carrying pneumococci with  
296 var-I. Interestingly, var-I was the least common, present in only 3.0% of carriage  
297 isolates. No statistically significant differences in anti-protein antibody titers were  
298 observed among the remaining polymorphic proteins. Additionally, with the exception of  
299 SP0609, for which the var-I was more prevalent among pediatric participants ( $p=0.001$ ),  
300 protein antigen variant frequencies did not differ by age group.

301

#### 302 **Discussion**

303 Protein-based vaccines aim to further reduce the morbidity of pneumococcal  
304 disease; however, a clearer understanding of the dynamics of protein antigen immunity  
305 and pneumococcal carriage is required. As with previous studies, we found that adult  
306 sera possessed antibodies to multiple antigens and to multiple variants of variable  
307 antigens, and antibody titers usually increased across participant age groups, with adults  
308 having higher overall mean anti-protein titers (7,14). For PspA, StkP, and PhtD, a  
309 significant reduction in protein antibodies was observed between infants <6-months-old  
310 and children 6-24 months, likely resulting from the loss of maternally acquired antibodies  
311 and slower acquisition in infancy and toddlerhood than for other antigens. While  
312 increasing natural immunity with age has been shown in previous studies of  
313 pneumococcal protein antigens (5,7,24), this is the first study to assess variant-specific  
314 antibodies and their effect on protection against homologous pneumococcal  
315 colonization. We found increased carriage of pneumococci expressing var-I PspC  
316 among participants with lower anti-PspC var-I titers. However, among all other protein  
317 antigens, including PspA, we found no difference in anti-protein antibody titers by  
318 subsequent colonization status with those variants. Because our study was designed to  
319 focus on variant-specific protection by serum antibody against colonization with a  
320 particular antigenic variant, we did not assess antibody levels in individuals who were  
321 subsequently not colonized with pneumococcus, so we were unable to assess the  
322 absolute level of protection against colonization associated with particular levels of  
323 serum antibodies. Our results suggest that whatever protection these antibodies offer, it  
324 is modestly variant-specific for PspC and not measurably variant-specific for other  
325 antigens.

326 PspC and PspA are structurally similar surface proteins (25) known for their  
327 interaction with the host immune system (26,27), involvement in host epithelial  
328 adherence (28), and high recombination rates (17,29). Host immune evasion is often

329 invoked to explain the apparent increased recombination rates, sequence diversity and  
330 evidence of diversifying selection in *pspA* and *pspC*; however, there is no direct  
331 experimental evidence for this (30,31). Studies so far have implicated anti-PspC in  
332 protection against colonization, while anti-PspA seems important for protection against  
333 invasive disease (14). The growing interest in both PspC and PspA as vaccine  
334 candidates underscores the need for better understanding and characterization of the  
335 nature of anti-PspA and anti-PspC immunity.

336         In this study, we investigated four variants of PspC, each representing one of the  
337 11 recognized PspC groups (12). Our data suggest there may exist specificity against  
338 colonization based on exposure history, where colonization with a rare PspC variant  
339 leaves individuals susceptible to colonization with the most prevalent circulating strain.  
340 This observation is consistent with the concept of balancing selection in which the  
341 selective pressure of host immunity is sufficient to impact the frequency of specific PspC  
342 variants in the overall pneumococcal population. In general, this hypothesis is supported  
343 by the observation of high rates of recombination in the PspC locus, which may provide  
344 a way for pneumococci to obtain a PspC variant with low population level host immunity.  
345 However, these underlying population dynamics require further exploration.

346         In prior studies, anti-PspA titers in children reflected the PspA family to which  
347 they had been exposed (14), while adults often possessed high titers to both major  
348 families. Among participants of this study, family 2 PspA variants were found in only  
349 27% of carriage isolates and mean anti-PspA family 2 variant titers were consistently  
350 lower among each age group. However, we found that anti-PspA titers were not  
351 predictive of the subsequently carried strain. In the context of previous studies  
352 demonstrating the protective role of anti-PspA antibodies, it appears that the cross-  
353 reactivity of antibodies may provide a broad level of protection from all PspA families.

354           The pneumococcal pilus, comprised of proteins RrgA, RrgB and RrgC, facilitates  
355 binding to lung epithelial cells and colonization (32) and has been explored as a potential  
356 vaccine candidate (33). The pilus operon has been shown to recombine and be acted  
357 on by positive selection (34) Immunization with pilus subunits has been shown to  
358 provide protection against systemic challenge with pilated pneumococcal strains (35).  
359 Previously estimated to be present in ~30% of pneumococci (36), pilus was present in  
360 only 11% of our studied strains. We found that while anti-pilus antibody titers were  
361 significantly higher among adults compared with children, there was no difference in the  
362 proportion of carried strains that were pilated between these age groups. Furthermore,  
363 anti-pilus titers were not predictive of either carriage of pilated strains or RrgB variant  
364 among carried pilated strains. This was unexpected considering the high anti-RrgB  
365 titers in adults and the elevated RrgB var-III titers compared to variants I and II, which  
366 were less prevalent among pilated strains (Figure 2C). The low prevalence of pilated  
367 strains in the pneumococcal isolates from this study or variations in pilus expression (37)  
368 may have reduced our ability to detect differential pneumococcal carriage according to  
369 antibody titers.

370           While for the majority of protein antigen variants we failed to find any variant-  
371 specific protective effect against carriage, it should be noted that immunity generated by  
372 naturally acquired antibodies is likely more complex than a simple variant-specific  
373 protective effect. Several prior studies have suggested some degree of cross-reactivity  
374 between antibodies to one variant of a protein and pneumococci carrying another. This  
375 could be consistent with subtle selective pressures imposed by modestly greater  
376 protection against homologous than heterologous variants, which may be hard to  
377 measure in a host population. Furthermore immune responses against different proteins  
378 may have cumulative effects, such that the variant-specificity of antibodies to a particular  
379 protein would be obscured when considering the ability of these antibodies to protect

380 against a strain to which the individual may have many other effective antiprotein  
381 antibody responses. Indeed, challenge studies of protein-based vaccines in animal  
382 models have clearly shown that combination vaccines including 2-3 pneumococcal  
383 proteins are more efficacious for protection against invasive challenge (1,2). This likely  
384 reflects the *in vivo* interaction of host immunity with multiple pneumococcal antigens;  
385 however, this interaction is difficult to investigate. We observed a correlation of anti-  
386 protein titers among several antigen variants, suggesting that individuals likely possess a  
387 repertoire of antibodies to a specific set of protein antigen variants.

388         Certain limitations should be considered when interpreting our results. We  
389 selected genetic variants of protein antigens based on extant literature and phylogenetic  
390 analysis, identifying one strain from each monophyletic clade to represent a putatively  
391 antigenically distinct variant. However, each of these protein variants possesses several  
392 distinct epitopes, each likely generating a different antibody response. It is conceivable  
393 that antibodies against one protein antigen are in fact a mixture of antibodies of varying  
394 specificity, complicating the characterization of the overall response against one antigen.  
395 This is certainly a confounding factor in our analysis and future studies should assess  
396 pneumococcal anti-protein antibody repertoires and functionally characterize distinct  
397 protein antigen variants (e.g. PspC) to determine the nature of the antibody response  
398 they elicit and further our understanding of protection while informing vaccine  
399 development. Secondly, the exposure histories of participants are unknown, and  
400 participants were seemingly less likely to be exposed to rare protein variants in the  
401 pneumococcal population. Overall, using a large sample pneumococcal strains and sera  
402 from those who carried these strains we found only modest evidence for variant-  
403 specificity of protection against pneumococcal carriage.

404

405

406 **Conflict of Interest**

407 The authors disclose no conflicts of interest.

408 **Funding Sources**

409 This study was supported by R01 R01AI048935, the Grand Challenges in Global Health initiative  
410 through the Bill & Melinda Gates Foundation, the Native American Research Centers for Health  
411 (U26IHS300013/03), the Centers for Disease Control and Prevention National Vaccine Program  
412 Office, and the Thrasher Research Fund (02820-9).

413

414

415 Correspondence and requests for reprints should be addressed to Taj Azarian

416 tazarian@hsph.harvard.edu

417 **References**

- 418 1. Darrieux M, Goulart C, Briles D, Leite LC de C. Current status and perspectives  
419 on protein-based pneumococcal vaccines. *Crit Rev Microbiol. Informa Healthcare*;  
420 **2015**; 41(2):190–200.
- 421 2. Cao J, Chen D, Xu W, et al. Enhanced protection against pneumococcal infection  
422 elicited by immunization with the combination of PspA, PspC, and ClpP. *Vaccine*.  
423 Elsevier; **2007**; 25(27):4996–5005.
- 424 3. Lebon A, Verkaik NJ, Labout JAM, et al. Natural antibodies against several  
425 pneumococcal virulence proteins in children during the pre-pneumococcal-vaccine  
426 era: the generation R study. *Infect Immun*. **2011**; 79(4):1680–7.
- 427 4. McCool TL, Cate TR, Tuomanen EI, Adrian P, Mitchell TJ, Weiser JN. Serum  
428 Immunoglobulin G Response to Candidate Vaccine Antigens during Experimental  
429 Human Pneumococcal Colonization. *Infect Immun*. **2003**; 71(10):5724–5732.
- 430 5. Rapola S, Jääntti V, Haikala R, et al. Natural development of antibodies to  
431 pneumococcal surface protein A, pneumococcal surface adhesin A, and  
432 pneumolysin in relation to pneumococcal carriage and acute otitis media. *J Infect*  
433 *Dis*. **2000**; 182(4):1146–52.
- 434 6. Holmlund E, Quiambao B, Ollgren J, et al. Antibodies to pneumococcal proteins  
435 PhtD, CbpA, and LytC in Filipino pregnant women and their infants in relation to  
436 pneumococcal carriage. *Clin Vaccine Immunol. Am Soc Microbiol*; **2009**;  
437 16(6):916–923.
- 438 7. Turner P, Turner C, Green N, et al. Serum antibody responses to pneumococcal  
439 colonization in the first 2 years of life: results from an SE Asian longitudinal cohort  
440 study. *Clin Microbiol Infect*. **2013**; 19(12):E551–8.
- 441 8. Simell B, Melin M, Lahdenkari M, et al. Antibodies to pneumococcal surface  
442 protein A families 1 and 2 in serum and saliva of children and the risk of

- 443 pneumococcal acute otitis media. J Infect Dis. **2007**; 196(10):1528–36.
- 444 9. Virolainen A, Russell W, Crain MJ, Rapola S, Käyhty H, Briles DE. Human  
445 antibodies to pneumococcal surface protein A in health and disease. Pediatr  
446 Infect Dis J. LWW; **2000**; 19(2):134.
- 447 10. Weinberger DM, Dagan R, Givon-Lavi N, Regev-Yochay G, Malley R, Lipsitch M.  
448 Epidemiologic evidence for serotype-specific acquired immunity to pneumococcal  
449 carriage. J Infect Dis. **2008**; 197(11):1511–8.
- 450 11. Trzcinski K, Thompson C, Malley R, Lipsitch M. Antibodies to Conserved  
451 Pneumococcal Antigens Correlate with, but Are Not Required for, Protection  
452 against Pneumococcal Colonization Induced by Prior Exposure in a Mouse Model.  
453 Infect Immun. American Society for Microbiology; **2005**; 73(10):7043–7046.
- 454 12. Iannelli F, Oggioni MR, Pozzi G. Allelic variation in the highly polymorphic locus  
455 *pspC* of *Streptococcus pneumoniae*. Gene. **2002**; 284(1-2):63–71.
- 456 13. Hollingshead SK, Becker R, Briles DE. Diversity of PspA: Mosaic Genes and  
457 Evidence for Past Recombination in *Streptococcus pneumoniae*. Infect Immun.  
458 **2000**; 68(10):5889–5900.
- 459 14. Melin MM, Hollingshead SK, Briles DE, Lahdenkari MI, Kilpi TM, Käyhty HM.  
460 Development of antibodies to PspA families 1 and 2 in children after exposure to  
461 *Streptococcus pneumoniae*. Clin Vaccine Immunol. **2008**; 15(10):1529–35.
- 462 15. Scott JR, Millar E V, Lipsitch M, et al. Impact of more than a decade of  
463 pneumococcal conjugate vaccine use on carriage and invasive potential in Native  
464 American communities. J Infect Dis. **2012**; 205(2):280–8.
- 465 16. Millar E V, O'Brien KL, Zell ER, Bronsdon MA, Reid R, Santosham M.  
466 Nasopharyngeal carriage of *Streptococcus pneumoniae* in Navajo and White  
467 Mountain Apache children before the introduction of pneumococcal conjugate  
468 vaccine. Pediatr Infect Dis J. **2009**; 28(8):711–6.

- 469 17. Croucher NJ, Finkelstein JA, Pelton SI, et al. Population genomics of post-vaccine  
470 changes in pneumococcal epidemiology. *Nat Genet.* **2013**; 45(6):656–63.
- 471 18. Bentley SD, Aanensen DM, Mavroidi A, et al. Genetic analysis of the capsular  
472 biosynthetic locus from all 90 pneumococcal serotypes. *PLoS Genet. Public*  
473 *Library of Science*; **2006**; 2(3):e31.
- 474 19. Inouye M, Dashnow H, Raven L-A, et al. SRST2: Rapid genomic surveillance for  
475 public health and hospital microbiology labs. *Genome Med. BioMed Central*;  
476 **2014**; 6(11):90.
- 477 20. Zerbino DR, Birney E. Velvet: algorithms for de novo short read assembly using  
478 de Bruijn graphs. *Genome Res.* **2008**; 18(5):821–9.
- 479 21. Seemann T. Prokka: rapid prokaryotic genome annotation. *Bioinformatics.* **2014**;  
480 30(14):2068–9.
- 481 22. Page AJ, Cummins CA, Hunt M, et al. Roary: Rapid large-scale prokaryote pan  
482 genome analysis. *Bioinformatics.* **2015** [cited 2015 Jul 22]; 31(22):btv421.
- 483 23. Löytynoja A. Phylogeny-aware alignment with PRANK. *Methods Mol Biol.* **2014**;  
484 1079:155–70.
- 485 24. Simell B, Lahdenkari M, Reunanen A, Käyhty H, Väkeväinen M. Effects of ageing  
486 and gender on naturally acquired antibodies to pneumococcal capsular  
487 polysaccharides and virulence-associated proteins. *Clin Vaccine Immunol.* **2008**;  
488 15(9):1391–7.
- 489 25. Brooks-Walter A, Briles DE, Hollingshead SK. The *pspC* Gene of *Streptococcus*  
490 *pneumoniae* Encodes a Polymorphic Protein, PspC, Which Elicits Cross-Reactive  
491 Antibodies to PspA and Provides Immunity to Pneumococcal Bacteremia. *Infect*  
492 *Immun.* **1999**; 67(12):6533–6542.
- 493 26. Mukerji R, Mirza S, Roche AM, et al. Pneumococcal surface protein A inhibits  
494 complement deposition on the pneumococcal surface by competing with the

- 495 binding of C-reactive protein to cell-surface phosphocholine. J Immunol. Am  
496 Assoc Immunol; **2012**; 189(11):5327–5335.
- 497 27. Ren B, McCrory MA, Pass C, et al. The Virulence Function of *Streptococcus*  
498 *pneumoniae* Surface Protein A Involves Inhibition of Complement Activation and  
499 Impairment of Complement Receptor-Mediated Protection. J Immunol. **2004**;  
500 173(12):7506–7512.
- 501 28. Vadesilho CFM, Ferreira DM, Gordon SB, et al. Mapping of epitopes recognized  
502 by antibodies induced by immunization of mice with PspA and PspC. Clin Vaccine  
503 Immunol. **2014**; 21(7):940–8.
- 504 29. Chewapreecha C, Harris SR, Croucher NJ, et al. Dense genomic sampling  
505 identifies highways of pneumococcal recombination. Nat Genet. Nature Publishing  
506 Group, a division of Macmillan Publishers Limited. All Rights Reserved.; **2014**;  
507 46(3):305–9.
- 508 30. Chaguza C, Cornick JE, Everett DB. Mechanisms and impact of genetic  
509 recombination in the evolution of *Streptococcus pneumoniae*. Comput Struct  
510 Biotechnol J. **2015**; 13:241–7.
- 511 31. Li Y, Gierahn T, Thompson CM, et al. Distinct effects on diversifying selection by  
512 two mechanisms of immunity against *Streptococcus pneumoniae*. PLoS Pathog.  
513 Public Library of Science; **2012**; 8(11):e1002989.
- 514 32. Barocchi MA, Ries J, Zogaj X, et al. A pneumococcal pilus influences virulence  
515 and host inflammatory responses. Proc Natl Acad Sci U S A. National Acad  
516 Sciences; **2006**; 103(8):2857–2862.
- 517 33. Spraggon G, Koesema E, Scarselli M, et al. Supramolecular organization of the  
518 repetitive backbone unit of the *Streptococcus pneumoniae* pilus. PLoS One.  
519 Public Library of Science; **2010**; 5(6):e10919.
- 520 34. Muzzi A, Moschioni M, Covacci A, Rappuoli R, Donati C. Pilus operon evolution in

- 521 *Streptococcus pneumoniae* is driven by positive selection and recombination.  
522 PLoS One. **2008**; 3(11):e3660.
- 523 35. Harfouche C, Filippini S, Gianfaldoni C, et al. RrgB321, a fusion protein of the  
524 three variants of the pneumococcal pilus backbone RrgB, is protective in vivo and  
525 elicits opsonic antibodies. Infect Immun. Am Soc Microbiol; **2012**; 80(1):451–460.
- 526 36. Paterson GK, Mitchell TJ. The role of *Streptococcus pneumoniae* sortase A in  
527 colonisation and pathogenesis. Microbes Infect. Elsevier; **2006**; 8(1):145–153.
- 528 37. Basset A, Turner KH, Boush E, Sayeed S, Dove SL, Malley R. Expression of the  
529 type 1 pneumococcal pilus is bistable and negatively regulated by the structural  
530 component RrgA. Infect Immun. Am Soc Microbiol; **2011**; 79(8):2974–2983.
- 531  
532

## Figures and Tables

**Table 1.** Pneumococcal serotypes by age group and ordered by prevalence.

Serotype	Age Group								Total	% of Total
	<1	1-4 y		5-17y		18y+				
19A	5	2.07%	7	2.89%	0	0.00%	10	4.13%	22	9.07%
22A	4	1.65%	10	4.13%	4	1.65%	3	1.24%	21	8.67%
35B	6	2.48%	6	2.48%	3	1.24%	6	2.48%	21	8.67%
23B	2	0.83%	8	3.31%	3	1.24%	4	1.65%	17	7.02%
15A	1	0.41%	7	2.89%	2	0.83%	3	1.24%	13	5.37%
34	0	0.00%	6	2.48%	1	0.41%	6	2.48%	13	5.36%
6B	1	0.41%	4	1.65%	2	0.83%	5	2.07%	12	4.95%
11D	2	0.83%	3	1.24%	4	1.65%	2	0.83%	11	4.54%
23A	1	0.41%	4	1.65%	1	0.41%	4	1.65%	10	4.13%
31	2	0.83%	3	1.24%	3	1.24%	0	0.00%	8	3.31%
16F	0	0.00%	2	0.83%	4	1.65%	2	0.83%	8	3.30%
17F	2	0.83%	0	0.00%	2	0.83%	4	1.65%	8	3.30%
37	2	0.83%	0	0.00%	1	0.41%	4	1.65%	7	2.89%
6A	0	0.00%	3	1.24%	3	1.24%	0	0.00%	6	2.48%
21	0	0.00%	3	1.24%	2	0.83%	1	0.41%	6	2.48%
35F	2	0.83%	2	0.83%	0	0.00%	2	0.83%	6	2.48%
7B	1	0.41%	1	0.41%	0	0.00%	4	1.65%	6	2.47%
10A	0	0.00%	3	1.24%	1	0.41%	1	0.41%	5	2.06%
15C	1	0.41%	1	0.41%	0	0.00%	3	1.24%	5	2.06%
3	0	0.00%	1	0.41%	2	0.83%	1	0.41%	4	1.65%
35A	0	0.00%	3	1.24%	0	0.00%	1	0.41%	4	1.65%
NT	2	0.83%	1	0.41%	0	0.00%	1	0.41%	4	1.65%
10B	0	0.00%	1	0.41%	2	0.83%	0	0.00%	3	1.24%
7C	0	0.00%	1	0.41%	1	0.41%	1	0.41%	3	1.24%
1	0	0.00%	1	0.41%	0	0.00%	2	0.83%	3	1.24%
19F	1	0.41%	0	0.00%	1	0.41%	0	0.00%	2	0.83%
22F	0	0.00%	1	0.41%	1	0.41%	0	0.00%	2	0.83%
38	0	0.00%	1	0.41%	1	0.41%	0	0.00%	2	0.83%
12A	0	0.00%	1	0.41%	0	0.00%	1	0.41%	2	0.82%
12B	0	0.00%	1	0.41%	0	0.00%	1	0.41%	2	0.82%
15B	0	0.00%	0	0.00%	1	0.41%	0	0.00%	1	0.41%
5	0	0.00%	0	0.00%	1	0.41%	0	0.00%	1	0.41%
7A	1	0.41%	0	0.00%	0	0.00%	0	0.00%	1	0.41%
8	0	0.00%	1	0.41%	0	0.00%	0	0.00%	1	0.41%
9A	0	0.00%	1	0.41%	0	0.00%	0	0.00%	1	0.41%
10F	0	0.00%	0	0.00%	0	0.00%	1	0.41%	1	0.41%
Total	36	14.9%	87	36.0%	46.0	19%	73	30.2%	242	100.00%

**Table 2.** Protein antigens and variant frequencies identified through genomic analysis of pneumococcal carriage isolates. The antigen name and function are listed with the number of variants tested. Variants with measured titers are specified with an asterisk.

			Polymorphic					
Antigen		Variant	Strain	Accesion/Gene	Count	Freq	P-Distance	
I.	PspC	Pneumococcal surface protein C	Var-I*	ND6053	ERR129207	203	83.9%	0.025 (0.025-0.025)
			Var-II*	CH2016	ERR129074	31	12.8%	0.007 (0.006-0.008)
			Var-III*	BR1086	ERR129054	3	1.2%	0.005 (0.001-0.009)
			Var-IV*	MD5090	ERR129180	1	0.4%	-
II.	PspA	Pneumococcal surface protein A	Family 1*	D39	SPD_0126	166	68.6%	0.200 (0.199-0.201)
			Family 2*	TIGR4	SP_0117	69	28.5%	
			Family 3	BG6380	AF071823	4	1.7%	
III.	RrgA	RrgA pilus subunit, adhesin	Var-I*	TIGR4	SP_0462	24	88.9%	0.032 (0.027-0.037)
			Var-II	670-6B	SP670_0540	3	11.1%	
IV.	RrgB	RrgB pilus subunit, backbone	Var-I*	670-6B	SP670_0541	4	13.8%	0.216 (0.199-0.233)
			Var-II*	TIGR4	SP_0463	11	37.9%	
			Var-III*	23F_Taiwan_15	EF560629: 5159-7123	14	48.3%	
V.	NanA	Neuraminidase	Var-I*	D39	SPD_1504	7	3.0%	0.042 (0.041-0.042)
			Var-II	INV200	SPNINV200_15140	75	32.2%	
			Var-III	ATCC 700669	SPN23F16920	151	64.8%	
VI.	SP0609	Amino acid ABC transporter	Var-I*	TIGR4	SPD_0530	161	66.8%	0.015 (0.015-0.015)
			Var-II	ATCC 700669	SPN23F05490	80	33.2%	
VII.	SP2194	ATP-dependent Clp protease	Var-I	Taiwan19F-14	SPT_2213	222	91.7%	0.010 (0.010-0.010)
			Var-II*	TIGR4	SP_2194	20	8.3%	
VIII.	PhtD	Pneumococcal histidine triad D	Var-I	ATCC 700669	SPN23F09290	168	70.9%	0.062 (0.060-0.064)
			Var-II*	D39	SPD_0889	69	29.1%	
IX.	StkP	Serine threonine kinase protein	Var-I	D39	SPD_1542	181	74.8%	0.007 (0.007-0.007)

			Var-II*	TIGR4	SP_1732	61	25.2%	
X.	StrH	Beta-N-acetylhexosaminidase	Var-I*	D39	SPD_0063	101	42.1%	0.007 (0.007-0.007)
			Var-II	TIGR4	SP_0057	139	57.9%	
XI.	Ply	Pneumolysin	Var-I*	D39	SPD_1726	29	12.0%	0.003 (0.003-0.003)
			Var-II*	TIGR4	SP_1923	213	88.0%	
<b>Conserved</b>								
<b>Antigen</b>			<b>Variant</b>	<b>Strain</b>	<b>Accession/Gene</b>	-	-	
XII.	LysM	LysM domain-containing protein	Var-I*	TIGR4	SP_0107	-	-	0.004 (0.003-0.004)
XIII.	LytB	Endo-beta-N-acetylglucosaminidase	Var-I*	D39	SPD_0853	-	-	0.008 (0.008-0.008)
XIV.	LytC	Lysozyme (C-ter)	Var-I*	D39	SPD_1403	-	-	0.005 (0.005-0.005)
XV.	PcpA	Choline binding protein	Var-I*	D39	SPD_1965	-	-	0.003 (0.003-0.003)
XVI.	PcsB	Secreted 45 kDa protein	Var-I*	TIGR4	SP_2216	-	-	0.006 (0.006-0.007)
XVII.	PhtE	Truncated histidine triad protein	Var-I*	D39	SPD_0890	-	-	0.008 (0.008-0.008)
XVIII.	PiaA	Part of iron uptake ABC transporter	Var-I*	D39	SPD_0915	-	-	0.002 (0.002-0.002)
XIX.	PiuA	Part of iron uptake ABC transporter	Var-I*	D39	SPD_1652	-	-	0.005 (0.005-0.005)
XX.	PsaA	Pneumococcal surface adhesin A	Var-I*	TIGR4	SP_1650	-	-	0.003 (0.002-0.003)
XXI.	SP2027	Conserved hypothetical protein	Var-I*	TIGR4	SP_2027	-	-	0.005 (0.005-0.006)

**Figure 1.** Pearson correlations of log<sub>10</sub> antibody titers for 28 protein antigens clustered heuristically by correlation value. Correlations between normalized antibody titers of protein antigens were clustered using heuristic methods. Protein antigens including multiple variants of the same antigen are labeled on the x- and y- axes, and the heatmap displays the correlation values between antigens. The dendrogram on the left represents the results of the heuristic clustering of correlated antibody titers. Significant correlation between variants of the same antigen was observed as well as high correlation among several antigens, which likely exist on the same genomic background.

**Figure 2.** Protein antibodies titers by age for variants of PspC, PspA, pilus, and ply. Antibody levels were measured using direct binding electrochemiluminescence-based multiplex assay are expressed as a titer relative to the amount in a reference serum. Structural variants of polymorphic proteins were measured individually and were compared among participant age groups. A.) Variant-specific anti-PspC antibodies to Var-I (ND6053), Var-II (CH2016), Var-III (BR1086), and Var-IV (MD5090). B.) Variant-specific anti-PspA antibodies to Family 1 and Family 2. C.) Anti-pilus antibodies to RrgA-I (TIGR4) and RrgB pilus variants RrgB-I (670-6B), RrgB-II (Taiwan 23F), and RrgB-III (TIGR4). D.) Variant-specific anti-pneumolysin (ply) antibodies to variants I and II.

**Figure 3.** Protein antibody titers among participants carrying pneumococcal strains with specific polymorphic protein-antigen variants. Serum was collected from participants at enrollment, and nasopharyngeal swabs for pneumococcal carriage detection were collected at least 30 days after serum collection. The protein antigen variant in each pneumococcal isolate was determined using genomic data. Antibody levels were

measured using direct binding electrochemiluminescence-based multiplex assay are expressed as a titer relative to the amount in a reference serum. Structural variants of polymorphic proteins were measured individually. The y-axis represents the variant-specific antibody titers, and the carriage isolate protein antigen variant is specified on the x-axis with labels colored to match the corresponding titers. If susceptibility to a strain possessing a specific variant were observed, the respective antibody titer would be the lowest among all other titers. A) Anti-PspC titers vs. carriage isolate PspC variants I-IV and non-typable. B) Anti-PspC titers vs. carriage isolate PspC var-I and combined var-II-IV. C) Anti-PspA Family 1 and Family 2 titers vs. carriage isolate PspA variants Families 1, 2, 3, and unknown. D) Anti-pilus titers vs. carriage isolate RrgB variants I-III and not present.